

COUNCIL DOCUMENT # ST. A.
Assigned by Council Resolutions
Committee KO / mya
Member Initial

RESOLUTION ON THE BOY SCOUTS OF AMERICA (revised)

WHEREAS the American Library Association (ALA) has had a long relationship with the Boy Scouts of America (BSA); and

WHEREAS the BSA continues to exclude persons from membership and leadership on the basis of religious beliefs and/or sexual orientation; and

WHEREAS ALA policies 54.17 and 60.2 declare the Association's support for gay rights and "actively commits [ALA's] prestige and resources" to opposing discrimination in several areas including sexual orientation and creed; and

WHEREAS ALA policy 1.1 "recognizes [ALA's] broad social responsibilities...in ameliorating or solving the critical problems of society," among which are homophobia and religious intolerance; and

WHEREAS ALA reaffirms the responsibility that librarians have to provide library services equitably to all children and young adults regardless of their affiliations; therefore be it

RESOLVED that ALA Council urges the Boy Scouts of America to reconsider their policy of discrimination in the areas of sexual orientation and religious belief and demonstrate a commitment to human rights, inclusiveness and mutual respect.

Submitted by Mark C. Rosenzweig, Councilor-at-large

Mark C. Rosenzweig
Marriott Hotel

Seconded by Ruth Gordon, Councilor-at-large

and Elaine Harger, Councilor-at-large

Holiday Inn Express

[Signature]

REVIEWED FOR CONFORMANCE WITH
GUIDELINES
by Council Resolutions Committee
01/08

Council then

VOTED, To adopt CD#33.1, Election Publishing Resolution, as amended.

Councilor Judy Arteaga and seconder moved and by **CONSENT**, Council agreed to hear the Freedom to Read Foundation report as the next agenda item.

FREEDOM TO READ REPORT, CD#22.1. Foundation President June Pinnell-Stephens provided an update on cases that FTRF was involved in or monitoring: *Mainstream Loudoun v. Board of Trustees of Loudoun County Library*; *Kathleen R. v. City of Livermore*; *ACLU v. Johnson*; *In Re Grand Jury Subpoena to Kramerbooks and Afterwords*; *Rice v. Paladin Enterprises*; and *Video Software Dealers Association v. City of Oklahoma City*.

Pinnell-Stephens reported that 1999 will mark the thirtieth anniversary of the Freedom to Read Foundation. She said that the FTRF Board of Trustees, in cooperation with President-Elect Ann Symons, was planning a gala celebration for Saturday evening, January 30, 1999, in Philadelphia during the Midwinter Meeting.

As her term as president drew to a close, Pinnell-Stephens emphasized her pleasure in reporting to Council on FTRF activities over the past three years. She said the Foundation looked forward to meeting the many challenges of the upcoming year, working to create new First Amendment precedents, and continuing to uphold intellectual freedom in libraries.

Pinnell-Stephens reported that Candace Morgan, former IFC chair, was the incoming president of the Foundation.

Councilor Linda Mielke and seconder moved that CD#53, Conference Committee report, be heard next. The Council

VOTED, To defeat the motion to hear the Conference Committee report as the next agenda item.

Council continued with the agenda previously agreed upon.

ALA RELATIONS WITH EXTERNAL ORGANIZATIONS, CD#52, EXHIBIT 17 AND RESOLUTION ON THE BOY SCOUTS OF AMERICA, CD# 51, EXHIBIT 27. Nancy Kranich, ALA Executive Board member, said that in response to member concern regarding ALA relations with external organizations and particularly with the Boy Scouts of America (BSA), the Executive Board had reviewed Policy 9, Relationships to Other Organizations, to determine to what extent section 9.5, Relationships with Organization Violating Human Rights, should be applied. Kranich said that the current Policy 9 covers both formal and informal relationships but uses different terms in referring to them. She noted that the Executive Board had recommended that the policy be revised to clearly define "formal" and "informal" relationships and that these two terms be used consistently within Policy 9. Kranich pointed out that CD#52 provided suggested language to define these relationships.

Councilor Ruth Gordon and seconder moved to postpone action on CD#52, ALA Relations with External Organizations, until the 1999 Midwinter Meeting in Philadelphia, PA.

In speaking to the motion, Councilor Gordon said that the reason for her motion was that the document was complex and Council had had little time to study it.

Councilor Eliza Dresang, spoke against the postponement by saying that outcome of action taken on CD#52 would have direct impact on subsequent action items.

Councilor Rita Auerbach said she felt that the recommendations in CD#52 would have enormous ramifications for ALA; that considerable discussion was needed; and that any pending action items related to the issues of what constituted "formal" and "informal" relationships should be postponed.

Councilor Mary Jane Anderson then moved to amend the motion to postpone action on CD#52 to include the phrase "and CD#51, Resolution on the Boy Scouts of America." The motion to postpone would then read: "To postpone action on CD#52, ALA Relations with External Organizations and CD#51, Resolution on the Boy Scouts of America, until the 1999 Midwinter Meeting in Philadelphia."

The amendment was ruled out of order.

Councilor Michael Golrick, dressed in his Boy Scout uniform, said he had come prepared to discuss CD#51, which called for ALA to "suspend formal and informal relations" until such time as the BSA ends its exclusionary politics based on persons' religious beliefs or sexual orientation. Therefore, he said, he opposed the amendment to postpone discussion on CD#51.

Councilor Robert Holley sought clarification on how the recommendations in CD#52 would affect appointments of IFLA representatives. He also wondered whether the International Relations Committee had examined this issue.

Councilor and Executive Board Member Sally Gardner Reed (member of the subcommittee that worked on CD#52) said she would be happy to support a motion to postpone. She felt this could be a substantive discussion for the Council list.

Council then

VOTED, To postpone action on CD#52, ALA Relations with External Organizations, until the 1999 Midwinter Meeting in Philadelphia.

Councilor Mary Jane Anderson and seconder moved and Council

VOTED, To postpone action on CD#51, Resolution on the Boy Scouts of America, until the 1999 ALA Midwinter Meeting.

LIBRARY EDUCATION RESOLUTION, CD#54, Exhibit 18. Councilors Ruth Gordon and several seconders moved the adoption of the Library Education Resolution, CD#54, which read: "That the Committee on Accreditation and an advisory task force be charged with revising the *Standards of Accreditation* (last revised 1992, q.v. *ACCREDITATION AND THE AMERICAN LIBRARY ASSOCIATION* written by F. William Summers [April, 1992]), including mandating courses in the special fields [q.v. supra];

covers both formal and informal relationship but uses different terms in referring to them. The Executive Board had recommended that the policy be revised to clearly define "formal" and "informal" relationships and that the two terms be used consistently within Policy 9.

Council and Executive Board member Sally Gardner Reed moved that ALA adopt the revisions to Policy 9, Relationships to Other Organization, as recommended in CD# 52.

Councilor Sanford Berman moved and by **CONSENT**, Council amended Line 94 of the proposed changes to Policy 9 by: (1) replacing the word "handicaps" with the word "disabilities"; (2) deleting the word "or" following the word "disabilities"; (3) adding a comma following the words "national origin"; and (4) adding the words "or sexual orientation" after the words "national origin." Line 94 would then read "...color, sex, age, physical disabilities, national origins, or sexual orientation..."

After a brief debate, Council unanimously

VOTED, To adopt the revisions to Policy 9 (Relationships to Other Organizations) as amended.

RESOLUTION ON THE BOY SCOUTS OF AMERICA, CD#51. Action also was deferred on this document from the Annual Conference until the Midwinter Meeting. By **CONSENT**, the following resolved clause, which read: "That ALA suspend formal or official relations with the Boy Scouts of America until such time as the BSA ends its exclusionary policies based on persons' religious beliefs or sexual orientations" was removed from CD#51.

Councilor Mark C. Rosenzweig moved the adoption of the Resolution on the Boy Scouts of America, which read: "That ALA strongly urges the Boy Scouts of America to change its membership practices so that they demonstrate a commitment to human rights, inclusiveness and mutual respect."

"I strongly urge passing of the resolution as amended, and that we send a strong letter of censure to the Boy Scouts of America regarding their exclusionary practices," Council and Executive Board member Sally Gardner Reed said.

Councilor Mary Jane Anderson and others felt it highly inappropriate for ALA to tell another organization how to choose its membership.

Councilor Rita Auerbach recommended that the first "Whereas" clause, which read: "The American Library Association (ALA) has had a long official relationship with the Boy Scouts of America (BSA), currently in the form of a designated ALSC liaison," be removed from CD#51. "I think the ALSC relationship with the Boy Scouts has changed," she said.

President-Elect Sarah Long said it was impossible to amend the "Whereas" clauses, because they were not part of the motion on the floor.

Should the resolution pass, Councilor Bernard Margolis wondered who would send it to the Boy Scouts of America. Would a letter be sent by the president, the executive director, or someone else? Executive Director William Gordon said he did not know, but would find out and let Margolis know as soon as possible.

Councilor Maurice Freedman urged the chair to allow the body to eliminate the first "Whereas" clause. He said as it stood, the resolution was predicated on something that was incorrect and it made the entire resolution senseless.

Councilor Gordon Conable challenged the chair's ruling that discussion of the "Whereas" clause was out of order. He said he had never seen a separation of the motion from the background. Councilor Conable then moved and Council

DEFEATED, The chair's decision to not allow discussion of the "Whereas" clauses contained in CD#51, Resolution on the Boy Scouts of America, until action had been taken on the resolved clause.

Councilor Bernard Margolis moved and by **CONSENT**, Council convened into informal consideration of CD#51.

After a lengthy debate, Mark C. Rosenzweig moved and by **CONSENT**, CD#51, Resolution on the Boy Scouts of America, was withdrawn to be rewritten and placed on the Council III agenda for consideration.

OUTSOURCING TASK FORCE REPORT, CD#24-24.1, Exhibit 21. In view of the complexity of this issue, President-Elect Sarah Long proposed that Council convene into a 30-minute informal discussion of CD#24 before considering the specific action items contained in the report. By **CONSENT**, Council moved into informal discussion of CD#24 and CD#24.1.

Council and Executive Board member James Neal voiced his displeasure with the report by saying that the report and recommendations were "speculative, anecdotal, and somewhat defensive." In his opinion, the recommendations were "based on imprecise and problematic definitions of outsourcing, privatization, and core library services."

Council and Executive Board member Sally Gardner Reed requested that Outsourcing Task Force members be allowed to participate in this informal discussion. By **CONSENT**, Council granted its permission.

LIBRARY EDUCATION RESOLUTION, CD#54, Exhibit 32. Both the Committee on Accreditation, **CD#64, Exhibit #32** and the Committee on Education, **CD#65, Exhibit 32**, felt that the Congress will produce a great deal of comment and important advice for the Association as it considers the next steps in addressing the future of library school education.

Councilor Sheila Intner moved and by **CONSENT**, Council deferred action on CD#54, Library Education Resolution, which was referred to COA and COE until after the Congress on Professional Education Summit, April 30–May 1, 1999.

BUDGET ANALYSIS AND REVIEW COMMITTEE, CD#36, Exhibit 14. Elizabeth (Ma'lis) Wendt, chair, presented her committee's response to CD#36, Resolution on Implementing the Poor People's Policy, which Council referred to BARC at Council I.

Councilor Ma'lis Wendt, BARC chair, moved and by **CONSENT**, Council directed the Poor People's Policy Subcommittee of the OLOS Advisory Committee to include a proposal for a comprehensive implementation plan of the Poor People's Policy in the OLOS FY2000 budget request; and, that the subcommittee also work with OLOS in developing a survey of ALA units and divisions to determine what they have already done and/or plan to do to implement the Poor People's Policy.

As mover of the resolution, Councilor Sanford Berman noted that the motion had been endorsed by the OLOS Advisory Committee and the SRRT Task Force on Hunger, Homelessness, and Poverty. He also noted he had met with BARC and felt Council's directive seemed reasonable. He also commended BARC members for their speedy response, helpfulness, and friendliness.

RESOLUTION ON THE BOY SCOUTS OF AMERICA, REVISED, CD#51-A, Exhibit 33.

Councilor Mark Rosenzweig moved the adoption of Resolution on the Boy Scouts of America, which read "That American Library Association urges the Boy Scouts of America to reconsider their policy of discrimination in the areas of sexual orientation and religious belief and demonstrate a commitment to human rights, inclusiveness, and mutual respect."

In speaking to the motion, Mark Rosenzweig stated that the original resolution had been rewritten and the "Whereases" that were problematic had been recast.

Although the resolution had been rewritten in a much less "inflammatory style" than the first version, according to Councilor Michael Golrick, he said the resolution still inaccurately states that the Boy Scouts of America discriminates on the basis of religious beliefs. "The Boy Scouts do require that you believe in some Higher Being, and that is the only requirement in terms of religious beliefs," he said.

Lastly, according to the Resolutions Committee, resolutions are supposed to have some application to library services. "This resolution still does not specifically speak about how it applies to libraries and library services," he noted.

Councilor Michael Golrick moved and Council

VOTED, To defeat a motion to table indefinitely CD#51-A, Resolution on the Boy Scouts of America .

In speaking in favor of the motion, Council and Executive Board member Sally Gardner Reed said, "I'm deeply proud to be part of a profession that not only celebrates diversity but supports it every single day in everything that we do."

"I don't think libraries can flourish in a society that's discriminatory and intolerant of differences. Libraries are a cornerstone of democracy, and I think we have not only the ability but the responsibility to speak out wherever discrimination flourishes," Gardner said, and urged Council to pass this motion.

After hearing varying opinions about the resolution, Council

VOTED, To adopt CD#51-A, Resolution on the Boy Scouts of America, which read: "That the American Library Association urges the Boy Scouts of America to reconsider their policy of discrimination in the areas of sexual orientation and religious belief and demonstrate a commitment to human rights, inclusiveness, and mutual respect."

COMMITTEE ON LEGISLATION, CD#20-20.4, Exhibit 34. Nancy Kranich, chair, moved the following three items, all of which were **ADOPTED**:

CD#20.2, Resolution on S.22, The Government Secrecy Reform Act of 1999, which read: "That the American Library Association endorses the general statutory framework outlined in S. 22, the Government Secrecy Reform Act of 1999, and, that the American Library Association supports S. 22, the Government Secrecy Reform Act of 1999, in that it reflects ALA policy regarding the classification of U.S. government information by:

- instituting a systematic declassification system to ensure future public access, including on the Review Board independent professionals well acquainted with the security system;
- including formal public notice and comment regarding the categories and procedures of classification and declassification to be established by the President;
- establishing a balancing test that takes into account the importance of the public interest in release of the information;