

Campaign for America's Librarians

Advocating for Better Salaries and Pay Equity Toolkit

The Campaign for America's Librarians is a Library Advocacy Now! Training program developed by the ALA 2002–2003 President Maurice J. (Mitch) Freedman's Better Salaries and Pay Equity for Library Workers Task Force (www.mjfreedman.org), an initiative of Maurice J. (Mitch) Freedman, ALA President, 2002–2003. This training is made possible by the ALA/World Book Goal Award. It is co-sponsored by the Public Awareness Committee, Chapter Relations Committee, and Committee on Pay Equity.

ALA-Allied Professional Association
c/o American Library Association
50 E. Huron St.
Chicago, IL 60611
Tel: 1-800-545-2433
Fax: (312) 440-9374
www.ala-apa.org

Second Edition: January 2003



Campaign for America's Librarians
Advocating for Better Salaries and Pay
Equity Toolkit
January 2003

Permission is granted to libraries, other groups, and individuals to reproduce this toolkit for nonprofit use. Copies may be downloaded at www.ala-apa.org/toolkit.pdf/. Check online for possible later editions prior to use.

ALA-Allied Professional Association
c/o American Library Association
50 East Huron Street
Chicago, IL 60611
Telephone: 800-545-2433
Fax: 312-440-9374
E-mail: info@ala-apa.org

Contents

- 3 Introduction**
- 4 Advocating Equity**
- 5 Key ALA Contacts**
- 6 Getting Started**
- 7 Speaking Out**
 - 7 Key Message
 - 7 Talking Points
 - 8 Communication Strategy
 - 9 Tough Questions and Answers
 - 10 Quotable Quotes
- 11 Building the Case**
 - 11 Salary Statistics
 - 12 Fast Facts: Salary Data
 - 13 Updated Job Descriptions
 - 13 Position Classification
 - 14 Job Evaluation
 - 14 Comparisons with Other Occupations
 - 15 Competencies and Roles of Staff
 - 16 Support Staff
 - 17 Benefits
 - 17 Minimum Salaries
 - 17 Legislation
 - 18 Litigation
- 19 Success Stories**
 - 19 Minnesota
 - 19 Australia
 - 19 New York Public Library
 - 19 Canada
 - 20 Southern University
 - 20 Maryland
 - 20 Union Stories
 - 21 More Stories
- 22 Working within Larger Groups**
 - 22 Building Partnerships/Coalitions
 - 22 Unionizing As a Strategy
 - 24 State Action Planning
 - 25 Living Wage and Other Low Income Movements
- 27 Related Issues**
 - 27 Demonstrating Value
 - 27 Recruitment Shortages
 - 28 Economic Hard Times
 - 28 Employee Turnover
 - 29 Certification
 - 29 Faculty Status and Other Strategies for Academic Library Workers
 - 31 Management Initiated Change
 - 32 Negotiating Your Own Salary

33 Don't Just Sit There

34 Your Action Checklist

35 Bibliography

- 35 Pay Equity and Libraries
- 35 General Pay Equity

36 Appendices

- 36 A. ALA Policy #54.10 "Equal Opportunity and Salaries"
- 37 B. ALA Creates Separate Body for Professional Advocacy
- 38 C. The Campaign for America's Libraries
- 39 D. ALA Advocacy Resources
- 40 E. ALA President's Messages
 - 40 The Campaign for America's Librarians
 - 40 America's Librarians Deserve Better Pay
 - 41 Why Librarians?
 - 42 Send That Stereotype to the Smithsonian
 - 43 Now Is the Time for Better Salaries
- 44 F. Sample Newspaper Opinion Piece
- 45 G. Sources of Salary Data/Surveys/Statistics
- 48 H. Job Evaluation Resources
- 49 I. Resources for Competencies and Roles of Staff
- 50 J. Neutrality Agreement Sample
- 51 K. Resources for Negotiating Your Own Salary
- 52 L. Resources for Demonstrating Value
- 54 M. Resources for Unionizing
- 55 N. Resources for Faculty Status and Other Strategies for Library Workers

Introduction

We librarians have a well-deserved reputation for being outspoken when it comes to intellectual freedom and other issues that affect library users. We have not been nearly as vocal on our own behalf. Statistics show that our profession, along with others that are predominantly female, are underpaid relative to the education required and the complexity of the service we provide.

Our challenge is clear:

- We must overcome the stereotype of the librarian as the selfless, dedicated, and devoted worker, who is in the profession to *do good* and who will accept any pittance of pay.
- We must promote a better understanding of what the librarian does. No one will want to pay us more money if they have no idea what education, experience, judgment, and special skills it takes for us to do our jobs.
- We must contribute substantively to the fight for pay equity—it is our fight, too. Women have been discriminated against in a variety of ways, a primary one being compensation.

We believe this can and must change. In fact, change has already begun.

ALA has long supported efforts to achieve pay equity for library workers (see Appendix A). Recently ALA established a sister organization, the Allied Professional Association (ALA-APA) to advocate pay equity, offer postgraduate specialty service and undertake other activities related to our professional status (see Appendix B).

We welcome your thoughts and suggestions on this new effort and look forward to hearing your success stories.

Yours for Better Salaries & Pay Equity for All Library Workers,



Maurice J. (Mitch) Freedman
2002–2003 President, American Library Association
www.mjfreedman.org
freedman@wlsmail.org



Patricia Glass Schuman
Chair, ALA Public Awareness Committee
Coordinator, Better Salaries and Pay Equity for Library Workers Task Force

Members of the Better Salaries and Pay Equity Task Force include: Mary Rinato Berman, Therese Bigelow, Cathy Bremer, Carol A. Brey, Leslie B. Burger, Whitney E. Davison-Turley, Charling C. Fagan, Yvonne Snyder Farley, Diane Fay, Jenna Freedman, Joan B. Goddard, Michael Gorman, Carla D. Hayden, Norman Jacknis, E. J. Josey, Gene Kinnaly, Michele M. Leber, Donna Mandel, Raymond H. Markey, Kathleen de la Peña McCook, Rosemary Mesh, Margaret Myers, Derrie Perez, Anita R. Schiller, Harriet S. Selverstone, Patricia H. Smith, Jill S. Uncyk, and Thomas L. Wilding.

Advocating Equity

As library workers in a predominantly female profession, our compensation isn't always comparable to others with similar qualifications, experience and responsibility who work in fields that are predominantly male.

The American Library Association (ALA)-Allied Professional Association (ALA-APA) is committed to advocating for better pay for all library workers. ALA-APA's nationwide campaign can set the tone, provide tools and open doors for you, but ultimately, pay equity must be addressed at the institution or community level. Most successful library salary improvement efforts begin and end with library workers. These efforts should include support staff, as well as librarians. Members of support staff often constitute two-thirds of a library staff and are predominantly women.

Approaches to remedy pay inequities typically focus on women gaining access to higher paid jobs through affirmative action and securing equal pay for equal work. Comparable worth is a third approach, often known as pay equity or equal pay for work of equal value. There is no one overall strategy. You may need to try several, including administrative changes, legislation, litigation and/or negotiation. For any of these strategies to work, there must be:

- Consensus on the importance of equitable pay for library workers and the goal, whether obtaining an overall salary increase for library workers or increases for particular classifications.
- Understanding of the particular library's environment and the conditions that may help or hinder efforts to achieve higher salaries.
- Vigilance and constant monitoring to maintain gains achieved.

Studies have shown that one of the things people value most about libraries is the personalized service

they receive. The growing shortage of librarians provides both an incentive and urgency for efforts to improve compensation. If libraries are to provide the high quality service their users expect, they must pay salaries that are competitive with both other libraries and other sectors.

Remember, success depends not just on the rightness of our cause but how effectively you communicate it. Helping library workers to speak with one voice, providing them with clear messages and preparing them to deliver these messages are essential. This toolkit provides sample messages and other guidance in organizing a pay equity campaign.

To learn more about being an effective advocate, see the ALA's *Library Advocate's Handbook* (www.ala.org/pio/advocacy/), attend a Library Advocacy Now! Training program in conjunction with an ALA conference or ask your state library organization to host a training session.

The Campaign for America's Librarians builds on ALA's @ your library™, the Campaign for America's Libraries (see Appendix C). See Appendix D for ALA's advocacy resources.

See Appendix E for ALA President Maurice J. Freedman's messages in *American Libraries* regarding his initiative for better salaries and pay equity.

Librarians are at the heart of opposition to foolish, dangerous, misguided attempts at censoring human expression in our free country. I thank God for their efforts.

—Author Clyde Edgerton

Key ALA Contacts

Presidential Task Force on Better Salaries and Pay Equity for Library Workers

www.mjfreedman.org/tfhome.html

American Library Association-Allied Professional Association (ALA-APA)

info@ala-apa.org

Tel: 800-545-2433, ext. 2518

Fax: 312-944-6131

www.ala-apa.org

Public Information Office (PIO)

pio@ala.org

Tel: 800-545-2433, ext. 5041

Fax: 312-944-8520

www.ala.org/advocacy/

Office for Human Resource Development and Recruitment (HRDR)

hrdr@ala.org

Tel: 800-545-2433, ext. 4277

Fax: 312-280-3256

www.ala.org/hrdr/

According to the 2000 U.S. Census, men with master's degrees earn \$18,003 more than women with master's degrees—a median of \$65,052 per year versus \$47,049. Men with bachelor's degrees earned a median of \$53,505.

Getting Started

In developing a campaign, you can and should recruit support both from within your institution and the larger community. To do this effectively, you will need to arm yourself with compensation data and other documents to educate the public and decision-makers about library workers' roles, skills, responsibilities and worth. You will also want to make sure that internal equity exists within the library and that no gender bias in pay occurs when men and women are performing the same job.

Steps to building a successful campaign:

1. Educate yourself about pay equity issues.
2. Conduct research to verify and document library pay inequities.
3. Organize a group within the library.
4. Select a strategy and develop a plan.
5. Build consensus within your organization.
6. Train and support library workers in advocating better pay.
7. Gather further data.
8. Seek allies from outside.
9. Join coalitions concerned with pay equity.
10. Present your case to officials, the media and public.

Librarians have always been among the most thoughtful and helpful people. They are teachers without a classroom. No libraries, no progress.

—Broadcaster Willard Scott

Speaking Out

To present your case effectively, you will need three things:

- A key message and talking points
- A communication plan for delivering the message
- Effective spokespeople

The key message should be to the point and in language that is easily understandable to those outside the library. All library workers should know the key message and understand the reasoning behind it.

The communication plan provides a roadmap for your efforts—one that will both guide you and help you learn as you go along. Key elements are:

1. **Goals and objectives** stating what you want to accomplish
2. **Key message** and 3 key talking points
3. **Target audiences** who need to hear your message, both internal (library board, Friends, administrators, staff) and external (public officials, members of the media, the public)
4. **Strategies** for delivering the message:
 - Publications, e.g. brochures, fact sheets, proposals
 - Media outreach, e.g. news releases, letters to the editor
 - Presentations to board, staff, key officials
 - Other speaking engagements
 - Partnerships, participation in other groups
5. A **timetable** with tasks and assignments.
6. **Evaluation** process for monitoring results, e.g. media coverage, expressions of support, etc.

All library staff affected should know the key message and understand the plan. You also will need designated spokespeople who are both willing and skilled in speaking to media, public officials and other groups. Providing training for key spokespeople in how to deal with the media and answer tough questions is a worthwhile investment.

In dealing with a sensitive topics such as salaries, you will want to anticipate and prepare answers to both basic questions and any tough questions you may dread. Preparing answers in advance will help to assure that your spokespeople stay “on message” and give appropriate answers. It will also help them feel more prepared and confident.

Key Message

This is the message at the core of your campaign. Using it consistently in speeches, brochures and other

communications will help to ensure your campaign has impact. This message should address the larger public good as well as the self-interest of library workers. Remember that messages are more effective when you emphasize how it will benefit the audience. When giving a presentation or speaking to media, you will want to focus on the key message and reinforce it with talking points that address the specific audience.

For example:

Librarians must be paid 21st century salaries if Americans are to enjoy 21st century library and information services.

Talking Points

The following are examples of talking points you may use to build your case. Be sure to use local examples and comparisons whenever possible.

- Libraries shouldn't have to choose between paying their staffs fair salaries and buying books, adding hours or updating their technology.
- Starting salaries for systems analysts and database administrators are almost twice those for librarians, who also have a master's degree—\$61,000 a year compared to \$34,000.
- Nearly 60 percent of librarians will reach retirement age within the next 20 years. At this rate, who will take their place?
- Everyone loves libraries, but library workers can't live on love alone. Just ask our landlords, doctors, and families.
- Inability to pay is no excuse for salary discrimination. Achieving equity generally costs less than 4 percent of the payroll budget.
- Computer/information scientists, who are mostly men, earn almost twice as much as librarians who have comparable education and responsibility.
- According to the U.S. Census Bureau, men with advanced degrees are paid more than twice as much as women—\$87,000 per year versus \$51,000 in 1998.
- Libraries are the mind and soul of their communities, and librarians are the mind and soul of the library.
- Libraries work because library workers make them work.
- You can't have good education without good libraries, and you can't have good libraries without good staff.
- Today's librarian is a technology-savvy, information expert who can enrich the learning process of any library user—from early reader to graduate student

to young Web surfer to retiring senior citizen.

- Librarians are the ultimate search engine. They are trained experts in helping others find the information they need—in books, in archives, and on the Web.
- Students from schools with school library media specialists score higher on achievement tests.
- In schools and universities, librarians teach information literacy skills that students will need to succeed throughout their lives.
- In a world that's information rich, librarians bring valuable expertise. They connect us with our past, enrich our present and prepare us for the future.
- Library workers put the high touch in high tech.

Communication Strategy

Strategic use of the news media and other tactics are key to building public understanding and support for better salaries.

Start close to home. Make a special effort to inform library trustees and Friends so that they understand the issues involved and can be your allies. Whenever possible, in speeches, news releases and interviews, give credit to librarians for their expertise and role in developing new programs and services.

Placing feature stories in local media, featuring profiles of key staff on the library's home page and highlighting the role of librarians and library staff in promotional materials can help to educate the public about the importance of their work and its value.

Salary and budget negotiations are generally delicate matters and best handled out of the limelight. If either party embarrasses the other, it can damage both the process and outcome. That is why a strategic communication plan and skilled spokesperson(s) are a must.

Other tips:

- Designate one person to handle media inquiries.
- Prepare a position statement that explains your case simply and fairly. Include statistics and facts that support your position.
- Monitor the media and other feedback. Adapt your message and tactics accordingly.
- Be consistent and persistent in getting your message out.

Letters to the editor and/or an opinion column in local newspapers can help to get your message before the public. In general, it is better to have a respected ally

such as a library board member, faculty member or community leader write on your behalf. Presidents of library associations, unions or other groups may also write credibly on behalf of their members.

In advocating better salaries, it's important to avoid coming across as self-serving. Focus on why fair compensation is in the public's best interest as well as library employees and their families. Use the key message and talking points in this toolkit along with your own statistics and examples to emphasize why improvements are necessary.

Opinion columns generally run about 700 words and appear on the "op-ed" (opposite the editorial) page. When writing an op-ed, keep the tone conversational. You will need:

- An attention-getting opening that states the problem and your proposed solution (key message)
- Three key points that reinforce it
- Statistics and examples-local/state/national--that illustrate your points
- A close that summarizes and reinforces your case

For an example, see "Other view: California's librarians are long overdue for a raise," by ALA President Maurice J. Freedman and California Library Association Past-President Anne M. Turner, *The Sacramento Bee*, Nov. 25, 2002. (See Appendix F)

Letters to the editor are more succinct. See sample. Check the editorial/op-ed page of your newspaper for word length and other guidelines for submitting a letter to the editor or opinion column.

Depending on your strategy, it may be helpful to seek an editorial endorsement from your community's newspaper(s). To arrange a meeting, contact the editor of the editorial page and request a meeting with the editorial board. Briefly describe the issues involved and who will be your spokespeople (no more than three). Editorial board meetings generally consist of key members of the editorial page and reporting staff. Your spokesperson(s) will be given an opportunity to make their case and answer any questions. They should bring handouts and be prepared to answer any sensitive questions that may arise.

Remember, a unified front is essential for success. All members of your group should understand and respect the communication strategy, the reasons behind it and their role in it.

Sample Letter-to-the-Editor

Behind every great library are great librarians. As a member of the [name of library board/faculty], I am familiar with the expertise and skills that librarians use to develop and provide the services and programs that inform, entertain and enlighten us.

I am also familiar with the hard choices the library must make when budget time comes around. Our library shouldn't have to choose between paying equitable salaries to its staff and buying books, technology or other much needed resources. But that, unfortunately, is what it often comes down to.

This year the library board/administration is proposing a modest increase in funding, one that would go toward righting past inequities and bringing the salaries of our librarians and support staff in line with comparable staff of other [specify city/county/university] departments. For example, [cite a local example e.g. information technology staff with bachelor's degrees earn more than librarians with master's degrees. Clerks in the registrar's office earn x percent more than library clerks.] Such inequities reflect long outdated stereotypes and discriminate against work performed primarily by women.

Today's librarians are well-trained, technology-savvy information experts. They—women and men—often have families to support and deserve to be compensated fairly for their expertise, skills and responsibilities. I can think of almost no work more important than providing for the information and education needs of our [campus/community] and urge that everyone who values our library and the people who make it possible join me in urging [title of official(s)] to support this long overdue raise for our librarians and library staff.

Respectfully,
(Name, title, address, telephone, email)

Tough Questions and Answers

Q. *How can you argue for salary increases when all departments are being forced to cutback?*

A. A bad economy is no excuse for less than adequate compensation. Our library needs to commit to correcting inequities and develop a plan and timetable for addressing them. We can do this now at practically no cost.

Q. *What is pay equity?*

A. Pay equity means that all people receive equal pay for work of equal value regardless of their race or gender. This is an important issue for library workers because, as with many other predominately female fields, wages are

often less than those paid for comparable work traditionally performed by men with similar education and experience.

Q. *Why is pay equity needed in libraries?*

A. Libraries provide essential services in today's information society, but often are unable to pay a living wage to their employees. For example, systems analysts and database administrators, who the Department of Labor classifies as comparable to librarians, earn almost twice as much—\$61,000 a year starting out compared to \$34,000 for librarians. Library support staffs are similarly underpaid. Low salaries penalize library workers who often are the sole support for their families. They also penalize library users by making it difficult for libraries to recruit high quality staff.

Q. *Isn't pay equity expensive?*

A. In a word, no. In Minnesota, pay equity legislation provided raises for nearly 30,000 state employees, including library staff. The cost was only about 4 percent of the state's payroll budget over a four-year period or less than 1 percent each year. In Washington State, pay equity cost less than 3 percent of the state's total personnel costs and was accomplished over an eight-year period. While a small part of the overall budget, these pay increases can mean a lot to library workers and their families.

Q. *If women want to earn more, can't they choose jobs that pay more?*

A. More women *are* choosing higher paying occupations formerly dominated by men. But society still needs libraries and expert staff to run them. We believe women (and men) should have the right to choose any occupation and know that they will be paid fairly for the work they do.

Q. *If library employees receive pay equity increases, won't my taxes go up?*

A. Not necessarily. Pay equity is usually implemented over a number of years to lessen the financial impact. Most jurisdictions, like Minnesota, have been able to achieve pay equity without tax increases or layoffs.

Q. *Won't the Internet make libraries and librarians obsolete?*

A. Absolutely not! In fact, if we didn't already have libraries, we'd have to invent them. Libraries are 21st century centers for information, for education, literacy and culture. And librarians are the ultimate search

engines. They save time and money by helping to find the best, most accurate and complete information, whether it's online or in a book or video.

Q. *Why do we need librarians anyway?*

A. In a world that's information rich, librarians are information smart. They save time and money by helping to find the exact information needed. They teach children the joy of reading, and seniors how to surf the Internet. Helping and teaching others to find and evaluate information is a unique skill that librarians bring.

Several Web sites provide useful information on answering difficult questions about pay equity and comparable worth and countering opposition arguments and myths about the wage gap. These include: National Committee on Pay Equity fact sheets, "Questions and Answers on Pay Equity" (www.feminist.com/fairpay/f_qape.htm) and "What the Opposition Says" (www.feminist.com/fairpay/f_talkingpoints.htm).

The AFSCME Web site (www.afscme.org/wrkplace/worth06.htm) lists common arguments against pay equity and responses to make.

Quotable Quotes

ALA President Maurice J. Freedman on the Campaign for America's Librarians

- We must, here and now, dispel the myth prevalent in the world, and perpetuated in many of our lives—that we chose librarianship INSTEAD of choosing to be fairly compensated. My friends, we chose librarianship AND we want equitable compensation!
- The stereotype of the poor but proud librarian is one that—individually and as a group—we need to dismantle and send to the Smithsonian.
- The Campaign for America's Librarians is based on the premise that it is OK to speak out. It is not OK to allow inequities to go unchallenged.
- Individually and as a profession, we can no longer afford to give complicit approval to the implicit statement: "Your lack of money is a valid reason to discriminate against me."

- Salaries will not change unless we do. It is up to all of us to take a stand.
- Everyone loves libraries. Unfortunately, however, librarians cannot continue to live on love alone.
- Our nation's librarians deserve compensation, not just commensurate to their education, skills and experience, but with those who have comparable education, skills, and experience—the accountants, engineers, and systems analysts.
- Within just seven years, nearly one in four librarians will be of retirement age. Sure it's a great first or even second career. But who at this rate will be able to afford to take their place? Who will want to?
- We save time and money (not to mention aggravation) by helping our users find the best, most accurate and complete information for their needs whether in print, online, video or any other format.
- America's libraries don't just happen. They are run by highly educated librarians and skilled library workers—unsung heroines and heroes who far too frequently are underpaid and under-recognized.
- Good libraries are essential in an information society.
- Libraries are 21st century centers for information, education, literacy, and culture. And librarians are the ultimate search engines.
- As a society, we cannot continue to profess to value libraries without valuing librarians.

(Librarians) are subversive. You think they're just sitting there at the desk, all quiet and everything. They're like plotting the revolution, man. I wouldn't mess with them.

—Michael Moore, author/film maker

Building the Case

To obtain better salaries, several strategies may be needed and different tactics used at various times. Many strategies described in this section can be used without doing a full pay equity study; however, such a study should help to eliminate gender as a factor in wage-setting and address wage inequities between comparable male and female jobs.

The premise of pay equity is that dissimilar jobs can be evaluated and compared when looking at each job in relation to established criteria.

Statistics are one way of making useful comparisons. Job descriptions and job evaluation are other key elements in determining the relative value of jobs to an employer and ensuring internal equity or fairness between jobs within an organization.

The analytical, intellectual work of librarians and support staff may not always be visible to others, so this is especially important to document. For example, cataloging might be seen by others as routine clerical work rather than the complex taxonomic work it is. Or the data entry work of support staff may not be recognized for the judgment needed rather than routine keyboarding tasks.

Support staff positions often have considerable education and experience requirements. Some support staff also have assumed higher-level responsibilities that should be recognized with salary adjustments.

Clearly articulating the nature of our work is essential to helping others gain a better understanding of the field. (See *Competencies and Roles of Staff*.) It's important that library staff at different levels be represented on any organizational reclassification and/or job evaluation committees, particularly if the library is within a larger parent organization.

The American Federation of Federal, State, County and Municipal Employees (AFSCME) offers the following suggestions for obtaining fair pay:

1. Raise the floor by eliminating the lowest pay grades, which can set the stage for raising the pay of other underpaid groups later.
2. Start small by targeting several underpaid classifications for wage increases or upgrades, and then gradually include other classifications.
3. Make the most of employer job evaluation studies to assure a bias-free system.
4. Implement previous studies that may have showed inequities but never been implemented.
5. "Piggy-back" on studies from other jurisdictions by modifying them to your workplace.

6. Start or join a living wage campaign in your area.
7. Support the Fair Pay Act and Paycheck Fairness Acts and contact Congress to enact them.
8. Work to pass state or local pay equity legislation.
9. Keep alert to maintain pay equity gains so that inequities won't creep back.

Source: "We're Worth It!" Washington, D.C., 1998.
www.afscme.org/wrkplace/worth02.htm

Salary Statistics

This is the time to put your librarian's information-gathering and evaluation expertise to work on your own behalf.

Selecting what salary statistics to use in negotiating one's own salary or presenting data to public officials or administration on behalf of a group of employees is an important step in defining wage inequities.

Look for surveys that collect local, state, regional, or national data. These may provide data for only one type of library, one level of staff or specific specialization of workers. Data for library workers may be found among data for other occupations and professions within a specific jurisdiction, such as a university, Board of Education, corporation or branch of government.

It may be necessary to conduct your own salary survey, although this often requires outside expertise and can be expensive. Preliminary, informal data gathering can be used to push for a more formal study or to raise awareness of the issues.

Typically, library organizations identify other local, state or regional institutions of similar type and size for comparison purposes. National data can be helpful if recruiting librarians nationally. You should beware that comparisons with other libraries will likely perpetuate lower salaries than if comparisons were made in other ways. It may be helpful to provide those who make salary decisions with several ways to look at the issue in order to widen their view. For example, you might provide a comparison of library positions with other jobs in the city/county, on campus, or within the corporation. (See "Comparisons with Other Occupations.")

Employment settings and size of organization often affect salaries. Employees who do not supervise others are often paid lower since classification schemes often favor management functions. It is important to check if salary surveys of librarians are collecting data only for MLS librarians or persons with that title but with less education.

The Riley Guide (www.rileyguide.com/salguides.html) offers guidelines for evaluating salary data from different surveys. These include:

- Consideration of geographic factors
- Whether organizations are comparable in size
- If jobs are matched by measuring skill sets rather than job titles
- Who was included
- How many organizations were polled
- When the data were collected

Cost of living variations may be a factor in geographical salary differentials. Several Web sites can help you compare the cost of living in various areas. These include www.homefair.com/calc/salcalc.html, www.myjobsearch.com and www.money.com/bestplaces. Look also at how salaries are keeping up with inflation factors.

See Appendix G for resources of Salary Data/Surveys/Statistics.

Fast Facts: Salary Data

According to statistics released by the U.S. Census Bureau Sept. 25, 2001, women who worked full-time, year-round earned just 73 percent of what men earned who also worked full-time, year-round.

Sources noted below are updated regularly; therefore, check for the latest data available. Sources that look similar on the surface may use different methodologies, definitions and time periods, so make certain you understand those factors when using the data.

Salary Data for Library Workers

New MLS graduates from ALA-accredited programs, 2001: \$36,818 mean; \$35,000 median

Source: Terrell, Tom. "Pay and Job Variety Both Increase in Spite of Tough Economy," *Library Journal*, Oct. 15, 2002: 30–36.

Public and academic librarians with MLS from ALA accredited programs, 2002: \$49,866 mean; \$46,600 median

Source: Lynch, Mary Jo. *ALA Survey of Librarian Salaries*, 2002. Chicago: ALA, 2002. Summary at www.ala.org/hrdr/salaries.html.

Special librarians, U.S., 2002: \$56,500 median

Source: Data for Special Libraries Association (SLA) members. *SLA Annual Salary Survey*, 2002. Washington, D.C., 2002.

Librarians, 2000: \$42,730 mean; \$41,700 median

Above figure includes:

Elementary and secondary schools	\$43,320 median
Colleges and universities	\$43,050 median
Public libraries/Local government	\$38,370 median

(Note: Above figure does not include hospitals and education.)

Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS). *Occupational Outlook Handbook, 2002–2003*. (<http://stats.bls.gov/oco/ocos068.htm>)

Library technicians, 2000: \$24,230 mean; \$23,170 median

Above figure includes:

Elementary and secondary schools	\$21,120 median
Colleges and universities	\$25,320 median
Local government	\$22,910 median

Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics. *Occupational Outlook Handbook, 2002–2003*. (<http://stats.bls.gov/oco/ocos113.htm>)

Salary Data for Other Occupations

Other occupations, 2000:

Computer support specialists	\$36,460 median
Postal service clerks	\$39,010 median
Brokerage clerks	\$31,060 median
Human resources assistants	\$28,340 median

Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics. *Occupational Outlook Handbook, 2002–2003*. (www.bls.gov/oco/ocos)

Municipal Officials, 2001:

Parks and recreation director	\$54,195 median
Information services director	\$64,685 median
Public works director	\$58,608 median
Planning director	\$61,141 median
Human resources director	\$57,979 median
Health officer	\$56,412 median
Chief librarian	\$46,453 median

Source: International City/County Management Association. *The Municipal Yearbook*. Washington, D.C.: ICMA, 2002

Other occupations/professions, 2000:

Computer systems analysts	\$59,330 median
Database administrators	\$51,990 median
Network systems and data communication analysts	\$54,510 median
Computer and information systems managers	\$78,830 median
Computer and information scientists, research	\$70,590 median

(Note: BLS states this occupation requires similar analytical, organizational, and communicative skills as those of librarians.)

Source: Bureau of Labor Statistics. *Occupational Outlook Handbook, 2002–2003*. www.bls.gov/oco/ocos042.htm.

The following averages are for new graduates, 2001:

Accounting (bachelor's)	\$39,397
Accounting (master's)	\$43,272
Computer science (bachelor's)	\$52,723
Computer science (master's)	\$61,453
Information sciences/systems (bachelor's)	\$45,182
Management information systems (bachelor's)	\$45,485
Management information systems (master's)	\$57,225

Source: National Association of Colleges and Employers in BLS *Occupational Outlook Handbook, 2002–2003*. (www.bls.gov/oco/ocos042.htm and www.bls.gov/oco/ocos001.htm)

See www.lrs.org/documents/fastfacts/182salaries.pdf for a “Fast Facts” statement compiled by the Colorado State Library-Library Research Service (LRS) on “Earnings of Library Staff in the Mountain West Low Compared to Workers in Similar Jobs.” LRS used data from the Bureau of Labor Statistics National Compensation Survey to show comparisons of Librarians and Library Clerks with other occupations. This is an example of how to illustrate salary data in an easy-to-read graphic display that might be used as a guide for other library groups in documenting their own local/state/or regional data.

See also www.ala.org/congress/3rd_congress/wages00.pdf and www.ala.org/congress/3rd_congress/profwage.pdf for charts compiled by Martha Parsons from Bureau of Labor Statistics (BLS) Occupational Employment Statistics salary data from 2000. These include: “State Wage Comparisons (Librarians, Library Technicians, and Library Assistants)” and “Comparisons of Library Job Wages with Other Occupations Wages.” For an understanding of BLS data collection methodology and sampling, see www.bls.gov/oes_ques.htm and www.bls.gov/ncs/methodology.htm. Although BLS indicates that the typical education level for librarians is the master's degree, employers who complete BLS surveys may not always require this for the staff they define as librarians. With library technicians and library assistants, data may reflect wide variations in educational requirements for these positions. Therefore, caution

should be exercised in using BLS data, although the statistics can provide some information if no other survey data are available. They may be useful in making overall comparisons with other occupations.

Updated Job Descriptions

How long has it been since your library's job descriptions have been reviewed and updated?

Do they reflect the knowledge and use of the newest technologies, the complexities in juggling a variety of tasks and demands, the extensive contact with the public, including difficult patrons, work hours that include weekends and evenings, and more?

An accurate, up-to-date job description is the basis for many actions within the personnel arena, such as job classification and evaluation, recruiting and training, performance appraisal. Be actively involved in the rewriting of your own description. Use specific action verbs to begin each sentence (e.g., investigates, tabulates, schedules, etc.) Avoid vague words such as assists, handles, maintains or the word “may.” The term “other duties as required” does not provide any information for job evaluation purposes. Indicate what action is performed, to what or to whom, to produce what, using what equipment, tools, or processes.

See the toolkit section “Competencies and Roles of Staff” and the *Occupational Outlook Handbook* (www.bls.gov/oco/home.htm) for ideas to include, but make sure to think through your own unique set of responsibilities and skills needed in developing a description. In developing job descriptions, be sure to describe library tasks clearly. Try to avoid using jargon that people outside library employment might not understand.

Some state libraries, state library associations, national groups and local libraries have collected and posted sample job descriptions for different types of libraries (e.g., www.cslib.org, <http://winslo.state.oh.us>, www.njla.org, www.librarysupportstaff.com, www.mlanet.org, <http://gateway.library.uiuc.edu>).

Position Classification

Position classification involves the collection of job content information about individual positions within an organization. The positions are then grouped into common job families or classes. The class specifications provide the main source of information used in applying job evaluation systems.

The classification and salary system in an organization may be long overdue for a review and revision. In such cases, this review may help to frame salary inequity issues.

Job Evaluation

A job evaluation compares all positions within an organization, regardless of job dissimilarity or level. This can be an especially useful tool to employers, employee groups and unions.

The most common type of job evaluation used for pay equity purposes is a point factor system. This process measures each job by looking at factors describing skill, effort, responsibility and working conditions. Different components may be used in different systems, but generally such elements include:

- Job knowledge
- Accountability
- Problem solving and decision-making
- Autonomy or freedom to take action
- Discretion or initiative
- Impact of actions
- Kind and amount of supervision
- Job complexity
- Contact with others
- Physical and mental demands
- Stress factors
- Volume of work
- Environmental conditions

The master's degree required of librarians can add valuable points to "knowledge required" factors. The high technology aspects of jobs should be emphasized where appropriate. Public relations and communication skills and customer service aspects are especially important in many library jobs.

Although women may perform jobs with different duties than those typically held by men, fair pay results if both are equally valuable according to the work dimensions or factors considered instead of what the market is paying various positions. The more complex the work, the higher the wages.

Pay equity advocates cite the need for unbiased, gender-neutral compensation systems that do not perpetuate existing stereotypes of male and female jobs. In a report titled "How to do Pay Equity Job Comparisons," n.d., the Ontario (Canada) Pay Equity Commission suggests that those who collect and record job information should be alert to gender bias.

Factors to check include:

- Consistency in the level of detail describing both female and male jobs
- Neutral language and non-sexist job titles

- Inclusion of all job aspects
- Involvement of female and male workers in committees and the process

The commission also notes that one of the key requirements of the gender neutral evaluation of work is to make work performed by women visible. See "Commonly Over-looked Features of Work" at www.gov.on.ca/lab/pec/pubs.

Job evaluation can be a time-consuming and complex process. Library workers should not leave this only to the human resources department or consultants, who may not understand the degree of complexity and intellectual aspects of library work. In most cases, a steering committee with labor and employer representatives will oversee a job evaluation study. Library workers should be involved either through union or employee groups. Throughout the pay equity process, there are policy choices to be made and monitored in choosing the method for evaluating the worth of jobs, setting criteria for determining relative worth, conducting the actual evaluation process, analyzing the predominately female and male jobs, and establishing wage-adjusting procedures after job content has been analyzed. See Appendix H for Job Evaluation Resources.

Comparisons with Other Occupations

How libraries are grouped within their organizations affects how they are viewed and with whom they are compared. It also contributes to the status of librarians and establishes peer groups in which they will be compared and measured.

In city and county governments, it will make a difference whether libraries are grouped with critical service providers, educational and cultural organizations or recreational service. In academic institutions, if librarians have faculty status and libraries report to academic officers, it is more likely that status and salary issues will be comparable to faculty status and salary issues. If they report to administrative officers, they are more likely to be compared with professional groups within the overall administrative hierarchy. If they report to information officers, they are more likely to be compared with other information professionals, especially computer professionals.

Comparisons of library workers with other occupations can depend on what other workers are included within your jurisdiction. If a job evaluation process is carried out, especially the point factor system, it is possible to review classifications that receive similar

points and argue that library workers should receive the same salary as their counterparts. For instance, if positions held predominantly by males have higher salaries but have similar point factor values, a case may be made that gender inequities are present. This can be done at all levels of job titles.

In Minnesota, most library directors in large cities are most often matched with police or fire chiefs, superintendents of public works, community development directors, chief engineers and finance directors. Librarians are most often matched with inspectors, supervisors, and general professional workers. Library assistants are most often matched with engineering and other technicians, equipment operators, maintenance workers, drivers, and laborers. Note that it is difficult to evaluate jobs using only job titles. Pay equity studies usually match jobs more accurately by reviewing complete position descriptions.

Even without a formal point factor system, you can look informally at salaries for predominantly male professions that have a master's degree requirement and compare these to librarians with the MLS degree. If there are large discrepancies in salary, you can make a case for rectifying the inequities or push for a more formal study. In some cases, predominantly male professions are paid on the average more than librarians, even with a bachelor's degree requirement for the other profession. Library support staff whose positions require more educational requirements than technician or support jobs in other fields may make a similar case. In its state survey, the California Library Association looked at levels of library staffing in relation to comparable non-library workers, namely, entry level, journey, supervisor, and executive levels. The New Jersey Library Association looked at comparisons of public librarians with building inspectors, civil engineers, town administrators, and directors of parks and recreation.

Some library administrators look at salaries paid by libraries in neighboring jurisdictions or libraries of similar types or size in trying to determine salaries that are competitive. Such comparisons may result in perpetuating low salaries. Since many libraries recruit nationally, a case may be made for being in line with national figures. However, if a neighboring jurisdiction has just completed or won a pay equity settlement with increases for library staff, other libraries may wish to "piggyback" on this success and make the case for similar increases.

The library associations of Nassau and Suffolk Counties financed a review of salary levels in 1990 by an

independent compensation specialist. For librarians, comparisons were made with salaries for master's level graduates in non-technical programs (i.e., humanities and social sciences, education, human resources, communications, general business and marketing). Minimum salaries were set at the 50th percentile of the starting rates for non-business graduates. This resulted in salary increases for librarians. Clerical levels also increased, with the minimum set at the 75th percentile of comparable titles in other area firms. As a result, a number of library boards in the region took action to also increase their minimum salary levels to remain competitive. Since the report, adjustments to minimum salaries have been based on the increase in the CPI. Along with adopting the salary recommendations, the association boards took the position that no job advertisement would be permitted to appear in their respective publications unless the annual (or adjusted hourly) salary met the recommended minimum level.

Some libraries compare their salaries with teachers within their own communities or states. Although teaching is often considered a predominantly female underpaid profession, union negotiations have succeeded in increasing salaries in many cases. In making such comparisons, you should look at what teachers earn for a 9–10 month year versus librarians who work a 12-month year. In many cases, the teachers with less work time are paid more than the librarians.

Another comparison might be with other information professionals in the private sector who are paid more but have the same skill sets as librarians, such as those working for vendors who serve libraries.

For more information on teachers, see:

Nelson, E. Howard, Rachel Drown, and Jewell C. Gould. *Survey & Analysis of Teacher Salary Trends 2000*.

Washington, D.C.: American Federation of Teachers, AFL-CIO. www.aft.org/research (large amount of national and state data for teachers; includes some comparisons with other professions).

National Education Association. *Rankings & Estimates: Rankings of the States 2001 and Estimates of School Statistics 2002*. Washington, D.C.: NEA, 2002. www.nea.org/publiced/edstats/rankings/02rankings.pdf

Competencies and Roles of Staff

Presenting the varied competencies needed by library staff to administrators, human resource personnel, public officials and others who determine library staff

classifications and salaries can help to educate and update these officials about the dynamic and changing roles and duties of both librarians and support staff.

This information can be translated into more accurate and up-to-date job descriptions, criteria for job evaluation and classification studies, detailed budget presentations, and/or media and other public information descriptions of the value and importance of library services and quality staff. Although each job description needs to be considered separately in relation to a specific institution, reviewing competencies developed by library associations and other groups can help ensure that skills, knowledge and responsibilities are accurately represented.

See Appendix I for helpful resources.

Support Staff

The strategies described in this toolkit can and should be applied at all levels of library staff, including support staff who comprise up to two-thirds of all library workers.

At the 2002 ALA Annual Conference program sponsored by the Library Support Staff Interests Round Table, Patricia Glass Schuman affirmed that many support staff feel “under-compensated, under-respected, and underrepresented.” Their duties and qualifications vary greatly, with job titles running the gamut from paraprofessionals and library assistants to library technicians, aides, associates and more.

Gene Kinnaly reported that members of support staff are rarely compensated for their skills, experience, education and responsibilities at the same level as those in non-library occupations with similar qualifications. Support staff is often seen as clerical help, yet the nature of these positions has expanded greatly. In many cases, members of support staff have taken on duties traditionally performed by professionals with little or no adjustment in salary, so there may be internal as well as external inequities. Many position descriptions are inaccurate and outdated. Some support personnel supervise others but are not given credit for this in compensation structures. It is difficult to standardize the appropriate mix of professional and support staff positions. This varies widely by type and size of library, but needs to be carefully thought out within each institution.

To help in clarifying the many support staff job titles, Kinnaly suggested using the framework of the ALA “Library and Information Studies and Human Resource Utilization” policy (adopted by ALA Council, 2002;

www.ala.org/hrdr/lepu.pdf). Certification and unionization have helped to improve compensation in some support staff situations. Comparisons with information technology occupations or comparable technician positions can also be useful. Librarians should recognize that when compensation for support staff goes up, the floor for librarian salaries should also rise.

Many states have library paraprofessional organizations that are actively addressing employment, education and career concerns.

For discussion, see:

- ALA Library Support Staff Interests Round Table, www.ala.org/ssirt
- ASSOCIATES—electronic journal for support staff, <http://associates.ucr.edu>
- Council on Library/Media Technicians, <http://library.ucr.edu/COLT>
- *Library Mosaics*, www.librarymosaics.com
- Library Support Staff Resource Center, <http://flightline.highline.ctc.edu/lsrc/default.htm>
- Soaring to Excellence Teleconferences, www.cod.edu/teleconf/Soaring/Index.htm

In May 2003, ALA will sponsor its Third Congress on Professional Education (COPE III), with the focus on support staff issues of education and training, compensation, career ladders, and certification. For related documents, see www.ala.org/congress/3rd_congress/.

See also:

Association of Research Libraries (ARL). *Library Support Staff Classification Studies*. SPEC Kit 252. Washington, D.C.: ARL: 1999.

Kinnaly, Gene. “Salary and Pay Equity Issues for Library Support Staff.” 2002 ALA Annual Conference presentation, www.mjfreedman.org/atlantasupportstaff.pdf.

———. “Pay Equity, Support Staff, and ALA.” *Library Mosaics* 13, no. 2 (Mar./Apr. 2002): 8–10 and www.mjfreedman.org/payequityss.pdf.

Oberg, Larry R. “Library Support Staff in an Age of Change: Utilization, Role Definition, and Status.” ERIC Digest, EDO-IR-95-4, May 1995. <http://flightline.highline.ctc.edu/lsrc/articles/agechnge.htm>.

Benefits

In building your case, be sure to include benefits. Benefits can add up to 35 percent or more in total compensation. Many library workers are employed with limited or no benefits, especially if they are in smaller libraries or work as part-time hourly staff. Fighting for and negotiating increased benefits for all levels of staff can be as useful as advocating improved salaries, especially given the high costs of health care and difficulties with retirement savings.

Consider these and other possible benefits:

- Paid vacation and sick leave
- Retirement options
- Health, dental, vision, disability and life insurance (including domestic partner benefits)
- Continuing education opportunities
- Travel and registration costs for conference attendance
- Tuition reimbursements and other educational support
- Pay differentials for evening and weekend work
- Access to credit union and housing assistance
- Wellness benefits
- Worker's compensation
- Parental leave
- Adoption assistance
- Flexible spending accounts

To assist workers in smaller organizations, it might be useful to explore a multiple-employer plan. For example, the National Organizers Alliance has developed an insurance and pension system for small social, economic and environmental justice nonprofit organizations, which previously lacked benefits for their workers. (*Nonprofit Quarterly*, Spring 2002, p. 56–59). Group insurance offerings (health, disability, term life) are also available through ALA for members of the association. In addition, unions have been successful in negotiating improved benefit packages.

Minimum Salaries

Some regional or state library associations have set recommended minimum salaries for librarians (See the "Regional Salary Guide" in the classified section of *American Libraries* magazine or contact the ALA Office for Human Resource Development and Recruitment.) In some cases, these guidelines have been useful for

negotiating higher salaries, especially in smaller libraries. These minimum salaries lack the force of law, however, so have not always been useful. It is difficult to set a national standard because of the wide variations in geography and cost of living, also types and sizes of libraries.

Legislation

Legislative efforts to achieve pay equity have been increasing. Two bills have been introduced in the U.S. Congress and bills have been or will be introduced in many states. These generally address pay equity in one of three ways:

- Prohibition of wage discrimination on the basis of sex, race, national origin, and in some cases religion and ancestry
- Enhancement of current legislation by allowing workers to sue for punitive and compensatory damages
- Establishment of a commission to study the wage gap and to recommend solutions

For information about state legislation, check the Center for Policy Alternatives at www.stateaction.org. State library associations and other groups should monitor what bills might affect library workers and join forces with others to advocate for fair pay. For example, in New York State, five pay equity bills have been introduced in the legislature and a pay equity coalition of women's, labor, and civil rights groups is taking grassroots action (See www.liwomen.com/equalpaybill.html).

The two pieces of proposed federal legislation are The Paycheck Fairness Act, which amends the Fair Labor Standards Act, and The Fair Pay Act, which amends the Equal Pay Act.

The **Paycheck Fairness Act** strengthens the penalties that courts may impose for equal pay violations and prohibits retaliation against workers who inquire about or disclose information about employers' wage practices. The bill provides for compensatory and punitive damages, in addition to back pay, for women denied equal pay for equal work; authorizes class action equal pay suits, and directs the U.S. Department of Labor to provide public information about strategies for identifying and eliminating wage discrimination and to issue guidelines for evaluating jobs.

The **Fair Pay Act** would prohibit wage discrimination based on sex, race, and national origin by requiring

employers to provide equal pay for work of equal value, whether or not the jobs are the same. (For example, within individual companies, employers could not pay jobs that are held predominantly by women less than jobs held predominantly by men if those jobs are equivalent in value to the employer.) Exceptions are made for different wage rates based on seniority, merit, quantity or quality of work, and there is a small business exception. The bill also would ban retaliation and require employers to file wage information annually with the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission.

Both bills are being introduced in both houses of Congress. Ask your elected representatives to cosponsor and support this legislation. More information about these bills is available at <http://thomas.loc.gov> or from the Business and Professional Women (www.bpwusa.org) and National Women's Law Center (www.nwlc.org).

See *Success Stories* for information on legislative activities in Canada, Australia, and Minnesota.

Litigation

In the early 1980s, several landmark legal victories were achieved for pay equity, in which the courts recognized sex-based wage disparities as discrimination under the 1964 Civil Rights Act. This legal climate soon changed, with courts requiring proof that employers intended to discriminate, but the early victories still energized workers at the local and state level to undertake grassroots and legislative activities to achieve pay equity.

Library workers were among those who pursued legal remedies. In 1983 librarians in Fairfax County, Va. filed a complaint of sex-based wage discrimination with the EEOC. The complaint—the only one of its kind filed solely by librarians—attracted national attention but was

dismissed in 1988 as being in the area of “comparable worth,” over which EEOC had no jurisdiction. However, this action was noted in neighboring counties that were doing job evaluation studies that raised library salaries. Fairfax County librarians were upgraded in 1988 and in 1990 received wage increases based on neighboring jurisdictions’ salary scales.

In 1996 library employees in Omaha, Neb. sued the city for sex discrimination based on a reclassification that placed them in the lowest of four employee groups for the purposes of determining pay raises. More than half of the employees in the lowest group were women, while those in the three higher groups were predominantly men. The court ruled against the library workers, and an appeal was denied in 1997. However, all Omaha city employees have been given pay raises at the same rate since then.

Successful litigation in Canada and Australia helped to implement their pay equity legislation. While some gains have been made in raising salaries through legal action, litigation takes time and costs much, so is less likely to be a recommended means to get better salaries and achieve pay equity.

Libraries and librarians have definitely changed my life—and the lives of countless other Americans . . . they deserve the support and patronage of every single one of us who values education.

—Former First Lady Barbara Bush

Success Stories

Many library worker groups in the U.S. and other countries have been involved in a variety of pay equity efforts. These efforts have included Equal Employment Opportunity Commission and other class-action complaints, civil service commission testimony, job evaluation, reclassification and other pay equity studies, collective bargaining and contract negotiations, and lobbying state legislatures. Examples follow.

The ALA Presidential Task Force on Better Salaries and Pay Equity for Library Workers is interested in learning of more success stories, also efforts that may have been less successful but provide useful lessons. Please send information via the feedback form on the Better Salaries and Pay Equity for Library Workers Task Force Web site at www.mjlfreedman.org.

Minnesota

Public library workers received salary increases of up to 40 percent as a result of state legislation passed in 1984. Designed to achieve pay equity for local government employees, the law required all jurisdictions to report information on job evaluations and earnings for predominantly male jobs and predominantly female jobs. During the initial period of compliance until 1991, almost half of the library classes were identified as underpaid by an average of about \$300 per month. Over five years of pay equity implementation, library directors received an average of 32 percent pay increase; librarians, a 36 percent increase; and library assistants, a 39 percent increase. Pay for comparable male jobs increased only 20 to 25 percent in that time.

For more information, see *Pay Equity & Minnesota Public Libraries: Results of a Legislative Approach* by Bonnie Watkins and Jan Feye-Stukas, ALA Office for Library Personnel Resources and Committee on Pay Equity, 1992; also the League of Minnesota Cities at www.lmnc.org; and the State Of Minnesota Office of Employee Relations at www.doer.state.mn.us.

Australia

In a landmark case in Australia, librarians, library technicians and archivists in New South Wales will receive pay increases of up to 26 percent due to a March 28, 2002 ruling by the N.S.W. Industrial Relations Commission (IRC).

The Public Service Association, an Australian labor union, brought this first case to test a new principle of gender pay equity established by the IRC in 2000. A librarian in the highest category would receive a 35 percent pay increase to \$56,000. The commission ruled

that the work of library employees had been historically undervalued and that increases in the work, skill, and responsibilities of these employees had not been taken into account properly in setting the wages. The ruling also formalized the professional status of librarians by writing into law the Australian Library and Information Association qualifications standards as the formal criteria for recognition.

For more information, see the Australian Library and Information Association at www.alia.org.au and ALA Better Salaries and Pay Equity for Library Workers Task Force at www.mjlfreedman.org/payequitysources.html.

New York Public Library

In April 2001, current New York Public Library librarians received an 8 percent pay increase, raising the average salary from \$39,500 to \$46,000. The increase was in addition to two 4 percent raises negotiated for citywide employees.

The New York Public Library Guild (www.local1930.org) had led a three-year campaign to focus attention on the salary issues, with newspaper articles, ads, and demonstrations. Support from the City Council was received. At the end of the process, the library's endowment paid to hire a former deputy mayor to negotiate with city officials. Negotiations continue to help solve the library's recruitment and retention problems.

Canada

Canadian librarians in the federal civil service were part of a 1999 settlement between the Public Service Alliance of Canada and the Canadian government. The settlement came after more than 15 years of negotiations on a pay equity dispute affecting 230,000 former and current public service employees, including clerks, secretaries, data processors, educational support personnel and health services workers.

As far back as 1977, federal government librarians at the National Library and the Public Archives of Canada compared their salaries with those of the male-dominated Historical Research (HR) group and found that the HR group earned approximately \$3,000 more a year at every pay tier. The researchers required only an undergraduate degree compared to the librarians' master's degrees.

The librarians were the first group to use a new Canadian Human Rights Act to lodge a complaint. A \$2.3 million settlement in 1980 paved the way for additional

studies and the \$3.6 billion settlement for more federal workers in 1999. (Note: Canada has a variety of pay equity acts and agreements that differ by provincial and federal jurisdiction).

For more information, see "Pay Equity: What's It All Worth?," by Sachiko Okuda in *Feliciter* 46, no. 6 (2000): 314–17, Public Service Alliance of Canada at www.psaac.com/payequity, and Treasury Board, www.tbs-sct.gc.ca/wnew/PayEquity.

Southern University

At Southern University, Baton Rouge, La., (www.lib.subr.edu) librarians are considered faculty by state law and are included in any raises that faculty receive. Librarians have faculty rank and can obtain tenure as other faculty members. In 2001, the University brought all faculty members to the Southern Regional Education Board average. The minimum posted for a beginning librarian's position is \$40,000 but most beginning librarians start with \$42,106.

Maryland

In late 2002, librarians at Montgomery (MD) College Libraries received an upgrade in their job classifications and a 10 percent increase in salary, plus a \$500 bonus. For individual librarians, this meant about a \$7,000 increase in salary. For the institution, there was approximately a \$75,000 increase in payroll costs. Requests for similar upgrades in library support staff classifications and salaries are pending. The raise in classifications resulted from an internal job classification review requested over a year ago by the manager of libraries. Following completion of individual Job Information Questionnaires by library staff at the three community college campuses, the manager of libraries submitted several rounds of justification for reclassification and salary increases to the campus human resources department. The library is part of the campus Information Technology department, but other members of the department were receiving higher salaries than library staff. A paper "Trends in the Library Profession and the Impact of Technology at the Montgomery College Libraries" by David Orenstein, Manager of Libraries, documented changes in duties for all levels of library staff and outlined the types of knowledge required to meet increased demands and ensure effective, customer-oriented service. For more information, contact David Orenstein at 240-314-3025; email: DOrenste@mc.cc.md. See also www.mjfreedman.org/orenstein.pdf.

Union Stories

Orange County Library System

The librarians at the Orange County Library System (Orlando, FL) chose to organize and affiliate with the Service Employees International Union (SEIU).

The April, 1999 vote was by a better than two-to-one margin. OCLS management spent over \$100,000 in an effort to defeat the librarians' drive for a voice at work. As a result of bargaining, librarians got raises, the first of any kind in nine years. They also received an extra floating holiday and a grievance procedure that mandates binding arbitration. Contact Van E. Church, vice president of SEIU, Local 1220, 407-835-7640, email: releeman@yahoo.com.

King County Library System

At the King County (Wash.) Library System, 550 librarians, library assistants, and technicians voted on December 3, 2002, to join the Washington State Council of County and City Employees, AFSCME Council 2. The final vote was an overwhelming endorsement of union representation—298–157—with an 87 percent voter turnout.

Calling the election the largest public-sector union vote in memory, Council 2 President/Executive Director Chris Dugovich said the results showed that library workers "want to have a say in the workplace" and are seeking security in a period of cutbacks in tax dollars, rising layoffs, and general economic instability. "We look forward to working with library staff, management, and the community to continue excellent library services in King County. In tough times like these, our public libraries are a critical resource for readers of all ages." The victory came as a result of a lot of hard work by the King County Library System employees who formed a strong organizing committee. Credit goes to the volunteer member organizers, who focused on making one-on-one personal contacts throughout the organizing campaign. Employee volunteers and union staff put forth a tremendous effort, making home visits, running phone banks and visiting nearly all the 42 library branches. King County Library employees took to heart the running campaign theme, "Make A Choice—Gain A Voice—Vote Union." See www.kclsvoice.org.

Saskatoon Public Library

Saskatoon, Saskatchewan, Canada public libraries returned to regular hours November 28, 2002, after the Canadian Union of Public Employees (CUPE) Local 2669

accepted a tentative agreement, ending intermittent strikes over pay equity that began September 25. The library workers, who are predominately women, withdrew their services for a total of 21 days to back contract demands for pay equity. The CUPE members were then indefinitely locked out on November 19, when contract talks resumed.

The agreement gives library workers 4 percent increases for 2001 and 2002, and a 3 percent increase for 2003, surpassing the 3 percent yearly increases negotiated for other city workers. A further 2 percent of payroll will be set aside for the implementation of an internal job evaluation plan. The new agreement includes a commitment to undertake a joint study of wage disparities between the library and inside workers at the City of Saskatoon, using the pay equity concept of equal pay for work of equal value.

Although 70 percent of union members voted in favor of the agreement, some expressed disappointment in the terms covering library pages, the lowest-paid workers, who won't receive many of the benefits given other union members.

Canadian Union of Public Employees Local 2669 President Gwen Thomson said, "We've achieved a document that should get us closer to pay equity, but we're not there yet." For more information, see www.cupe.sk.ca.

More Stories

A variety of case studies have been documented in earlier ALA publications, which still can provide useful insights.

For more information, see:

American Library Association. Office for Library Personnel Resources. *Pay Equity: Issues and Strategies*. T.I.P. Kit #9. Chicago: ALA, 1987.

American Library Association. Office for Library Personnel Resources. *Pay Equity Action Strategies and Case Summaries*. T.I.P. Kit #2. Chicago: ALA, 1982.

Kenady, Carolyn. *Pay Equity: An Action Manual for Library Workers*. Chicago: ALA, 1989.

See also examples in toolkit sections on "Unionizing" and "Faculty Status."

As a general rule, librarians are a kick in the pants socially, often full of good humor, progressive, and naturally, well read. They tend to be generalists who know so much about so many things that they are quite the opposite of the boring old poops they have been made out to be. Most of them are full of life, some even full of the devil.

—Bill Hall, editorial page editor
Lewiston (Idaho) Tribune, Sept. 9, 2001

Working within Larger Groups

Building Partnerships/Coalitions

Library workers seeking better salaries can find allies. Fair pay for women and people of color is an important issue to working families throughout the country and is a concern of many women's organizations and unions.

Look first at your own organization for jobs held predominantly by women and people of color, then look to your community and state for local women's and civil rights organizations, unions and commissions on women. To help identify such organizations or get additional information, contact the National Committee on Pay Equity (NCPE), a nonprofit national coalition organization formed in 1979 to eliminate sex- and race-based wage discrimination and to achieve pay equity.

NCPE's organizational members—among them ALA, a charter member—include labor, civil rights, and women's organizations; religious, professional, and legal associations; state and local pay equity coalitions; commissions of women; and individuals representing more than 20 million workers.

A major activity of NCPE, initiated in 1996, is Equal Pay Day, held in April to symbolize the day that women's median earnings catch up to men's median earnings from the previous year. The event is held on Tuesday to recognize that women must work one full week plus Monday and part of Tuesday of the next week to equal men's earnings from just one week. NCPE provides materials, information and coordination for nationwide, grassroots activities. At the 2002 ALA Annual Conference, a resolution supporting Equal Pay Day was passed by ALA Council and encouraged library workers to become aware of the issues involved. In 2003, Equal Pay Day is on April 15.

For more information, contact the National Committee on Pay Equity (www.feminist.com/fairpay), P.O. Box 34446, Washington, DC 20043-4446. Tel: 301-277-1033. Fax: 301-277-4451. E-mail: fairpay@patriot.net

Unionizing As a Strategy

Working within a union can be a very effective strategy for working toward better pay.

According to the Bureau of National Affairs, union librarians make an average of 37 percent more than non-union librarians. The difference is even more dramatic among support staff as statistics show that staff covered by a union contract make 42 percent more than those without a union. Between 17 and 21 percent of library workers are unionized. (Bureau of National Affairs. *Union Membership and Earnings Data Book*. Washington, D.C.: published annually).

The American Library Association recognizes the role of unions in the ALA Policy Manual, Library Personnel Practices, Section 54.11, which states:

The American Library Association recognizes the principle of collective bargaining as one of the methods of conducting labor-management relations used by private and public institutions. The Association affirms the right of eligible library employees to organize and bargain collectively with their employers, or to refrain from organizing and bargaining collectively, without fear of reprisal.

A statement of guidelines is kept as part of the "Current Reference File" at ALA Headquarters. The guidelines, also adopted by the ALA governing body, state that ALA recognizes a responsibility to educate and provide pertinent information regarding library unionization and collective bargaining.

Working conditions are also addressed in the ALA Code of Ethics, which states:

We treat co-workers and other colleagues with respect, fairness, and good faith, and advocate conditions of employment that safeguard the rights and welfare of all employees of our institutions.

How Unions Can Improve Salaries

The most important way that a union can raise wages is through the collective bargaining agreement or the contract. Through negotiating a contract, library workers do two things: they come up with common objectives and work with management to achieve them. What is agreed upon is legally binding.

Unions can also raise salaries by working with other community organizations on Living Wage campaigns to raise people's wages above the poverty level.

Example: In October 2001, the Central Arkansas Library system approved a living wage policy of at least \$9 per hour for support staff. (See toolkit section on "Living Wage and Other Low Income Movements")

Unions have been involved for many years in getting cities/counties to conduct pay equity studies and get the results implemented. AFSCME has a useful guide on pay equity available at their website called "We're Worth It." (www.afscme.org/wrkplace/worthtc.htm).

Example: In 1981, unionized city workers (including library workers) in San Jose, CA, negotiated an improvement package that contained comparable worth

increases every two years for 10 years. Now San Jose library employees are among the best paid in the country.

How can a union raise your salary when there is no money in the budget to pay for salary increases? A union can provide political clout. As an organized group working together with management, unions can help make the library a higher priority with the city, county, university or relevant library funding bodies.

Frequently Asked Questions about Unions in Libraries

Q. *Doesn't ALA-APA act on behalf of professional librarians? Why do we need a union?*

A. The ALA-APA advocates for and supports librarians in seeking equitable compensation, but negotiating wages and other compensation must be done at the institutional level. ALA-APA cannot do collective bargaining, so its power to improve wages and benefits is limited. By being part of a union, library workers gain local allies who can help to achieve pay equity and better salaries. This is especially important in public libraries where the union brings greater power to win budget increases from local governments.

Q. *What workplace issues do unions address other than economic ones?*

A. Union contracts can create or protect transfer rights, encourage promotion from within, safeguard job security, secure seniority rights and improve other conditions of work. There are many people and forces pressuring library administrators for improvements in services, funds and other matters. The union can give staff an appropriately significant voice with management. A union also helps promote fairness because management has less opportunity to be arbitrary or discriminatory in its dealings with employees. Grievance procedures help to ensure that contract violations are dealt with in a fair and defined manner. In matters governed by a contract, the union and management have a certain equality that ensures that employee rights are respected.

Q. *What if my library doesn't have very much money, what difference can a union make?*

A. Lack of money is no excuse for discrimination. A union can work with library management to improve the budget. If the current contract calls for raises on a certain schedule, management cannot unilaterally alter that. For any contract provision to be changed, management would need to propose the change during negotiations

and justify the need to modify or eliminate the contract language. Any change would require negotiation and agreement by the union and include all employees covered by the contract, not just library staff.

Q. *Can a union work well with library management?*

A. Absolutely. Unions encourage a more participatory management style, with the union having a voice in decision-making. Regular labor/management meetings can help develop a cooperative working relationship. Many problems can be circumvented with regular dialogue and the mutual respect that a union helps promote.

Q. *What about union rules that appear clumsy and make it difficult to get work done? Won't having a union lower the quality of library service?*

A. Work rules come from contract negotiations between union members and library management. In most cases, rules improve working conditions for library staff. The point of these rules is fairness and equity for all workers. By improving pay and working conditions, unions help lower staff turnover, improve staff morale and consequently improve the quality of service.

Q. *Can I be in a union along with the people I supervise? Or, how can I be in the same union as my boss?*

A. Unions have stewards who deal with grievances from different levels of staff. Many problems for library workers emanate from the top levels of management (most middle managers only carry out the policies of the administration). These issues can often be handled between the union and the top level of management at the library without involving members.

Q. *What if the state where I work doesn't allow public employees to have collective bargaining rights?*

A. Unions can and do exist in these states. The more people who join and build the union, the more strength the union will have with legislators and other decision-makers who can make changes in the law. Labor groups are working in these states to change the laws and need your support, both as a union member and as a voter.

Q. *If we join a big union, will library workers get lost in the shuffle?*

A. The rank and file has power in a union in direct proportion to their participation. The library workers group within a union may be small in numbers but can

influence the priorities of the union toward library-specific issues by having a strong presence at union meetings and activities. Being part of a large, powerful union can increase your “clout” with management.

Q. *Can I be forced to join a union if my library coworkers decide to be represented by one?*

In many jurisdictions, “union shops” are the rule, i.e., everyone is required to pay a fee to the union if they are beneficiaries of the same raises, benefits and protections as members.

Q. *Can I be fired if I try to organize a union?*

A. It is illegal to fire someone for union activity. Employers can be fined for violating this law. The union will work with activists to protect them or at least advise on restricted activities. State labor laws and the National Labor Relations provide protection for those organizing unions. Once you are in a union, your contract should have additional provisions that protect workers from retaliation.

Q. *Aren't unions corrupt?*

A. Like any other group or association, some unions are better than others. If you don't already have a union, you should shop around for the best union to represent you. If you and your co-workers don't feel adequately represented by your union, it is important to get involved and make your concerns known. To have a stronger voice at work and win higher salaries requires hard work at the library and within the union. The more library staff that are involved, the more this work can be shared so it is easier for individuals to do what they can, when they can.

Ensuring Fair Play

When library employees consider joining and obtaining representation from a union, they may wonder whether their employer will play fair or will follow the practice of many employers in attempting to influence, by almost any means, the decision-making process of the employees. Such attempts to dissuade employees from joining a union can have a very unsettling effect on morale and the provision of public service.

A neutrality agreement is one method used by employers and unions to state their formal commitment to allow employees to decide without interference whether or not they will join a union and have representation rights. For an example of such an agreement, see Appendix J.

Starting a Union

If you don't have a union, here are some starting places:

MONEYTALKS

www.mjfreedman.org/moneytalks.html

Share stories, strategies and information with other library workers.

AFL-CIO

www.aflcio.org/home.htm and www.aflcio.org/voicesatwork/howto.htm

Start here to find labor contacts and read about the union agenda. Check out your State Federations and Central Labor Councils and identify what unions are active in your area (www.aflcio.org/unionand/statefed.htm).

Professional Employees AFL-CIO site

www.dpeaflcio.org/main.htm

Is it unprofessional to join a union? Will a union stifle individual achievement? How democratic are unions? Find the answers to these and other questions on the professional and technical workers' FAQs page.

See Appendix M for more resources on unions.

State Action Planning

State library associations or other library groups can take the lead in many types of pay equity activities. These include:

- Sponsoring information sessions, workshops and programs
- Forming a committee to address salary issues
- Conducting state surveys or polls to gauge the value placed by the public on library staff
- Operating a clearinghouse to share data, techniques and studies
- Developing a list of speakers or contacts for expertise and networking
- Sharing job descriptions or developing model descriptions
- Recommending a minimum salary
- Monitoring state bills on fair pay and working to pass relevant state and municipal legislation
- Joining coalition efforts to sponsor events such as Equal Pay Day
- Providing public relations materials and speaking

out on the value of libraries and library staff to public officials, legislatures, administrators, trustees and the media

State Initiatives

The **California Library Association** (CLA) (www.cla-net.org) has conducted a statewide survey to match library worker positions/pay with other worker positions/pay to demonstrate that library work is consistently under and unfairly compensated. The CLA Fair Compensation Campaign Task Force is creating a database of specific examples statewide and is working to ensure that administrators, elected and appointed officials, and the public understand the complexity and value of library work. (See "California Makes the Case for Pay Equity," by Anne Turner, *Library Journal*, Oct. 15, 2002, p. 42–44 or order full report "The Case for Fair Compensation for Library Workers: A Survey of Comparative Pay Levels in California" from CLA (infor@cla-net.org or (916) 447-7851). CLA is exploring alliances and partnerships, providing training, and has developed reports on the "Future of Librarianship" and "Competencies for California Librarians in the 21st Century."

The **New Jersey Library Association** (NJLA) (www.njla.org) is conducting a state salary survey and seeking to compare salaries to local municipal counterparts. Questionnaires were sent to all public librarians in the state, with additional questions for library directors and assistant/associate directors. Questions involved educational levels, experience, salary, benefits, number of working hours, technical requirements of the job, and other responsibilities. Library directors were also asked to gather data on salaries and working conditions for building inspectors, town administrators, directors of parks/recreation and civil engineers. A full report is expected in the spring of 2003. NJLA has developed competency statements, recommends minimum salaries, has held a recruitment summit, and is preparing additional salary advocacy guidelines and training.

The **Vermont Library Association** (VLA) (www.vermontlibraries.org) has researched comparable salaries for like positions in the private and public sector, increased board member awareness of the professional expectations for their librarians, the rate of and costs associated with turnover. VLA has developed power point presentations for trustees, showing salary comparisons, minimum wage, living wage, and teacher salary comparisons. A case was made that current pay for

librarians in small towns is not equal to the recommended livable wage for the state.

Living Wage and Other Low Income Movements

Library staff planning to work on raising the lowest wages among library employees can explore joining forces with community groups which are part of the nationwide Living Wage movement or efforts such as the one for recognition of the Family Economic Self-Sufficiency Standard. Both movements are gaining ground as supporters pressure public officials to raise the pay of workers paid with public funds.

In October 2001, the Central Arkansas Library System Board approved a living-wage policy that covers the CALS libraries in two counties and five cities, including Little Rock. As of July 2002, newly hired "regular" support staff (full-time and part-time) receive at least \$9 per hour, plus medical insurance. CALS also has a performance pay raise program, with extra funding for FY 2002-2003.

Library staff believe the Living Wage level will help decrease turnover problems and provide continued good customer service. Applications to fill vacancies have already increased noticeably. The policy also limits the library systems' ability to privatize existing services and encourages any contractors to pay the Living Wage. Other public employers in the Little Rock area are now being urged to adopt a similar Living Wage policy.

The Living Wage movement started in the religious community and now includes the labor movement and community action groups. A leading Living Wage nationwide group is ACORN (Association of Community Organizations for Reform Now) with a listing of living wage campaigns in various cities and other practical information at www.acorn.org/acorn10/livingwage/what.htm.

Formulas vary for calculating a specific area's Living Wage for a single person or family. The calculated wages needed often are reduced in the political struggle to enact a Living Wage requirement for government wages and/or those of employees of private sector companies which contract to provide government services, including janitorial service and other low-wage jobs.

The Family Economic Self-Sufficiency Standard has been calculated for each county in more than half the states, for seventy varieties of families. Several states have organizations working for increased use of the FESS. For more information, see www.sixstrategies.org.

Both of these movements' wage levels are usually above the wages paid to many library shelvers. Shelving work, like that of other library staff, is essential to the smooth operation of the library. It should be respected and appropriately remunerated, especially when considering typical wages for many non-library entry-level jobs that are predominantly held by men.

Full-time library clerical workers should definitely be paid enough to support themselves and a family, considering the complexity of their work and the fact that public funds are usually the source of their wages. If people at the lower end of the pay scale have improved salaries, everyone will benefit.

For more information, see:

AFSCME Living Wage (List of communities by state with living wage laws, overview of legal and technical issues) www.afscme.org/livingwage/.

American Federation of Labor and Congress of Industrial Organizations, Dept. of Public Policy. "Living Wage Laws: Answers to Frequently Asked Questions." Washington, D.C.: AFL-CIO, 2000. www.aflcio.org/articles/minimum_wage/living.pdf

Jobs with Justice. "News and Updates, 1999–2002" (Includes information on JwJ Living Wage campaigns at www.jwj.org)

Sklar, Holly, Laryssa Nykyta and Susan Wefald. *Raise the Floor: Wages and Policies That Work for All of Us*. New York: Ms. Foundation for Women, 2001.

Wider Opportunities for Women. "The Family Self-Sufficiency Project." Washington, D.C. www.wowonline.org and www.sixstrategies.org. (Collaborative state organizing effort; how much money working adults need to meet basic needs; costs of living by geographic location and family size).

No business which depends for existence on paying less than living wages to its workers has any right to continue in this country.

—Franklin Delano Roosevelt, U.S. President

Related Issues

Demonstrating Value

Along with many other institutions, libraries of all types are under increasing pressure to document the value of library services to their communities, campuses, or other constituencies.

Cost/benefit studies have confirmed that libraries have positive economic value. A case can be made for libraries providing social, cultural and educational benefits as well. A connection must also be made to demonstrate that quality staff is behind these services.

For example, saving time for clients is one example of the value performed by librarians. We can provide faster access to quality information because of our expertise in the organization of knowledge, as well as the newer technologies. Even on the Internet where much information is available, our expertise in search strategies saves time and elicits more relevant responses. Our information expertise is because of our academic studies, years of experience, continuous learning and professional development.

Most studies and reports discuss libraries as providing the services rather than the staff who is responsible for the quality services. However, two recent surveys conducted by the Silicon Valley Library System and the Urban Libraries Council, reflect the high value members of the public place on library staff and the assistance they provide. A 2002 poll of Americans found that 64 percent visited a public library in the last year. Of those, almost half (47 percent) say they consulted a librarian. The survey results can be found at www.ala.org/pio/presskits/nlw2002kit/krc_data.pdf. Studies in Colorado, Alaska and Pennsylvania have shown that students at schools with library media specialists score higher on reading and other standardized tests.

The Special Libraries Association has shown that cost and time savings can be demonstrated in corporations through the value added by information professionals. Calculating the return-on-investment compares cost data (e.g., budget, user time spent, other direct costs) with financial benefits (e.g., user time saved, savings in direct costs, decrease in new product development time). It may be easier in special libraries to calculate this than in other types of libraries, but all library staff can begin to determine how to measure value they add to services.

The ALA Presidential Task Force on the Status of Librarians has recommended that ALA develop or encourage the development of quantitative and qualitative measures to demonstrate the value that librarians bring to their communities, schools and

campuses. Until this is done, you might want to look at some of the studies on the value of library services and determine how best to connect the role of library workers in providing these services.

See Appendix L for useful resources on demonstrating value.

Recruitment Shortages

If librarianship is to recruit and retain highly motivated and educated individuals, the problem of low salaries must be addressed. More than half or 58 percent of librarians in the U.S. are projected to reach the retirement age of 65 between 2005 and 2019. Some 40 percent of library directors say they plan to retire in nine years or less.

The Institute of Museum and Library Services has proposed a \$10 million initiative for 2003 to recruit a new generation of librarians, but recruitment efforts can be successful only to the extent that the field offers competitive salaries. Starting offers for graduates with a bachelor's or master's degree in many other fields received considerably higher salaries in entry-level jobs compared to librarians.

For more information, see:

American Library Association. Association of College & Research Libraries. Recruitment, Retention, and Restructuring: Human Resources in Academic Libraries. Chicago: ALA, 2002. (www.ala.org/acrl/recruit-wp.html)

American Library Association. Office for Human Resource Development and Recruitment. "Careers in Libraries." Chicago: ALA. www.ala.org/hrdr/careers.html.

Central Jersey Regional Library Cooperative. "Become a Librarian." (Web site on education, employment, roles of librarians, plus guidelines for recruiting to the profession). www.becomealibrarian.com.

Institute of Museum and Library Services. "White House Proposed Initiative to Recruit and Educate Librarians." Washington, D.C. www.ims.gov/grants/library/lib_bdre.htm.

Lynch, Mary Jo. "Reaching 65: Lots of Librarians Will Be There Soon." *American Libraries* 33, no.3 (Mar. 2002): 55-56.

Medical Library Association. "Careers." (www.mlanet.org/career/index.html)

"Recruitment of Public Librarians, A Report to the Executive Committee of the Public Library Association, January 2000," *Public Libraries* 39, no. 3,

(May/June 2000): 168–72. Full report with appendix and bibliography: *Report to the Executive Committee of the Public Library Association: Recruitment of Public Librarians, January 2000*. See also www.pla.org/projects/recruitment.html.

Economic Hard Times

During difficult economic periods when library budgets are cut or frozen and staff layoffs are threatened, it may appear difficult to organize for equitable pay. At times like this, it's important to recognize there always will be cyclical funding fluctuations but that does not mean progress can't be made toward addressing inequities.

The Campaign for America's Librarians urges all libraries to adopt a pay equity policy that acknowledges the problems of pay discrimination. (See "President's Message," *American Libraries*, Dec. 2002, p. 7; also included in Appendix E). Gathering documentation to show inequities and updating job descriptions to accurately reflect responsibilities and competencies can be accomplished even during difficult funding cycles.

To establish the dimensions of the problem in the local setting, the library can conduct a comparable worth study that compares compensation of library workers to those of local workers having similar education, experience and qualifications. The library's management and governing officials should then develop a plan to address the inequities. It may take more than a year to rectify inequities, but an incremental, phased-in implementation can be part of the plan. Pay equity increases are generally 1 to 4 percent of total payroll.

The issue of rectifying salary inequities should be seen as part of the fight for a larger share of public and institutional monies for libraries, regardless of the economic environment. Critical steps include:

- Research and planning to document and solve problem areas
- Publicizing library services and the contributions of librarians and library staff
- Identifying the value of these services
- Developing a communication strategy
- Monitoring relevant legislation
- Working to improve standards

Public library funding is generally linked to growth or decline of tax revenues at the local level. In Kalamazoo (MI), the public library has tied total compensation (salaries and benefits) to the library's revenue growth (see

Library Journal, Oct. 15, 2002, p. 9–41). The property tax growth has averaged between 4 and 5 percent annually for seven years and salary ranges have increased between 2 and 6 percent, meeting or exceeding inflation. If revenues decline or if revenue is insufficient, salaries will not be reduced. Director Saul J. Amdursky affirms that a strong financial picture for the community should result in an improved revenue stream for the library.

When forced to trim library spending in summer 2002, Seattle Public Library director Deborah Jacobs chose to close the library for one week in late August and one week in December, periods of low usage. Because 77 percent of the library's \$34.7 million budget goes to staff salaries and benefits (13 percent above the national averages for staff spending), there was not much left to cut without diminishing services to the public. The materials budget has been historically low. Jacobs also opposed staff layoffs. The union reluctantly supported the two-week furlough plan, although it meant in effect reducing salaries by 4 percent.

Seattle Public's salaries for beginning librarians continue to be among the highest. Seattle Public pays beginning librarians \$46,500, which in five years, will climb to \$56,472 under the union contract, plus annual cost-of-living increases. In 2001, only King County (WA), San Francisco, and San Jose (CA) paid higher starting salaries. Says Jacobs, "I'm proud to be in a city where librarians are paid decently. I'll never back away from that."

Employee Turnover

Frequent turnover in staff may be an indication of the need for better compensation for library workers. Low salaries make retention of quality employees difficult and replacement costly. Frequent turnover also results in loss of productivity and higher operating cost due to increased need for recruitment, training and supervision.

Documenting the impact of low salaries on turnover rate may provide useful evidence in building the case for better salaries. To do this, you will need to document what salary was enough to hire staff away from your library.

Southern Methodist University Libraries demonstrated that an employee turnover study could be effective in addressing problems of understaffing and salary deficiencies in the early 1990s. The Vermont Library Association took this approach more recently to gain support for better pay, particularly for smaller, rural library director positions. The association has targeted trustees to educate them about the need for higher salaries to counteract frequent turnover.

For more information, see "Pay Equity in Libraries," Pastine, Maureen and Shirley McLean. *Bottom Line* 7, no. 1 (summer 1993): 7–12.

Certification

By showing evidence of continued growth and development of professional knowledge and experience, individuals can sometimes move to a higher pay range or position level and gain an increase in salary.

For those who have public library supervisory experience, the new ALA-APA Certified Public Library Administrator Certification Program should help individuals to demonstrate they have acquired a professionally recognized body of knowledge and expertise in public library administration.

Candidates will earn the CPLA designation through demonstrating public library supervisory experience, participation in a variety of professional development activities and proof of competency in nine core areas through testing, portfolio development and/or attendance at sanctioned educational events.

For more information, see:

American Library Association, *Post-Masters Certification, The ALA Institute for Professional Practice*
www.ala.org/hrdr/certif_proposal.html.

"Certified Public Library Administration Certification Program Overview." www.pla.org/projects/certification/certification.html and www.ala.org/hrdr.

ALA American Association of School Librarians (www.ala.org/aasl) or the National Board for Professional Teaching Standards (www.nbpts.org) (for information on the NBPTS certification and assessment process).

The Minnesota Voluntary Certification Program for Library Employees. Useful model for certification of support staff. Information on competencies, assessment process, courses, program application, and evaluation. www.arrowhead.lib.mn.us/certification.

Faculty Status and Other Strategies for Academic Library Workers

For many academic librarians, seeking faculty status is a strategy for fair pay. Librarians have not always been unified on the issue of faculty status, but they have advocated for the role of librarians in the educational process and that they receive benefits, privileges, rights and duties equal to those with faculty rank and tenure.

On the negative side, obtaining faculty status may require more committee work, more publishing and presenting, more graduate education, a lengthy tenure application process and other responsibilities. On the plus side, librarians with faculty status have a voice in contract negotiations and can fight to tailor tenure requirements to reflect the work they do, rather than the work of discipline faculty. They can also seek faculty status without tenure if that is a more accomplishable task in their community.

Although ALA's Association of College and Research Libraries (ACRL) has deemed the MLS a terminal degree, many colleges and universities have discriminated against librarians because of the lack of a doctorate. In addition, nearly 80 percent of academic librarians work a 12-month year,¹ rather than the nine months worked by their faculty colleagues.

Librarians without faculty status are often denied academic freedom protection and representation on faculty committees in campus governance. There are also many who have faculty status, but not tenure, a problem that impacts their equality on campus. The degree to which librarians become active in the faculty senate can be a factor. Size and type of institution may also affect salaries. Academic librarians in four-year institutions were generally the lowest paid category of public and academic librarians, according to the 2002 ALA Salary Survey.² Other workers in academic libraries also may receive salaries and benefits on a separate and unequal scale.

Get Help from Your Associations

Statements from professional associations can be used as leverage in seeking status for librarians on campus. ACRL supports faculty rank, status, and tenure for librarians and has adopted several guidelines to support this concept (see Appendix N). ACRL seeks to have these standards formally adopted or endorsed by college and university governing bodies, agencies that accredit institutions and other groups.

Included in the guidelines for faculty status is the statement:

Salaries and fringe benefits should be comparable to and within the range of those paid to faculty of equivalent rank. Salary scales should be adjusted in an equitable manner to contract period. All librarians should have written contracts or agreements consistent with institutional policy.

For libraries without faculty status, ACRL has guidelines for academic status that state “The salary scale and benefits for librarians should be the same as for other academic categories with equivalent education, experience, or responsibility.”

From an ACRL/AAUP Joint Statement:

College and university librarians share the professional concerns of faculty members. Academic freedom, for example, is indispensable to librarians because they are the trustees of knowledge with the responsibility of ensuring the availability of ideas, no matter how controversial, so that teachers may freely teach and students may freely learn.

Additional Options for Librarians and Support Staff

Other strategies for improving salaries, benefits and working conditions for academic library staff include:

- Organizing unions
- Becoming leaders in the union local if they are already organized
- Upgrading senior support staff to administrative status
- Comparing their salaries to those paid to information technology (IT) professionals and staff
- Comparing their salaries to those paid to discipline faculty, especially those with a master’s as the terminal degree
- Building coalitions with other campus groups
- Identifying the community’s living wage and pressuring the institution to pay it to all campus workers
- Demonstrating the libraries’ and library workers’ value to the academic community and educational goals
- Promoting awareness of library workers’ skills, training, and education
- Giving potential funders the opportunity to endow a librarian/library worker function the way they would the reference room or a particular collection, and the same way some professorships are named and endowed.

Unions representing academic library workers include:

- American Association of University Professors (AAUP), www.aaup.org

- American Federation of Teachers (AFT), www.aft.org/
- Coalition of University Employees (California) (CUE), www.cueunion.org/
- Canadian Union of Public Employees (CUPE), www.cupe.ca/
- National Education Association, (NEA), www.nea.org
- Service Employees International Union, (SEIU), www.seiu.org
- State faculty associations, i.e. United University Professors (UUP), www.uupinfo.org/
- UCW United Campus Workers, www.kornet.org/ucw/

Lothar Spang and William P. Kane conducted a survey comparing librarians with and without faculty status and with and without union representation. They found that union librarians had better benefits than their unaffiliated colleagues in nearly every category (tenure, promotion, faculty senate representation and pay scale).³

Librarians with Faculty Comparable Pay

Status	Rank	Union	Unaffiliated
Faculty	Faculty	70%	54%
Faculty	Librarian	59%	21%
Professional	Administrator	27%	17%
Other (acad. staff or multi-track options)		38%	32%

The following are benefits won by AAUP librarians. Other librarians can demand them at their own institutions:

- Vacation
 - Same as other faculty, but with protections for desk coverage
 - Option to work summers, for pro-rated salary or other arrangement
 - Banking of vacation days for overload pay
- Salary
 - Minimum set
 - Increment of annual increase
 - Across the board increase
 - Selective annual adjustment award
- Job description
 - Incumbent considered when making changes
- Tenure
 - Committee to include librarians
 - Rank assignment basis-tasks, responsibilities,

qualification requirements, experience, professional development, scholarly and service achievements.

- Contract termination, library closings
 - Grievance mechanisms
 - Hiring & seniority procedures
 - Conditions under which a library or department can be terminated
 - Librarians in unit must be consulted prior to decision.
- Support staff
 - Ratio to librarians
- Teaching
 - Additional compensation for teaching of for credit courses

Comparisons with Information Technology Staff

If faculty status is not possible, a comparison with campus IT professionals may be useful. IT workers have skills and responsibilities similar to librarians, but are often men. The director of a private college library in the state of New York, who also administers the IT department, reports that through her efforts, the IT staff and librarians now make comparable salaries. However, a position in IT requires only a bachelor's degree. That staff is both younger and made up of more men than that of the library. The director reports that much of her success in raising salaries results from developing an excellent relationship with the Human Resources department and a strong constituency on campus. She has also used turnover to her advantage. Rather than telling new hires that she couldn't give them the going rate, she did her best to meet their demand and then raised current staff members' salaries to keep them in line.

Comparisons to various levels of IT staff can also be useful for library support staff with similar technical experience and responsibility.

Role on Campus

In seeking equity, library workers need to communicate the value of their contributions at every opportunity.

What you can do:

- Report all accomplishments—conference presentations, publications, campus activities, etc. in the faculty/staff newsletter and student newspapers.
- Serve on campus committees and trumpet the libraries' resources—make sure colleagues know these resources don't just happen, that they are created, collected and maintained by library workers.

- Detail training workshops attended by library workers to the administration.
- Make sure the administration is aware of the skills, training, education and work experience of staff members.
- Create recognition opportunities for support staff such as the "Certificate of Achievement" offered by the New York State Library Assistants Association (NYSLAA), <http://nyslaa.org/certificateprog.html>, and publicize certification when it is achieved.

Library workers will need to tailor efforts to their own campuses—or even to whom they are speaking at any given time. Half the battle will be convincing colleagues and administrators to support the effort. Administrators can be reminded that their salaries will rise when workers' do. As for colleagues, there are surveys that demonstrate the salary, benefits and working condition improvements associated with faculty status. For further useful resources, see Appendix N.

Works Cited:

1. Hill, Janet Swan. "Wearing Our Own Clothes: Librarians as Faculty," *Journal of Academic Librarianship*, May 1994: 71–76.
2. Lynch, Mary Jo. "Librarian Salaries: Annual Increase Above National Average," *American Libraries* 33 no. 8 (September 2002): 93.
3. Spang, Lothar and William P. Kane. "Who Speaks for Academic Libraries," *College & Research Libraries*, September 1997.

Management Initiated Change

It is up to library managers to take a leadership role in educating their boards, city or county commissions, campus or corporate administrations about equitable pay for their staffs.

If the term "comparable worth" or "pay equity" raises a red flag, library managers can talk in terms of duties, responsibilities, skills and accomplishments in advocating adjustments based on these factors. Separating issues of parity and budget may be a strategy during discussions.

Managers are responsible for seeing that job descriptions are up-to-date and clearly reflect the work and level of expertise needed in providing quality services. Although library managers may sometimes feel caught between demands of staff and higher-ups, these

efforts can be more successful if the library staff and administration speak with one voice.

The National Committee on Pay Equity (NCPE) suggests that organizations and businesses can take the first step towards achieving pay equity by examining their pay practices to determine if they treat all employees equally. NCPE states that fair pay policies will help attract the best workers and promote a workforce that feels valued. Many employers do understand that paying employees fairly is a good business practice. Employers should understand that analyzing compensation data regularly is a useful tool to assure fairness in compensation practices. The analysis of this data may determine if there are patterns of discrimination in the workforce and help identify problems that can be corrected without complaints from staff or litigation. The U.S. Department of Labor Office of Federal Contract Compliance Programs offers guidance in analyzing such data (www.dol.gov/dol/esa/public/regs/compliance/ofccp/compdata.htm).

Negotiating Your Own Salary

When you apply for many library and information science jobs, the salary and benefits (compensation) package is open for negotiation. Remember that benefits (e.g., vacation, health, disability, retirement) can increase total compensation up to 35 percent and can be negotiated in addition to salary.

Current thinking is that the job applicant should not discuss salary and benefits issues until actually offered a job, but you should be prepared to make your case. In an article titled "Negotiating What You're Worth," the authors Deborah M. Kolb and Ann C. Schaffner offer the following good advice:

1. Know what you want.
2. Recognize your value and make it visible.
3. Be firm on what you need, but be flexible on how you get it.
4. Learn as much as you can.
5. Open negotiations in a way that makes the other person feel legitimate.
6. Be prepared to change the focus of negative or difficult questions.
7. Remember that "no" may only be just the beginning. Keep the door open for more dialogue.

They also point out that the responsibility for negotiating an appropriate compensation package has implications for not just you and your family, but also the budget/resources for your unit or department and the perception of both your worth and that of library services. It also affects the climate in which others will negotiate their compensation, both within the same workplace and with other employers.

Many books and articles are available to help prepare for negotiating your compensation, whether within a known range or in a situation where the employer does not tell the applicants what the anticipated range is. Some of the advice may seem artificial, but negotiating is a complex effort and deserves your skillful attention.

Many employers may not understand your particular skills and experience or even the services provided by library employees within a larger company. Before you can expect to get the compensation you deserve, you may need to provide information about your abilities and/or about current library and information science services and capabilities. You may also need to look at the salaries and other compensation of people working for the same employer at comparable levels in different occupations, especially "men's work" occupations.

You should also be alert for other opportunities to negotiate compensation and/or working conditions. These include your periodic performance evaluation or when you are asked to take on extra work, offered a promotion or special assignment. Your own situation can be negotiated and/or the budget, staffing, and roles of your work group.

Other chances to improve your work and/or compensation situation will probably become obvious once you are alert to the importance of focusing on these needs and working to address them with the appropriate people when timely.

See Appendix K for useful resources.

In the nonstop tsunami of global information, librarians provide us with floaties and teach us how to swim.

—Linton Weeks, *Washington Post*, Jan. 13, 2001

Don't Just Sit There

No one else will make our case for us. It's up to us as librarians and support staff to demonstrate and argue the value of what we do.

Tips to keep in mind:

- Be patient, reasonable and do your homework.
- Be persistent. Never, never give up.
- Do plenty of paperwork justification.
- Document, document, document!
- Become politically active.
- Be visible in the community or on campus.
- Make clearer the intellectual nature and complexity of our work.
- Identify allies.
- Keep hammering away at the fact that we're a service, not a product and must have good staff.

Source: Brill, Alison, Improving Compensation for Library Workers: Strategies, 1995. Chicago: American Library Association Office of Library Personnel Resources and Committee on Pay Equity.

What can I say? Librarians rule.

-Regis Philbin (*Who Wants to Be a Millionaire?*
Feb. 17, 2000)

Your Action Checklist

- ___ Learn more about the job classification system and salary setting process in my library.
- ___ Check my job description to determine if it is accurate and up-to-date.
- ___ Find out who the key officials and administrators are who make decisions on library worker salaries.
- ___ Think more about how to articulate what I do and how this contributes to providing quality services.
- ___ Explore with co-workers and library administration possible strategies for improving status and salaries.
- ___ Volunteer for any reclassification or job evaluation committee.
- ___ Review salary statistics that are relevant to my type of library and job and document inequities.
- ___ Look for possible pay equity coalitions within the community and state.
- ___ Become active in or help initiate state library association efforts to improve status and salaries.
- ___ Check current and pending state legislation on fair pay/pay equity to determine how library workers fit.
- ___ Contact my Congressional representative and senators for support of federal pay equity legislation.
- ___ Get involved with ALA advocacy campaigns.
- ___ Make certain support staff are included in pay-equity efforts.

The most important asset of any library goes home at night—the library staff.

—Father Timothy Healy
former president, New York Public Library

Bibliography

Pay Equity and Libraries

- Brey, Carol A. "Taking Our Salary Fight to the Streets," *Library Journal*, Apr. 2002.
- "Can Unions Solve the Low-Pay Dilemma?" *American Libraries* 33, no. 1 (Jan. 2002): 65–69.
- Farley, Yvonne Snyder. "Strategies for Improving Librarian Salaries," *American Libraries* 33, no. 1 (Jan. 2002): 56–59.
- Feld, Paulette. "Unions: Negotiating Change," *Library Mosaics* 11, no. 4 (July/Aug. 2000): 16–17.
- Kalan, Abby. "There Is No Honor in Being Underpaid," *American Libraries* 33 (Jan. 2002): 52–54.
- Kinnaly, Gene. "Pay Equity, Support Staff, and ALA," *Library Mosaics* 13, no. 2 (Mar./Apr. 2002): 8–10. www.mjfreedman.org/payequityss.pdf.
- Singer, Paula M. *Developing a Compensation Plan for Your Library*. Chicago: American Library Association, 2002. (Analyzing job functions, implementing plan, alternative pay plans, sample forms, etc.)

General Pay Equity

- Ames, Lynda J. "Fixing Women's Wages: The Effectiveness of Comparable Worth Policies," *Industrial and Labor Relations Review* 48, no. 4 (July 1995): 709+.
- Blau, Francine D., Marianne A. Ferber, and Anne E. Winkler. *The Economics of Women, Men, and Work*. 4th ed. Upper Saddle River, N.J.: Prentice Hall, 2002.
- Business and Professional Women/USA. "Fair Pay." 2001. Short but useful facts and practical strategies re: fair pay approaches, including federal and state legislation. www.bpwusa.org.
- England, Paula. "The Case for Comparable Worth," *Quarterly Review of Economics and Finance* 39 (1999): 743–55. Overview of research, political efforts, job evaluation, arguments for and against comparable worth.
- Evans, Sara M. and Barbara J. Nelson. *Wage Justice: Comparable Worth and the Paradox of Technocratic Reform*. Chicago: University of Chicago, 1989. Reviews Minnesota state pay equity efforts for public employees between 1983 and 1987 and also includes broader context of women and labor history, and pay equity policies.
- Fudge, Judy and Patricia McDermott, eds. *Just Wages: A Feminist Assessment of Pay Equity*. Toronto: University of

- Toronto Press, 1991. Variety of papers on experiences in Canada, Minnesota, and other countries, plus potential and limitations of pay equity strategies.
- Gardner, Susan E. and Christopher Daniel. "Implementing Comparable Worth/Pay Equity: Experiences of Cutting-Edge States," *Public Personnel Management* 27, no. 4, (winter 1998): 475–89. Experience of 8 states that have implemented comparable worth statutes: Connecticut, Iowa, Minnesota, Montana, New York, Oregon, Washington, and Wisconsin.
- Haignere, Lois. *Paychecks: A Guide to Conducting Salary-Equity Studies for Higher Education Faculty*. 2d ed. Washington, D.C.: American Association of University Professors, 2002. Joint project with United University Professions and AAUP to help understand gender and race bias and ways to remedy it.
- King, Mary, ed. *Squaring Up: Policy Strategies to Raise Women's Incomes in the United States*. Ann Arbor, University of Michigan, June 2001. (See sections on reducing negative impact of child rearing on women's incomes; raising pay for 'women's jobs', and moving women into higher paying work.)
- Levine, Linda. *The Gender Wage Gap and Pay Equity: Is Comparable Worth the Next Step?* Updated June 5, 2001. Washington, D.C.: Congressional Research Service Report for Congress, No. 98-278E. Lengthy overview of issues on both sides of debate; includes summary of Congressional legislative activities. www.house.gov/crstmp/98-278.pdf
- "A New Look through the Glass Ceiling: Where Are the Women? The Status of Women in Management in Ten Selected Industries." Data compiled by the U.S. General Accounting Office and analyzed by the staffs of Rep. John D. Dingell (D-MI) and Carolyn B. Maloney (D-NY); www.house.gov/maloney/issues/womenscaucus/glassceiling.pdf
- Weiner, Nan and Morley Gunderson. *Pay Equity: Issues, Options and Experiences*. Toronto: Butterworths, 1990. Emphasis on Canada but has explanation of general pay equity concepts, process for job evaluation, identifying gender bias, establishing wages, collective bargaining, etc., including glossary.

Additional resources are found at www.mjfreedman.org/researchwb.pdf. The Task Force welcomes suggestions for additional resources, strategies, and case studies.

Appendix A

ALA Policy #54.10 “Equal Opportunity and Salaries”

The American Library Association supports and works for the achievement of equal salaries and opportunity for employment and promotion for men and women.

The Association fully supports the concept of comparable wages for comparable work that aims at levels of pay for female-oriented occupations equal to those of male-oriented occupations; ALA therefore supports all legal and legislative efforts to achieve wages for library workers commensurate with wages in other occupations with similar qualifications, training, and responsibilities.

ALA particularly supports the efforts of those library workers who have documented, and are legally challenging, the practice of discriminatory salaries, and whose success will benefit all library workers throughout the nation.

Source: ALA Policy Manual

We cannot have good libraries until we first have good librarians—properly educated, professionally recognized, and fairly rewarded.

—Herbert S. White,
Library Journal, Nov. 15, 1999

Appendix B

ALA Creates Separate Body for Professional Advocacy

ALA News Release

For release: February 2002

At its annual Midwinter Meeting, the American Library Association (ALA) Council voted to establish a separate professional advocacy organization, the ALA-Allied Professional Association (ALA-APA).

The ALA and ALA-APA will have interlocking governance structures, but the ALA-APA will follow the federal tax rules governing a section 501(c)6 nonprofit trade or professional association. This tax status will allow the ALA-APA to conduct activities constrained by the ALA's 501(c)3 nonprofit (educational/charitable) status, including certification, recruitment, pay equity, status and salaries.

"ALA's current status allows us to speak on behalf of the millions of people who use libraries of all types," said ALA President John W. Berry. "It also allows us to raise funds as a charitable organization. But we need this new organization to aggressively address the serious professional concerns facing librarians now, notably recruitment, salaries and recognition."

The proposal to establish the new organization is a synthesis of recommendations from the Presidential Task Force on Recruitment, Presidential Task Force on Better Salaries and Pay Equity for Library Workers, Ad Hoc Task Force on the Status of Librarians, Committee on Education and other ALA standing committees.

"The issues of salary and pay equity have been longstanding priorities of library workers that ALA can finally address with the establishment of the 501(c)6," said ALA President-Elect Maurice J. (Mitch) Freedman. "The ALA-APA is part of an overall effort, the Campaign for America's Librarians, to empower America's library workers with the resources and skills that will enable them to advocate successfully for more equitable compensation."

Now ALA leadership has approved the formation of the ALA-APA, a taskforce is being formed that will define the roles and relationships between ALA and ALA-APA. For more information about the new organization and its development, please call Mary Ghikas at 800-545-2433, ext. 2518.

For more information, see www.ala-apa.org.

Librarians are very special people. They are the caregivers of the world of the mind, the nurturers of dreams and the defenders of truth. Perhaps no other profession is so marked by the singular generosity of its practitioners.

—Denver Post editorial, March 25, 2000

Appendix C

The Campaign for America's Libraries

The Campaign for America's libraries is a five-year initiative launched by ALA in 2000 to speak loudly and clearly about the value of libraries and librarians. The theme is @ your library™.

Based on research and crafted to target key audiences, the Campaign for America's Libraries aims to educate consumers that libraries are dynamic, modern community centers for learning, information and entertainment. The campaign provides a wealth of promotional tools for libraries of all types.

Key messages include:

- Libraries are changing and dynamic places.
- Libraries are places of opportunity.
- Libraries bring you the world.
- Librarians are the ultimate search engine.

Thousands of libraries in the U.S. and around the world have joined in this effort to get the word out.

For more information, see the campaign Web site at www.ala.org/@yourlibrary.

Appendix D

ALA Advocacy Resources

See the ALA Web site at www.ala.org/advocacy for a variety of resources to help you build support for libraries and library workers.

Publications

The Library Advocate's Handbook (Chicago: ALA, 2000)

Provides valuable tips and techniques for delivering the message about libraries and librarians. Print copies, \$2; quantity discounts available. Free when distributed as part of Library Advocacy Now! training programs. ALA Public Information Office, 50 E. Huron St., Chicago, IL 60611. Tel: 800-545-2433, ext. 5041/5044. Fax: 312-944-8520. E-mail: advocacy@ala.org. Available on online at www.ala.org/advocacy/.

Quotable Facts about America's Libraries, ALA Public Information Office

Pocket-sized cards with facts to drop at a moment's notice. Free copies are available from the ALA Public Information Office. Also see the ALA Web site at www.ala.org/advocacy/.

Speakers/Trainers

Advocating for Better Salaries and Pay Equity

During 2002–2003, the ALA Task Force on Better Salaries and Pay Equity for Library Workers will hold

various training for state library association representatives who can then be contact persons within their own states. You can also contact the task force for assistance with finding speakers and other resource people at www.mjfreedman.org/tffeedback.html.

Library Advocacy Now! Training

Workshops on how to organize advocacy campaigns, to be an effective spokesperson and conduct effective legislative advocacy are available to local, regional and state library groups at no or minimal cost (for travel). Programs also can be structured for special audiences such as trustees, support staff or Friends of Library. Contact the ALA Public Information Office, 50 E. Huron St., Chicago, IL 60611. Tel: 800-545-2433, ext. 5041/5044. Fax: 312-944-8520. E-mail: advocacy@ala.org. Available on online at www.ala.org/advocacy/.

Promotional Materials

ALA Graphics

Colorful posters, bookmarks and other items with positive messages about libraries and librarians can be purchased from the *ALA Graphics Catalog* or from the ALA Online Store at <http://alastore.ala.org>. To request a free catalog, call 800-545-2433, ext. 5046.

Appendix E

ALA President's Messages

The Campaign for America's Librarians

We all know that librarianship is a graying, underpaid profession and that as a predominantly female work force we are paid worse than people in male-dominated occupations. I ran for ALA president on a platform that promised to focus national attention and resources on the problem of low pay because I believe this situation must change.

ALA has been severely hampered by resistance to dealing with salary issues and fear about putting ALA's tax-exempt status in jeopardy. Now we have both the will and the way. The Allied Professional Association (APA), established by Council at the 2002 Midwinter Meeting (*American Libraries*, March, p. 77), will bring substantial resources to bear on such issues as pay equity, status, and certification. Most important, it provides a mechanism that will help us strongly advocate and lobby for library workers.

Empowering library workers

As ALA president-elect, I have worked hard to put in place a plan of action we call the Campaign for America's Librarians. I created a presidential Task Force on Better Salaries and Pay Equity for Library Workers that has developed training and resource materials to help empower library staff. The goal is to give our colleagues the help they need to individually and collectively advocate and fight for better pay. The 26-member task force is chaired by former ALA President Patricia Schuman, and includes library directors, an association executive, support staff, a trustee, union activists, retirees, and a number of frontline school, public, and academic librarians.

This campaign cannot succeed without your participation and grassroots support. Here's how you can help:

1. The task force has developed an advocacy tool kit and has trained presenters from around the country to offer local workshops on salary issues. Invite one of our trainers to present a workshop at your next conference or meeting.
2. Communicate with us. Tell us about your local efforts to gather salary and comparable-worth statistics, and your strategies for improving salaries. Let us know if you are aware of recent state activities.
3. Send us your case studies or examples of successful efforts to raise salaries (or information on efforts that were not successful). We also need individual stories

that can graphically illustrate how we can—and do—change lives with our services.

4. Use the campaign toolkit—full of facts, strategies, and ideas—and adapt it for your needs. We are also developing public-awareness and “@ your library” materials that focus on the people who work in libraries.
5. Be an outspoken and passionate advocate for libraries and library workers wherever and whenever you can. Whether at a cocktail party or giving a formal speech, work in the message and tell our story.

We must demonstrate to our users and funders that what we do has worth. Unless they have a better understanding of the value of what we do, their ears will be deaf to our salary demands.

Everyone loves libraries. Unfortunately, library workers can't continue to live on love alone. Our situation will not change unless we change. The objective of the Campaign for America's Librarians is to convince the public and decision-makers that library staff need to be paid fair and equitable salaries in the 21st century so that we, the people, can enjoy 21st-century information services. It will not be easy, but I am confident that by working together, using our collective power and the ALA-APA's commitment to our cause, we will succeed.

Information about the task force and a continuously updated and extensive library of resources are available at www.mjfreedman.org/tfhome.html.

Source: Maurice J. Freedman, *American Libraries* 33, no. 7 (Aug. 2002): 7.

America's Librarians Deserve Better Pay

A major daily newspaper columnist recently applauded a New Hampshire librarian for loving her work so much that after retirement she came in every day to do her old job as a volunteer. Why? She did it to save enough money for her small-town library to buy new books. Having enjoyed the rewards of being a librarian for more than 35 years, I can't say that I'm entirely surprised.

Like most librarians—and like the newspaper columnist who sang my colleague's praises—I love being in a profession that I don't just value for the paycheck. It's a great first or second career. But what troubles me and my fellow librarians—and should trouble everyone who loves libraries—is that too often libraries are forced to choose between paying seasoned, knowledgeable professionals the salaries that will retain them and adding

enough to their collections, hours, and online capacity to keep up with growing public demand.

The 2001 ALA survey of librarians' salaries found that overall average starting salaries for beginning librarians with master's degrees was a slim \$34,000. Compare that with the \$61,000 starting salaries for systems analysts or database administrators with master's degrees. Within seven years, nearly one in four librarians will be of retirement age. While library budgets struggle to maintain the funds needed to replace retiring workers, librarians question if they can even afford retirement.

That's why the Campaign for America's Librarians was kicked off at the 2002 ALA Annual Conference in Atlanta. The campaign is an intensive effort to promote the value of librarians and advocate better salaries and pay equity for all library workers in all types of libraries—school, academic, special, and public. This does not mean we will ignore such pressing issues as the Children's Internet Protection Act, U.S. Attorney General John Ashcroft's civil liberties incursions, the promotion of recruitment and diversity, and fighting the Uniform Computer Information Transactions Act and the Copyright Term Extension Act authored by the late U.S. Congressman Sonny Bono (R-Fla.).

It does mean that now—consistently and emphatically—we will remind the public and decision-makers about the enduring role of librarians and libraries and their continuing need for support. Our goal is to extend and build on the efforts of the very successful Campaign for America's Libraries, and to position libraries and librarians as vital to civil society and worthy of more support, higher salaries, and equitable pay. The Campaign for America's Librarians will bring to the forefront the fact that preeminent democratic institutions such as libraries don't just happen. Highly educated librarians and skilled library workers—unsung heroines and heroes who far too frequently are underpaid and under-recognized—run America's libraries.

It is time—in fact, way past time—that with a newly dedicated commitment, energy, and strength, we stand up and proclaim that: Libraries are valuable and vital institutions, crucial to the existence of our democracy. Librarians and library workers are out there on the front lines in the defense of our democracy. And the people who give libraries their vitality and value should receive compensation commensurate with their education, experience, and skills.

I hope my New Hampshire colleague's desperate act becomes a wake-up call to elected officials and corporate

and civic leaders. They must hear the message over and over again. If "we the people" want the 21st century information services we deserve, library workers must be paid 21st century salaries. Once and for all, we must take a stand, personally, collectively, and as the entire ALA body, saying, "No more! We are worth better salaries and we will demand them!"

Information about the Campaign for America's Librarians and the Task Force on Better Salaries and Pay Equity can be found at www.mjfreedman.org/tfhome.html.

Source: Maurice J. Freedman, *American Libraries* 33, no. 8 (Sept. 2002): 7.

Why Librarians?

Two Florida newspapers—the *Orlando Sentinel* and the *Orlando Weekly*—recently interviewed me about the Orange County Public Library's wish to replace librarians with people who can "train customers to use the Internet" (*American Libraries*, October 2002, p. 19). This was the third time the issue of deprofessionalization had arisen since I became ALA president. The first two originated in relation to two urban public libraries that were accused of wanting to replace some of the librarians with nonlibrarians. There are two different cases here—one concerns library administrators and the other deals with the public.

An Associated Press reporter questioned me about a taxpayer group that wants a referendum to close the Stevens County Rural Library District in Loon Lake, Washington (*American Libraries*, October 2002, p. 24). The reporter said the group decided that the library is no longer needed. In addition to its other services, the library district provides the only means of access to the Internet for much of the county's population—one of the poorest in the state.

Why do libraries need librarians? Why couldn't a mother who's raised children do the job of a children's librarian? Why can't someone who's gone to college and likes to read a lot help people find books and information they need? And anyone can match an ISBN in a book with an ISBN in the OCLC database, so why do we need librarians to catalog? With the onslaught of the Internet and the ready availability of commercial full-text databases, the chorus decrying the need for and continued existence of professional librarians has grown like a disease. We know how important our work is. But we have to let the world know.

A children's librarian knows how to help both the child and the parent find material appropriate for the

gifted child as well as the child with learning challenges. Knowing the appropriate sites on the Internet for each child and parent, maintaining working relations with teachers in local schools, and wisely selecting from the 5,000-plus children's titles published each year are just some of the responsibilities that demand a professional children's librarian. The reference interview demands the skill to determine what the patron wants even when the patron cannot articulate what nugget of information she or he really seeks. Reader's advisory helps the patron who is clear about what he or she wants to read, but doesn't know which authors or titles will satisfy that need.

And what about the great leveler—the librarian eliminator—the Internet? To whom does the helpless person appeal when confronted with thousands of hits on Google? Who knows what sites are legitimate, up-to-date, hoaxes, or appropriate for the needs of the user? Over two billion separate Web sites are out there, and metastasizing daily. The librarian can make sense of it all and proffer the lifesaver that will rescue the patron awash in the Web's inchoate and seemingly infinite sea.

I wasn't flippant when I told the Orlando Sentinel reporter that my 16-year-old son, Jesse, could teach someone how to search the Internet. So what? We need librarians because they will help the user evaluate and deal with what they retrieve. Jesse won't have a clue unless the query's about his favorite sports and music. The librarian will frame the query in a way that helps assure the success of the search. We also must recognize that in a declining economy the public library is more heavily used than at other times. Studies have revealed what public librarians have experienced since the dot-com bubble burst.

At an e-books conference in Washington last November, a publisher predicted the demise of the public library because of electronic publishing. One salient part of my response was, "Net Library—gone. Library library—still here." This is a cry for us to assert the value and need for the work we librarians do.

Source: Maurice J. Freedman, *American Libraries* 33, no. 9 (Oct. 2002): 7.

Send That Stereotype to the Smithsonian

As we pack up our Halloween displays, many of us find ourselves haunted by ghosts of past budget battles. Hard times are back and we must show the communities we serve what it's worth to acquire a lifetime love of reading, to find that nugget of information that leads to a new job, green card, or medical breakthrough.

We are grateful to all who credit us for finding their first mortgage, long-lost relative, or college scholarship. Unfortunately, that doesn't pay our bills. We're considered invaluable. Our contributions are called countless and priceless. Then, we're forced to moonlight or take in boarders to stock our pantries and to make ends meet.

For the better part of the past decade, most of us have transformed ourselves into highly skilled human search engines. We've mastered sophisticated knowledge-management skills to help our patrons with the information tsunami that pounds us all daily—while honing our storytelling skills. What's that worth?

On average, households headed by someone with a bachelor's degree enjoy annual incomes of \$71,400. Yet, ALA's 2002 Salary Survey (*American Libraries*, Sept. 2002, p. 93) found that in medium and large public and academic libraries, overall starting salaries for librarians with master's degrees were a slim \$35,051. Even in a household where both wage earners had MLS degrees, the household would not earn a total of \$71,400. Compare \$35,051 with an average \$61,000 salary for those with master's degrees who start as database administrators or systems analysts. Why are we the exception to that rule? In the next 12 years, nearly half of America's 125,000 librarians will reach retirement age. At this rate, many won't be able to afford to step down. For those who can, who'll be able to afford to take their place?

Fortunately, the Campaign for America's Librarians is off to a strong start. From National Public Radio to the Wall Street Journal, from the op-ed pages of scores of major daily newspapers to a national newspaper column, we're beginning to get ink and airtime. Each time we make news in communities from Peoria, Illinois, to Rochester, New York, from Newark, New Jersey, to Atlanta, I get e-mail messages from librarians who've gotten those stories into the hands of their community leaders and elected officials.

In Bedford Hills, New York, a library director showed the Labor Day pay-equity column, "Give Librarians the Credit—and Pay—They Deserve" (www.mjfreedman.org/creditanpay.html), to her board president, who enclosed it in the budget package to the town board. Librarians in West Virginia formed their own pay-equity task force. The California Library Association launched a three-year initiative to collect data about library salaries and to train members how to work for fair compensation. The New Jersey Library Association compiled a salary survey that could serve as a model.

If we're going to get fair compensation, the Campaign for America's Librarians will need every *American Libraries* reader—and all our neighbors, in-laws, patrons, and elected officials—to keep talking. It's five months until the 2003 observance of National Library Week in April. Let's make it impossible this year to open a newspaper, turn on the radio, or watch TV without hearing about fair compensation for our invaluable contributions. I urge you to help make this happen. Use the Better Salaries Toolkit (www.mjfreedman.org/tfhome.html), attend the Better Salaries Workshop during the 2003 ALA Midwinter Meeting in Philadelphia, and schedule one of our trainers to present a workshop at your chapter conference or local meeting.

I'd be honored to be remembered as the ALA president who retired the myth of the poor but proud librarian, and who sent that stereotype to the Smithsonian, where it belongs.

Source: Maurice J. Freedman, *American Libraries* 33, no. 10 (Nov. 2002): 7.

Now Is the Time for Better Salaries

In his October editorial (p. 41), the *American Libraries* magazine editor tried to sell the same tired argument that's been used to depress the salaries of library workers since time immemorial: Since library budgets are threatened and these are tough times, we must put aside our salary needs for the good of the library. But the editor also cited an Arkansas campaign that brought salaries up to \$35,000. Congratulations, Arkansas—a librarian would have to earn \$106,000 to have your buying power in New York City. Let's not forget that depressed library salaries have been as purposeful as the recruitment of women to the profession. In 1877, Justin Winsor said: "In American libraries we set a high value on women's work. They soften our atmosphere, they lighten our labour, they are equal to our work, and for the money they cost . . . they are infinitely better than equivalent salaries will produce of the other sex. We can command our pick of the educated young women."

Everywhere I've spoken about better salaries and pay equity—at 13 state and regional association meetings, six library schools, and elsewhere—I have been asked if hard times are the wrong times to advocate for equitable pay. To all of those who myopically advocate self-sacrifice, Barbara Ehrenreich said it best, "Let's stop this involuntary philanthropy."

The Campaign for America's Librarians advocates three steps: 1) Every library must recognize that library workers have been discriminated against in their pay. There is, and always has been, a pay-equity problem for all predominantly female professions. It will cost the library nothing to adopt a pay-equity policy. It costs NOTHING to acknowledge the problem. 2) The library should commission a comparable-worth study that will compare the compensation for library staff to that of local workers having similar education, experience, and qualifications. (If management won't do it, then the staff should.) This takes the issue from a national problem to the local reality. The Advocating for Better Salaries and Pay Equity Toolkit is being updated and will have additional information for libraries on how to conduct pay-equity studies. 3) Having established a pay-equity policy, and established the dimensions of the problem in the local setting, the library management, board, school, governmental, or campus authority should develop a plan that will address the inequity.

It is at this point, and ONLY at this point, that the library's finances are relevant. The library, using a methodology that will work best in its local context, should develop a plan to ameliorate—and eventually eradicate—the inequitable compensation of its staff, from the page to the director, as the data warrants. Whether it takes one, three, five, or more years, this plan should allocate specific sums of money, or establish formulas that would reallocate money from the overall library budget. It is not new or unusual to shift funds to meet priorities—it's done all the time. How quickly the library can redress this wrong will have to be determined locally, but inequities must be corrected. We can tolerate no more excuses. Library workers at all levels have sacrificed their pay for the good of the library for far too long. We must say, "No more."

Individually, collectively, through unions, staff associations, or on your own, do what works best in your library. You don't have to continue donating your pay, or your time, labor, and energy, and sacrificing personal and family needs to keep your library afloat. We must fight to change that old formula for poverty and dump the old cliché, *Better Salaries and Pay Equity NOW*.

(This column is dedicated to Miriam Braverman, a great librarian, and a lifelong fighter for social justice, 1920–2002.)

Source: Maurice J. Freedman, *American Libraries* 33, no. 11 (Dec. 2002): 7.

Appendix F

Sample Newspaper Opinion Piece

Other View: California's Librarians Are Long Overdue for a Raise

Maurice J. Freedman and Anne M. Turner—Special to the *Sacramento Bee*—(Published November 25, 2002)

From this fall's paid family leave legislation and dating back to Proposition 13, California has long initiated policy changes that make the rest of the country take notice. We librarians know this because we preserve, catalog and circulate history. This year, we hope to make some history ourselves by focusing on raising our salaries.

Library workers from throughout the state gathered in Sacramento the other day to discuss our future. Each year, more than 35 million men, women and children visit California's public libraries. We public-sector librarians serve serious readers and hobbyists, toddlers and graduate students, medical researchers and entrepreneurs, immigrants and senior citizens—anyone who brings us their questions, problems and dreams.

Like most of the country's 136,000 librarians employed in public, academic, school or special (corporate, medical and legal) libraries in the public and private sector, California's have reinvented themselves as highly skilled search engines. We have mastered the sophisticated knowledge-management skills needed to keep up with the waves of information that wash over us daily. We provide equal access to a world of resources as we bridge the digital divide for those who don't have Internet access otherwise available.

But in seven years, nearly one in four librarians in the United States will reach retirement age. Who will take our

place? It's hard to say when the skills we well-qualified candidates have mastered in the Internet age are hardly matched by our salaries.

According the American Library Association's 2002 salary survey of both the public and private sector, starting librarians—mostly women with master's degrees—earned just \$35,000, compared with starting systems analysts or database administrators, mostly men with master's degrees, whose starting salaries, at \$61,000, were nearly double.

The California Library Association uncovered a similar pattern in a statewide survey. At every level of service, the library workers earn less than employees in comparable public jobs, such as city planners or civil engineers. The disparity between average starting salaries for library and non-library public employees ranged from \$3,200 to \$12,500.

State library directors, with a required master's degree, are paid less than parks and recreation or child support services directors, where education beyond a bachelor's degree is not required. Perhaps that is because civil engineers and city planners are predominantly men, and their work is valued by most elected officials.

Californians cannot continue to claim they value libraries while underpaying the staff. Today, we serve more people than ever for less than the cost of one hardcover novel per capita—divide the state's library budgets by the number of people served and the answer is \$25. In a state with some of the nation's highest housing costs, California's library workers cannot continue to live on love alone—just ask our landlords.

Appendix G

Sources of Salary Data/Survey/Statistics

Listed below are some salary surveys that might be of assistance in documenting your situation. Note many are annual or biennial, so make certain you know from what time period the salary data are and check the source for any later data that may become available. Make certain you understand the methodology, definitions, and any other relevant factors used in collecting and analyzing the data. Check also with your state library or library association for surveys done within the state.

American Association of Law Libraries

Biennial Salary Survey and Organizational Characteristics, 2001 (Chicago: AALL, 2001)

Detailed report for sale providing variety of salary information for law library positions, including support staff, by geographical area, educational level, gender, ethnicity, experience, type of organization. AALL members may view data online at www.aallnet.org.

American Library Association/Public Library Association/
Public Library Data Service

Statistical Report 2001, Special Section: Finance Survey (Chicago: ALA PLA, 2001)

Data from 736 public libraries includes salaries for directors and beginning librarians, plus total salary expenditures and salaries as a percentage of expenditures. Individual library listings as well as aggregate data are included in categories by population served.

American Library Association. Support Staff Interests Round Table

"ALA SSIRT Task Force on Compensation Final Report, June 2000," (Chicago: ALA, 2000)

www.ala.org/ssirt/compensa.pdf

Association for Library and Information Science Education

Library and Information Science Education Statistical Report

www.ils.unc.edu/ALISE/

Annual report includes salary data for library and information science education faculty.

Association for Research Libraries

ARL Salary Survey (Washington, D.C.: ARL, annual)

www.arl.org/stats/salary/index.html

Bibliostat and Bibliostat Connect

www.bibliostat.com; information on www.biblio-tech.com

Data files from Dynix Library Management system, including salary data. Commercial service, subscription required.

Colorado State Library

Colorado Library Research Service

www.lrs.org

Has variety of fact sheets, including some salary data. Primarily Colorado emphasis but some national information and links to other national and state sites.

College and University Professional Association for Human Resources

Mid-Level Administrative/Professional Salary Survey (Washington, D.C.: CUPA-hr, annual)

Economic Research Institute

The Geographic Reference Report 2002: Annual Report of Costs, Wages, Salaries, and Human Resource Statistics U.S. and Canada, 16th annual ed. (Redmond, Wash.: 2002)

Median base salaries for librarians along with other occupations. Commercial service site www.eri.com has additional information not found in print version for a variety of library worker job titles and geographic areas. Compiles salary data from numerous government and private surveys.

Fox, Charlie and Raymond Roney

"Library Support Staff Salary Survey," *Library Mosaics*. 11, no. 4 (July/Aug. 2000): 8–12

Lynch, Mary Jo

ALA Survey of Librarian Salaries (Chicago: ALA, annual)

National data on academic and public library salaries by region and level of responsibility. Includes appendix listing of national salary surveys from other organizations. See summary in *American Libraries*, Sept. 2002, p. 94. This is annual compilation so past years are also available.

"Salaries of Municipal Officials, 2001" in *The Municipal Yearbook, 2002* (Washington, D.C.: International City/County Management Association, 2002)

Chief public librarian salaries included with other city department heads.

Sandstedt, Carl R.

Salary Survey: West-North-Central States, St. Charles City County Library District

[www.win.org/library/library_office/reports/St. Peters, Mo](http://www.win.org/library/library_office/reports/St.Peters,Mo)
Annual survey for various professional and support staff positions for public libraries, reported by size of budget.

Special Libraries Association

Annual Salary Survey (Washington, D.C.: SLA, annual)
Summary highlights at www.sla.org/content/memberservice/researchforum/salariesurveys/salsur2001/index.cfm. Full report for sale.

Terrell, Tom

"Pay and Job Variety Both Increase in Spite of Tough Economy," *Library Journal* 127 (Oct. 15, 2002): 30–36
Annual survey of LIS graduate placements and salaries.

Weise, Frieda O. and Thomas D. McMullen

"Study to Assess the Compensation and Skills of Medical Library Professionals Relative to Information Technology Professionals," *Bulletin of the Medical Library Association* 89, no. 3 (July 2001): 249–62
www.mlanet.org/pdf/study_89_3.pdf

The Bureau of Labor Statistics has a variety of resources that include library worker data and other professions and occupations for comparison purposes. These include:

National Compensation Survey 2000, Table 2-1, "United States, selected occupations: Mean hourly earnings and weekly hours for full-time and part-time workers"
www.bls.gov/ncs/ocs/sp/ncbl0392.pdf

See this table under "Administrative support" for "Library Clerks" and under "Professional specialty" for "Librarians" on pages 8 and 10. Table 2-2 repeats the occupational information for private industry on pages 17 and 19. Table 2-3 has the same structure for state and local governments on pages 26 and 27.

National Compensation Survey 2000, Supplementary Tables
www.bls.gov/ncs/ocs/sp/ncbl0402.pdf

These tables show wages in percentiles. Using the tables makes it possible to see national data for salaries of selected occupations (including "librarians" and "library clerks") by mean, median, and selected percentiles.

Occupational Employment Statistics: 2000 National Industry-Specific Occupational Employment and Wage Estimates, SIC 823—Libraries

www.bls.gov/oes/2000/oesi3_823.htm (Libraries)

This site provides national estimates of wages (mean hourly, mean annual, and median hourly) and the number of persons employed by tile within industry group. Each listed occupation also has a direct link to a job description. This tool shows estimated employment and wage statistics for occupations within the industry. For example, Security Guards, Financial Managers and Public Relations Specialists and the wages for these jobs within the "Libraries" industry are given. At the same time, library occupations can be found under other industry groups—for example, under "Commercial Banks."

Occupational Employment Statistics: 2000 Metropolitan Area Occupational Employment and Wage Estimates

www.bls.gov/oes/2000/oessrcma.htm#N Metropolitan Areas

This tool provides employment numbers and wages (median hourly, mean hourly, mean annual) by occupation for geography below the national level, including States and Metropolitan Statistical Areas; Library Science Teachers, Postsecondary are SOC # 25-1082; Librarians are #25-4021; Library Technicians are #25-4031; Library Assistants, Clerical are #43-4121.

Occupational Employment Statistics: 2000 National Occupational Employment and Wage Estimates

www.bls.gov/oes/2000/oes254031.htm (Library Technicians); www.bls.gov/oes/2000/oes434121.htm (Library Assistants, Clerical); www.bls.gov/oes/2000/oes254021.htm (Librarians)

Provides the number of persons employed by job title, mean hourly, mean annual wage, and percentile; also provides a job description.

Occupational Outlook Quarterly: Winter 2000–01, **"Librarians: Information Experts in the Information Age"** by Olivia Crosby

www.bls.gov/opub/ooq/2000/winter/art01.pdf

The economic outlook, on pages 9 and 10, includes three charts: "Librarian employment, by industry, projected 2008"; "Librarian employment growth in selected industries, projected

1998–2008”; “Librarian average starting salaries, by type of worker, 1998.

Household Data Annual Averages: These tables are produced by the Census Bureau for the Bureau of Labor Statistics and are a part of the Current Population Survey www.bls.gov/cps/cpsaat39.pdf

Table 39, “Median weekly earnings of full-time wage and salary workers by detailed occupation and sex.” This table gives, for 2001, the number librarians by gender and the median weekly earnings. (Note: earnings for men were not reported because the number of men was below the statistical threshold of 50,000 persons.) This information is also given for library clerks.

Moncarz, Roger and Azure Reaser

The 2000-2010 Job Outlook in Brief: Occupational Outlook Quarterly, Spring 2002

www.bls.gov/opub/ooq/2002/spring/art01.pdf

Note: See pages 18 and 19 for Librarians and Library technicians and page 31 for Library assistants, clerical. For library assistants, the following statement is given under Employment Projections: “Efforts to contain costs in local governments and academic institutions will result in a preference for hiring library support staff instead of librarians. Good job prospects are expected.”

Occupational Outlook Handbook, 2002–2003

www.bls.gov/oco/home.htm

Arlene Dohm

“Gauging the labor force effects of retiring baby-boomers,” *Monthly Labor Review*, July 2000

www.bls.gov/oco/home.htm

This article lists librarians as one of the occupations with the highest percentage of workers aged 45 years and older (Table 1). In 1998 56.5% of

employed librarians were 45+. Librarian retiree replacement needs projected for 1998–2008 were calculated to be 50,000 persons (Table 5).

Hecker, Daniel E.

“Occupational Employment Projections to 2010,” *Monthly Labor Review*, November 2001

www.bls.gov/opub/mlr/2001/11/art4full.pdf

Table 2 gives projections for librarians with total job openings due to growth and net replacements.

America’s Career InfoNet

www.acinet.org/acinet/

This Web site brings many statistical sources together. U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics information is presented as well as state and local information. For example, wages for librarians in the U.S. and by state are given and an “Occupation Report-Wage Comparison” lists states in rank order by the median wage for librarians; methods are provided to compare wages against those of five other occupations by local area (city). (Note: The amount and quality of information varies by state.)

To find additional salary data for various occupations, the following Web sites might be of assistance: <http://jobstar.org/tools/sal-surv.htm>; www.wageweb.com; www.HRPlaza.com/hr_links/salary.html; www.workindex.com (click Salary Wizard; also see Compensation—salary statistics); and www.abbott-langer.com. The Riley Guide, “Salary Guides and Guidance” (www.rileyguide.com/salguides.html) gives links to various salary surveys and also gives guidance on evaluating salary information in the surveys. The National Association of Colleges and Employers has salary data for graduates in various fields for its members, although some summary data is available at www.naceweb.org.

Appendix H

Job Evaluation Resources

AFSCME

"We're Worth It!" (Washington, D.C., 1998)

www.afscme.org/wrkplace/worth02.htm

Practical strategies, information on job evaluation approaches, countering arguments, union activities.

Haignere, Lois

"Comparable Worth," in *International Encyclopedia of Public Policy and Administration*, ed. by Jay Shafritz (Boulder: Westview, 1998) vol. 1: 449–56

Overview of process for gender-neutral job evaluation methodology and measuring female job content.

Kenady, Carolyn

Pay Equity: An Action Manual for Library Workers (Chicago: ALA, 1989)

Describes process of identifying sex-based wage discrimination, conducting job evaluation studies, preparing reports and a pay equity campaign.

Quinn, Jennifer M.

"Visibility and Value: The Role of Job Evaluation in Assuring Equal Pay for Women," *Law and Policy in International Business* 25, no. 4 (summer 1994): 1403–44

Compares UK, US and Ontario systems for assessing whether gender-based pay discrimination exists; advocates comprehensive

gender-neutral job evaluation programs to make skills, effort, and responsibilities required by predominantly female jobs visible, recognized, and adequately compensated.

Steinberg, Ronnie J.

"Emotional Labor in Job Evaluation: Redesigning Compensation Practices," in Special Issue "Emotional Labor in the Service Economy," eds. Ronnie J. Steinberg and Deborah M. Figart, *The Annals of the American Academy of Political Science* 561 (January 1999): 143–57

Job evaluation systems often fail to recognize human relations and communication skills, emotional effort, and responsibility for client well-being in many predominantly female jobs. Other articles in journal issue discuss contact with people and emotional labor in other areas of work.

Steinberg, Ronnie and Lois Haignere

"Equitable Compensation: Methodological Criteria for Comparable Worth," in *Ingredients for Women's Employment Policy*, ed. by C. Bose and G. Spitze (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1987), 157–82

Discusses job content often overlooked in predominantly female jobs and suggestions for incorporating gender equity concerns into job evaluation process.

Appendix I

Resources for Competencies and Roles of Staff

American Association of Law Libraries

"Competencies of Law Librarianship" (Chicago: AALL, 2001)

www.aallnet.org/prodev/comptencies.asp

American Library Association

"Library and Information Studies and Human Resource Utilization" (Chicago: ALA, 2002)

www.ala.org/hrdr/lepu.pdf

American Library Association

Task Force on Core Competencies, **"Draft Statement"** (Chicago: ALA, 2002)

www.ala.org/congress/draft.html

American Library Association/Association for Library Services to Children

Competencies for Librarians Serving Children in Public Libraries (Chicago: ALA, ALSC, 1999)

American Library Association/Young Adult Services Association/Professional Development Center

"Young Adults Deserve the Best: Competencies for Librarians Serving Young Adults" (Chicago: ALA, 1998)

www.ala.org/yalsa/profdev/competencies.html

Association of Research Libraries

Changing Roles of Library Professionals, SPEC Kit 256 (Washington, DC: ARL, 2000)

Association of Southeastern Research Libraries

"Shaping the Future: ASERL's Competencies for Research Librarians." 2000

www.aserl.org/statements/competencies/competencies.htm

Crosby, Olivia

"Librarians: Information Experts in the Information Age," *Occupational Outlook Quarterly* 44, no. 4 (winter 2000–01)

www.bls.gov/opub/ooq/2000/winter/art01.pdf

Primarily for career information, but provides information on what librarians do that might be useful in educating public officials, etc.; See also information from Occupational Outlook Handbook on "Librarians" and "Library Technicians"; www.bls.gov/oco/oco1012.htm and www.online.onetcenter.org.

"Librarians in the 21st Century"

www.istweb.syr.edu/21stcenlib/

Web site compiled by Syracuse University's School of Information Studies students, 2000

New Jersey Library Association

"Core Competencies for Librarians," "Technical Competencies for Librarians," "Reference Competencies for Librarians"

www.njla.org

Special Libraries Association

"Competencies for Special Librarians of the 21st Century" (Washington, D.C.: SLA, 1996)

www.sla.org/content/SLS/professional/meaning/comp.cfm

Appendix J

Neutrality Agreement Sample

Respect for Workers' Choices

Every working person in America has the right to form or join a union to improve his or her life. It is a decision that rightfully belongs to workers, not their employers, and one that workers are entitled to make freely and without fear of reprisals.

Respecting the freedom to form a union is essential to establishing a cooperative, mutually beneficial relationship between employers and their employees. It is the foundation of a partnership between employers and their employees. It is the foundation of a partnership that works to achieve common goals such as high productivity, quality work, safe working conditions, and decent living standards.

Therefore, the undersigned [employer's name] and the [name of union] hereby pledge to honor and respect the right of employees to decide for themselves whether to form a union free of intimidation, harassment or retribution by endorsing the following principles and code of conduct.

The employer will allow employees to express their opinions freely and openly, without taking any action to discipline, harass, humiliate or fire any employee for his or her pro-union views or activities. The employer will refrain from engaging in any activity, written or verbal, designed to interfere with an employee's free choice to join a union.

The employer will provide union supporters equal time at any meeting employees are required to attend and/or where unions are discussed. The employer will allow union supporters the same opportunity as the employer to distribute or post campaign material at the worksite.

The union and the employer shall present accurate information and will not make false or misleading statements designed to confuse or mislead employees. The employer will immediately grant recognition and begin negotiations for a union contract when a majority of employees demonstrates the desire for union representation, whether by signing cards or a petition or through an election.

For the employer:

Signed _____ Date _____

For the union:

Signed _____ Date _____

Source: Unions Working Group of the ALA Task Force for Better Salaries and Pay Equity for Library Workers.

Appendix K

Resources for Negotiating Your Own Salary

Holliday, Patricia Cole, Janet McNichol, and Arlene Pietranton

“Getting What You’re Worth: Valuable Lessons”

<http://professional.asha.org/careers/loader.cfm?url=/commonspot/security/getfile.cfm&PageID=9754>
American Speech and Hearing Association provides guidance on negotiating salaries for its members but is useful for other professions.

Kolb, Deborah M. and Ann C. Schaffner

“Negotiating What You’re Worth,” *Library Journal* 125 (Oct. 15, 2001): 52–53

Krannich, Ronald L. and Caryl Rae Krannich

Dynamite Salary Negotiations: Know What You’re Worth and Get It! 3d ed. (Manassas Park, Va.: Impact, 1998)

McCarty, Jennifer E.

“How to Get More Money: Tips on Salary Negotiations,” *Footnotes* 21, no. 1 (Jan. 2002)

“Negotiating Tips”

www.myjobsearch.com/cgi-bin/mjs.cgi/neotiating/tips.html
Links to articles on refining negotiating skills.

Pinkley, Robin L. and Gregory Northcraft.

Get Paid What You’re Worth (New York: St. Martins, 2000)

The Riley Guide

“Job Offers: Evaluating and Negotiating”

www.rileyguide.com/offers.html
Links to articles and other materials on topic.

“Salary Negotiation Strategies”

<http://jobstar.org/tools/salary/negostrt.htm>
Lists selected web sources and books on tips for negotiating salaries.

Appendix L

Resources for Demonstrating Value

- American Library Association
Special Presidential Task Force, Recommendations, 2001
www.ala.org/hrdr/status.html
- American Library Association
@your library™: Attitudes Toward Public Libraries
www.ala.org/pio/presskits/nlw2002kit/krc_data.pdf
National survey conducted by KRC Research & Consulting, 2002.
- Colorado State Library, Library Research Service
"LRS School Library Media Impact Studies"
www.lrs.org/html/about/school_studies.html
- Cram, Jennifer
"Practicality: How to Acquire It," In *On the Edge: Proceedings of the Seventh Asian Pacific Special, Health and Law Libraries Conference Held in Perth 12–16 Oct. 1997*, pp. 23–32 (Perth: Australian Library and Information Association: 1997)
www.alia.org.au/~jcram/practicality.html
- Griffiths, Jose-Marie and Donald W. King
Special Libraries: Increasing the Information Edge (Washington, D.C.: Special Libraries Association, 1993)
Evidence of usefulness, value, and impact of information and contribution libraries make.
- Holt, Glen
"Placing a Value on Public Library Services," *Public Libraries*, Mar./Apr. 1999: 89–108
See also Holt, Glen E., Donald Elliott, and Amonia Moore. "Placing a Value on Public Library Services, 1998," on www.slpl.lib.mo.us/libsrc/restoc.htm. St. Louis Public Library applied a variety of economic concepts to valuing public investment in library services. See also expanded cost-benefit analysis applied to other libraries, "Development of a Portable Cost Benefit Methodology for Urban Libraries, 1998–2000" at www.slpl.lib.mo.us/libsrc/dev.htm.
- Holt, Glen E. and Donald Elliott
"Proving Your Library's Worth: A Test Case." *Library Journal* 123 (Nov. 1, 1998): 42–44
Cost-benefit analysis measurement tools can help library managers learn more about how well their libraries are serving users.
- Jones, Patrick
"Why We Are Kids' Best Assets," *School Library Journal* 47, no. 11 (Nov. 2001): 44–47
How youth services librarians help youth engage in positive developmental behaviors.
- Kassel, Amelia
"Practical Tips to Help You Prove Your Value," *MLS-Marketing Library Services* 16, no. 4 (May/June 2002)
www.infoday.com/mls/May02/kassel.htm
- Lance, Keith Curry, Marcia J. Rodney and Christine Hamilton-Pennell
How School Librarians Help Kids Achieve Standards: The Second Colorado Study (Denver: Colorado State Library, 2000)
www.lrs.org/documents/lmcstudies/CO/execsumm.pdf
See also "What Research Tells Us About the Importance of School Libraries" by Keith Curry Lance (www.ims.gov/pubs/whitehouse0602/keithlance.htm) and "Capitalizing on the School Library's Potential to Positively Affect Student Achievement" by Dr. Gary Hartzell (www.ils.gov/pubs/whitehouse0602.whitehouse.htm)
- Marshall, Joanne
"The Impact of the Hospital Library on Clinical Decision-Making: The Rochester Study," *Bulletin of the Medical Library Association* 80 (Apr. 1992): 169–78
Value of information provided by the library.
- Marshall, Joanne
The Impact of the Special Library on Corporate Decision-Making (Washington, D.C.: Special Libraries Association, 1993)
Study of 390 managers who used special libraries in financial institutions in Toronto, Canada.
- Marshall, Joanne
"Determining Our Worth, Communicating Our Value," *Library Journal* 125 (Nov. 15, 2002): 28–30
- McClure, Charles R. et al
"Economic Benefits and Impacts from Public Libraries in the State of Florida," Tallahassee, FL: Florida State University Information Use Management and Policy Institute, 2001
Survey of library patrons about their perceptions of the economic benefits and impacts of public
-

libraries. <http://dlis.dos.state.fl.us/bld/finalreport/>
or www.iifsu.edu/projects.

Rodger, Eleanor Jo

"Value and Vision," *American Libraries*, v. 33, Nov. 2002:
50–54

Silicon Valley Library System

"Millennium Library Survey," 2000

www.svls.lib.ca.us/godbe/report.pdf

Compares public attitudes and use of the Internet,
bookstores and libraries.

Special Libraries Association

***President's Task Force on the Value of the Information
Professional*** (Washington, DC: SLA, 1987)

Urban Libraries Council

Impacts of the Internet on Public Library Use

[www.urbanlibraries.org/Internet%20Study%20Fact%20
Sheet.html](http://www.urbanlibraries.org/Internet%20Study%20Fact%20Sheet.html)

Indicates that public find librarians more helpful
than Internet help lines.

During the internet age, we've forgotten that professional librarians know how to find information better than anyone—especially better than computer programmers. Though at the beginning of the Web era in 1993, librarians did not have the computer and Web development skills to show their muscles, they do now.

—John C. Dvorak, "Straw Poll Dept.," *PC Magazine*,
Sept. 24, 2002.

Appendix M

Resources for Unionizing

Auld, Hampton (Skip), ed.

"The Benefits and Deficiencies of Unions in Public Libraries," *Public Libraries* 41, no. 3 (May/June 2002): 135–42

Nine articles from various library managers and union representatives.

"Can Unions Solve the Low-Pay Dilemma?" *American Libraries* 33, no.1 (Jan. 2002): 65–69

Feld, Paulette

"Unions: Negotiating Change," *Library Mosaics* 11, no. 4 (July/Aug. 2000): 16–17

Garcha, Rajinder and John C. Phillips

"U.S. Academic Librarians: Their Involvement in Union Activities," *Library Review* (Glasgow, Scotland) 50, no. 3 (2001): 122–27

Johnson, Cameron A.

"Library Unions: Politics, Power, and the Care of the Library Worker." *Alki* 17, no. 3 (Dec. 2001): 16–19
Washington Library Association journal.

Wood, Deanna D.

"Librarians and Unions: Defining and Protecting Professional Values," *Education Libraries* 23, no. 1 (1999): 12–16

Unions/Collective Bargaining

AFL-CIO

Various fact sheets ("**Strategies for Achieving Equal Pay,"** "**The Case for Equal Pay,"** "**Pay Gap by Occupation,"** "**Equal Pay for Working Families**") Washington, D.C.
www.aflcio.org/women

Examples of union efforts and tips for bargaining, some statistics.

AFSCME

"We're Worth It!" (Washington, D.C., 1998)
www.afscme.org/workplace/worth01.htm

Practical strategies, information on job evaluation approaches, countering arguments, union activities.

American Federation of Teachers

"Sample Contract Language from AFT Contracts by Topic Family Issues and Benefits: Pay Equity"
www.aft.org/research/models/language/family/payequal.htm

Canadian Union of Public Employees

See www.cupe.ca, then click "campaigns" and "**women's wages**" for bargaining strategies. See also www.cupe.bc.ca for British Columbia union, click "campaigns" and then "**pay equity.**" Includes lengthy report, "**Working through the Wage Gap**" by the Task Force on Pay Equity; reviews sex-based wage disparities in Canada, legislative framework in Canada, general information on pay equity, and recommendations for reform.

Hallock, Margaret

"Pay Equity: What Is the Best Union Strategy?" *Labor Studies Journal* 25, no. 1 (spring 2000): 27–44

Review of Oregon public employee union in 1980s, difficulties in job evaluation systems, suggests future emphasis on economic justice and policies to boost minimum wage, living wage, and entry level salaries. See also "**Pay Equity: Did It Work?**" www.uoregon.edu/~lerc/research/pay_equity.html.

Haignere, Lois

Paychecks: A Guide to Conducting Salary-Equity Studies for Higher Education Faculty, 2d ed. (Washington, D.C.: American Association of University Professors, 2002)

Joint project with United University Professions and AAUP to help understand gender and race bias and ways to remedy it.

Hirsch, Barry T. and David A. MacPherson

Union Membership and Earnings Data Book: Compilations from the Current Population Survey, annual edition (Washington, D.C.: Bureau of National Affairs)

Variety of tables showing U.S. workers' union status. Includes several tables by industry and occupation, which include libraries and librarians.

Institute for Women's Policy Research. "**Equal Pay for Working Families**" (Washington, D.C.: IWPR, June 1999)
www.iwpr.org

"Research-in-Brief" paper discusses wage gap and shows union representation increases pay.

U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics

"Median Weekly Earnings of Full Time Wage and Salary Workers by Union Affiliation, Occupation and Industry"
www.bls.gov.news.release/union2.to4.htm

Appendix N

Resources for Faculty Status and Other Strategies for Library Workers

American Association of University Professors
Paychecks: A Guide to Conducting Salary-Equity Studies for Higher Education Faculty
www.aaup.org/catalogue/01Payad.htm

American Association of University Professors
"Disparities in the Salaries and Appointments of Academic Women and Men"
www.aaup.org/Issues/WomeninHE/Wrepup.htm

Association of College and Research Libraries (ACRL)
"Guidelines for Academic Status for College and University Librarians" 2002.
www.ala.org/acrl/acstatus.html

ACRL
"Joint Statement on Faculty Status of College and University Librarians"
www.ala.org/acrl/guides/facstat.html

ACRL
"Statement on the Terminal Professional Degree for Academic Librarians"
www.ala.org/acrl/guides/termdegr.html

ACRL Committee on the Status of Academic Librarians.
"Faculty Status and Collective Bargaining Statements Final Versions," *College & Research Libraries News* (March 2001): 304–06

ACRL Committee on the Status of Academic Librarians.
"Standards for Faculty Status for College and University Librarians"
www.ala.org/acrl/guides/facstat01.htm

Anderson, Gregory L.
"[Letters] Proud to Be a Librarian," *Library Journal* (August 1, 2001): 8

Applegate, Rachel
"Deconstructing Faculty Status: Research and Assumptions," *Journal of Academic Librarianship* 19, no. 3, (July 1993): 158–64

Ashraf, Javed
"The Effect of Unions on Professors' Salaries: the Evidence Over Twenty Years," *Journal of Labor Research* 18, no. 3 (summer 1997): 439

Cary, Shannon
"Faculty Rank, Status, and Tenure for Librarians: Current Trends," *College & Research Libraries News* (May 2001): 510–11, 520

Dougherty, Richard M.
"[Editorial] Faculty Status: Playing on a Tilted Field," *Journal of Academic Librarianship* (May 1993): 67

Henry, Elizabeth C. and Dana M. Caudle
"Tenure and Turnover in Academic Libraries," *College & Research Libraries* 55, no. 5 (September 1994): 429

Hill, Fred E. and Robert Hauptmann
"Faculty Status for Librarians? A Response," *College & Research Libraries News* (January 1994): 26

Hill, Janet Swan
"Wearing Our Own Clothes: Librarians As Faculty," *Journal of Academic Librarianship* (May 1994): 71–76

Hoadley, Irene
"Faculty Status: 2001," *College and Research Libraries News* (June 1993): 338–39

Horenstein, B.
"Job Satisfaction of Academic Librarians: An Examination of the Relationships between Satisfaction, Faculty Status, and Participation," *College & Research Libraries* 54, no. 3 (May 1993): 255–69

Hovekamp, Tima Maragou
"Work Values Among Professional Employees in Union and Nonunion Research Library Institutions," *Journal of Applied Psychology* 24, no. 11: 981–93

Leckie, G. J.
"Academic Status for Canadian University Librarians: an Examination of Key Terms and Conditions," *Canadian Journal of Information and Library Science* 20, no. 1 (April 1995): 1–28

Meyer, R. W.
"A Measure of the Impact of Tenure," *College & Research Libraries* 60, no. 2 (March 1999): 110–19

Meyer, Richard W.
"Earnings Gains through the Institutionalized Standard of

Faculty Status," *Library Administration & Management* 4, (fall 1990): 184–93

Monks, James

"Unionization and Faculty Salaries: New Evidence from the 1990s," *Journal of Labor Research* 21, no. 2, (spring 2002): 305

Oberg, Larry R., Douglas Herman, Virginia Massey-Burzio, and Carol Schroeder

"Rethinking Ring and Shapiro: Some Responses," *College & Research Libraries News* 55, no. 3 (March 1994): 145

Shapiro, Beth J.

"The Myths Surrounding Faculty Status for Librarians," *College & Research Libraries News* 54, no. 10 (November 1993): 562

Spang, Lothar and William P. Kane

"Who Speaks for Academic Libraries," *College & Research Libraries* (September 1997)

Watson, Maureen Martin and Susan M. Kroll

"The Association of Visual Science Librarians' Professional Status and Salary Survey," *Special Libraries* 83, no. 1 (Winter 1992): 26.

Weatherford, John W.

Librarian's Agreements: Bargaining for a Heterogeneous Profession (Metuchen, N.J.: Scarecrow Pr., 1998)

White, Herbert S.

"Faculty Status for Academic Librarians: the Search for the Holy Grail," *Library Journal* (November 15, 1996): 39–40

Wood, Deanna D.

"Librarians and Unions: Defining and Protecting Professional Values," *Education Libraries* 23, no. 1 (1999): 12–16