After Access: Libraries & Digital Empowerment

Building Digitally Inclusive Communities

A Report from the American Library Association
Digital Inclusion Summit

December 2015

Larra Clark, American Library Association
Karen Archer Perry, Clarion Collaborative

American Library Association
Digital Inclusion Summit
After Access: Libraries & Digital Empowerment

Building Digitally Inclusive Communities - A Report from the American Library Association Digital Inclusion Summit

Executive Summary

The role of libraries in building digitally inclusive communities has never been more important than it is today. The ability to access and successfully use digital information is central to nearly everything we do, and any gaps in digital access and skills have significantly greater impacts on the opportunities available to everyone in our communities than in years past. Library users and community stakeholders also have raised their expectations about digital engagement. We now expect to use digital platforms to create and collaborate anytime and anyplace.

As we expand our digital lives, librarians are expanding the ways in which they reach into communities to help people harness the transformative power of digital information to support education, employment, entrepreneurship, empowerment and engagement—or The E’s of Libraries®. And librarians are not doing it alone—new and expanded partnerships with government agencies and community technology advocates meet diverse and changing needs.

To investigate these shifts, build on research from the Digital Inclusion Survey, and explore implications for library services, capacity, policy and research, the American Library Association (ALA) Office for Information Technology Policy invited digital inclusion advocates to discuss the future of libraries and digital inclusion.

This paper provides a summary of presentations, discussions and related resources from After Access: Libraries & Digital Empowerment Summit held on June 25, 2015, at the ALA Annual Conference in San Francisco.

Participants affirmed that digital information and skills are now woven into most all library services, that the need for library staff and clients to continue to deepen their skills will only escalate, and that the role of providing free access to information and services for everyone remains central to the mission and culture of libraries.

Summit participants explored innovative local programs, as well as national research findings. They also discussed the impact of digital platforms on: library programs and services; staff training and capacity building; policy and funding; and research and evaluation. This report reflects those conversations and incorporates some of the latest related research, programs and services, and digital inclusion policy developments.

“Libraries have long been champions of free and equitable access to information and education. This role is more important than ever before in this era of rapidly changing information policy and new digital ecosystems.”

National Policy Agenda for Libraries
Introduction

As a nation, we have raised our expectations about information access. We have increased the number and types of Internet-enabled devices we carry; keep in our homes, institutions and businesses; wear on our body and embed in our appliances. More people are increasingly plugged in more of the time.

We have moved from an environment where people mostly use the Internet to search and send email to one where people use digital tools to actively manage their own healthcare, pursue just-in-time learning, buy and sell assets, launch petition campaigns, crowdsource fundraising, create new companies, learn about the world and freely share information about themselves, their communities and their products.

Libraries continue to lead the way in building digitally inclusive communities that support individual opportunity and community progress. Because digital information is now part of everything people do, libraries transform.

When the Institute of Museum and Library Services (IMLS) issued the Building Digital Communities Framework for Action in January 2012, the authors defined a digitally inclusive community around principles for access, adoption and application. The principles, summarized in the sidebar and detailed in the framework, are statements of intention that describe the core elements of a digitally inclusive community (although one community may apply them differently from another). These are dynamic terms. For instance, broadband availability measures have shifted from kilobit to gigabit speeds. Similarly, the principles by which we define adoption and application are shifting. Everyone needs stronger digital skills and more application-specific knowledge to participate fully in today's digital world.

On June 25, 2015, the ALA Office for Information Technology Policy (OITP) hosted a summit to explore how library professionals and their partners can best meet the digital information and literacy needs of their communities. The event was co-sponsored by the ALA Office for Research and Statistics and the University of Maryland Information Policy & Access Center as part of its Digital Inclusion Survey research, funded by IMLS.
Titled *After Access: Libraries and Digital Empowerment*, the convening sought to connect the Digital Inclusion Survey and related research to describe the current landscape; define next steps in building digitally inclusive communities; and engage the collective wisdom and experience of local and national experts to develop recommendations to advance the field in four areas: programs and services; staff training and capacity building; policy and funding; and research and evaluation.

This report highlights panel presentations and round-table discussions at the summit; related research and findings from a range of sources; and a range of front-line perspectives.

Public libraries are an equalizing force in American society—enabling access to and engagement with a world of resources irrespective of age, income, education or race. Today, libraries provide far more than basic computing support. They offer maker hubs for media mash-ups and content creation, local gathering places for learners to connect online and in person, on-ramps for increasingly rich and diverse digital content, and guidance as people seek meaning amidst information abundance.

While many individuals and communities continue to struggle to achieve sufficient levels of digital access, this summit's focus was “after access”—exploring the community drivers and library responses for the adoption and application of digital information. This paper provides an update on community trends and library actions needed to continue to build digitally inclusive communities and advance digital readiness.

**Summit Summary**

Through panel discussions and round-table conversations, leaders shared their thinking about how the field can best respond to the increasing demand for digital participation. The summit agenda included two panels, first exploring library capacity, community needs and future opportunities; then another providing insight from the front lines on digital inclusion and innovation. Participants drew from their personal experience and from the panels to develop recommendations along four tracks: programs, training, policies, and evaluation. The summit agenda and list of participants are included in Appendices A and B.

**Opening Comments**

With a wiki and recommended readings provided in advance of the Summit and a wealth of expertise in the room, the stage was set for conversation well before participants arrived at the ALA Annual Conference in San Francisco. Mary Alice Ball from IMLS and Pat Martel from the International City/County Management Association (ICMA) provided important context for the day, complemented with framing comments by program chairs Larra Clark and Kathy Rosa from ALA.

- Mary Alice Ball, Senior Library Program Officer, IMLS
- Patricia Martel, Incoming President, ICMA
- Kathy Rosa, Director, ALA Office for Research and Statistics
- Larra Clark, Deputy Director, ALA Office for Information Technology Policy
Mary Alice Ball, IMLS

In setting the stage for the Summit, Mary Alice Ball commented on the expertise in the room and the need to push forward. “People in this room have worked on these issues for decades. But digital inclusion is not a done deal. We still have a lot of work to do.” Ball commended the Digital Inclusion Survey conducted by ALA and the University of Maryland (UMD) and urged participants to continue to invest in data collection and research. She said that the favorable reforms in E-rate could not have happened without the data from the Digital Inclusion Survey. “When you can combine the story and the data, you can make a very compelling case for change.”

Pat Martel, ICMA

Pat Martel, City Manager of Daly City (CA) and President of the International City/County Management Association (ICMA) highlighted the importance of the ICMA partnership with libraries and the need to build digitally inclusive communities. Nearly 9,000 ICMA members support 185 million people in thousands of communities around the world. While ICMA provides technical and management assistance to its members, the organization’s focus is on the communities they serve. “We are all about building strong communities where our residents are fully able to participate.” Representing those city and county managers and communities, Martel said, “Life has changed for our communities. Technology has played an undeniable role in our development. Digital inclusion is vital.” She also said that digital inclusion and social equity are core values of ICMA’s work. “Libraries play a significant role in helping local governments meet our greatest changes: connecting our services to citizens and identifying critical community priorities.”

Larra Clark and Kathy Rosa, ALA

Program chairs Larra Clark and Kathy Rosa from ALA reinforced the importance of ongoing research and continuing to strengthen the digital fabric of our communities. Clark said, “The access piece is going to continue to happen. But what happens after access? What are the skills that people are going to need? What are the tools they need? How will access translate to better lives, better communities and better opportunities?”

Connecting the Dots on Library Capacity, Community Needs, Future Opportunities

The first panel showcased research and findings from the UMD Policy & Access Center, Pew Research Center, and the Aspen Institute with three national authorities.

- John Carlo Bertot, Co-Director and Professor, Information Policy & Access Center, UMD
- John B. Horrigan, Senior Researcher, Pew Research Center
Susan Hildreth, Fellow, Aspen Institute Dialogue on the Future of Public Libraries; previous, IMLS Director

**John Carlo Bertot, The Role of Public Libraries in Building Digitally Inclusive Communities**

John Bertot led the panel with the latest findings from the Digital Inclusion Survey, affirming that libraries already have well-established digital programs. Wi-Fi is nearly ubiquitous. E-books are almost ubiquitous (available in more than 90% of libraries), and online health resources are available at 77% of library outlets. While there are significant variations by community type, there are, on average, 17.9 public access computers available at each library outlet. Library broadband speeds are higher than they were, due in part to investments made as part of the federal broadband stimulus program (Broadband Technology Opportunities Program and Broadband Improvement Program). While Bertot found median download speeds of 16 Mbps, he also noted that many librarians still don’t know their subscribed broadband speeds. Libraries are stepping more slowly into mobile; about 43% of libraries have mobile apps and 47% report that their websites are mobile device-enabled.

This year’s Digital Inclusion Survey included questions about library buildings and renovations for the first time. The mean year for library construction represented in the survey is 1970. Bertot noted that older and smaller buildings are less likely to accommodate expanded digital services and formal training. “It matters if your building has been renovated in the last five years. Those libraries that offer formal training are those that are more likely to have been renovated most recently.” Smaller libraries offer fewer programs. “Libraries really are at different levels of readiness and capacity. We focus on the digital so much that we’re not focusing on our bricks and mortar. Those two really are linked.” For example, 45% of libraries indicated that they had inadequate electric supply, electrical outlets and in-building network capacity; and 88% say that they have fair or poor space for makerspaces.

**John B. Horrigan, Digital Inclusion & Readiness: Role of Libraries**

John Horrigan reflected on changes in home broadband adoption from 2010 to 2014, including growth from 68% to 75%. “This notion of the digital divide is changing....the solution used to be more gear and more access but more and more people have more gear and more access, and there is still a gap. Pulling a single lever doesn’t effect change.” Horrigan estimates 70 million Americans are not “digitally ready” for robust online use, nearly twice the number (36 million) of people with no online access. “Comprehensive solutions are needed, and institutions matter... Libraries play a big role in closing those broadband adoption gaps and in promoting ‘digital readiness.’” Horrigan defines ‘digital readiness’ as addressing the twin challenges of technical know-how and trust in the security of their personal data in order for people to participate in the digital commons—not just as consumers of services but as creators and participants. “Libraries are seen as trusted and safe places to help people navigate digitally-driven change.”
change.” An April 2015 Pew library survey finds that 70% of respondents say libraries should help people learn how to use new technologies; and 76% say libraries should offer programs to teach people how to protect privacy and security online.

Respondents also affirmed the library’s role as a community hub for social inclusion: 85% say libraries should offer early literacy programs for kids; 74% said libraries should create programs to help veterans or active military; 59% say libraries should offer programs or services for immigrants or first generation Americans; and 52% say libraries should create programs to help entrepreneurs & local businesses.

Susan Hildreth, The Aspen Institute Dialogue on Public Libraries

In reflecting on the findings of the Aspen Institute Dialogue on Public Libraries, Susan Hildreth noted that libraries are both high tech and high touch. The dialogue’s resulting report, *Rising to the Challenge: Re-envisioning Public Libraries*, sets a framework for community discussions about the role of the library in the digital age. The report looks at libraries as platforms, people and place and highlights both the strengths and changes in each area. Hildreth noted that providing a welcoming environment for virtual visitors is increasingly important, and that “library staff need to be totally up to date on their digital skills.” Robust broadband connectivity is a baseline requirement for libraries; and staff need to be excited about trying out new devices. “Think about how much content creation is going on in our communities today. Libraries need to support and share that creation.”

Round-up of resources from Panel 1:


Digital Inclusion and Innovation on the Front Lines

Building on the national perspectives provided in the first panel, the second panel focused on practice and innovation at the local and state level. Sylvia Aguiñaga and Joanna Fabicon talked about teaching coding skills to kids in Los Angeles. Cheptoo Kositany-Buckner discussed the Kansas City Public Library’s role as a convener and creator of a broad-based digital inclusion coalition. Ann Joslin discussed her state’s program to Make It in Idaho libraries.

- Sylvia Aguiñaga, Curriculum Director, DIY Girls
- Joanna Fabicon, Children’s Librarian, Los Angeles Public Library
- Cheptoo Kositany-Buckner, Deputy Director, Kansas City (MO) Public Library
- Ann Joslin, State Librarian, Idaho Commission for Libraries
"Our world is increasingly run by software, and I think we need more diversity in the people who are creating it," said Sylvia Aguiñaga. Coder Time is working to make sure that kids get early exposure to using code to solve problems. Coder Time is a partnership of DIYgirls and Los Angeles Public Library (LAPL) that focuses on teaching kids—especially girls and minorities—why coding is important, how to write code, and then giving them opportunities to use their new-found skills to complete a project they’re excited about. Aguiñaga puts it simply: "Code is the new literacy of the digital age." Why partner with the library? Her answer is emphatic, “I really believe the library is THE place to do this. The library acts as an equalizer because it offers programs to all kids for free.” LAPL Children’s Librarian Joanna Fabicon says that the kids learn coding skills and something extra—social connections and pride. The program helps kids see themselves as creators and drivers in the tech world.

**Cheptoo Kositany-Buckner, Digital Inclusion in Kansas City: Building a Coalition**

When Google conducted a study on the state of Internet connectivity in Kansas City in 2012, the company found that 70% of children in the Kansas City School District did not have Internet access at home, and 40% of children had more than one address during the school year. While Google Fiber is an important part of Kansas City’s digital inclusion plan, it takes more than fiber to bridge the digital divide. Cheptoo Kositany-Buckner said that the Kansas City (MO) Public Library used the IMLS Building Digitally Inclusive Communities framework to convene stakeholders and develop a collective plan to bridge the divides in Kansas City. One result from that effort is the Greater Kansas City Digital Inclusion Coalition—a broad network of non-profits, businesses, faith-based institutions, libraries, city agencies, schools, community based organizations, colleges and universities, social service agencies, healthcare providers, housing and real estate companies, and community leaders in the bi-state Kansas City area. “We as a library alone really cannot bridge that divide. We needed to partner,” Kositany-Buckner said. Digital Inclusion KC now has a formal structure, a focus on inclusion zones and a set of collaborative pilot projects. By working together, Digital Inclusion KC believes their work will be more efficient, that projects will scale more quickly, and that their efforts will be more inclusive and ultimately more transformative.

**Ann Joslin, After Access: Libraries and Digital Empowerment**

The key on Ann Joslin’s map of Idaho has two symbols: one for libraries and one for mountains. A full 70% of Idaho’s 103 libraries are the only source of free Internet in Idaho’s rural and remote communities. Before delving into what happens “after access,” Joslin stressed the importance of broadband access in libraries—particularly rural libraries. After significant investments from BTOP, the mean broadband connection speed in Idaho libraries is 12.8 Mbps—better than before, but far less than the national mean of 57.4 Mbps. So, while
Idaho is launching new programs, ensuring that libraries have the broadband they need for digital services remains a high priority for the state library.

Originally launched on a small scale with an IMLS grant, the 2014 Idaho maker program reached 23,000 people in 11 library communities. Only a portion of the maker movement deals with digital content like 3D printing, but Idaho’s maker programs are bringing new creativity and community connections to library programs. “We had no idea that people involved with car injector clubs, quilters, sheet metal contractors and retired teachers would be volunteering to help the younger segment of the community learn about their areas of interest and expertise. Volunteers want to give kids an edge up to stay here and be part of our community long-term.”

Round-up of resources from Panel 2:

- **Make It @ the library, Where Idaho Makers Meet:** [http://libraries.idaho.gov/page/make-it-library-where-idaho-makers-meet](http://libraries.idaho.gov/page/make-it-library-where-idaho-makers-meet)

Break-out Discussions: Libraries and Digital Empowerment

In addition to the expertise of panelists and opening speakers, the Digital Inclusion Summit benefited from a wealth of expertise throughout the room. To tap these diverse perspectives and help develop actionable next steps, four working groups were convened to envision how libraries will continue to invest in building digitally inclusive communities. The break-out groups focused on describing a vision, identifying strengths and development needs, and considering possible future approaches in four areas:

1. **Programs and services** – Facilitator: Marc Gartler, chair of the ALA America’s Libraries for the 21st Century subcommittee and branch manager, Madison (WI) Public Library
2. **Staff training and capacity building** – Facilitator: Michael Golrick, member of the Digital Inclusion Survey advisory committee and head of reference for the State Library of Louisiana
3. **Policy and funding** – Facilitator: Aaron Dobbs, ALA Councilor and scholarly communications & eResources librarian and associate professor at Shippensburg University.
4. **Research and evaluation** – Facilitator: Linda Hofschie, chair of the ALA Office for Research & Statistics Advisory Committee and research analyst with the Library Research Service in the Colorado Department of Education.

Appendices C1-4 provide additional notes and summaries of these discussions.

One constant throughout these discussions was a strong endorsement of the libraries’ role supporting social equity, meeting the needs of vulnerable populations and ensuring that all

"We need to create a maker culture in libraries."

Ann Joslin
services, including digital access and empowerment, are available to all. There was a caution not to leave anyone behind as more advanced services and resources are deployed.

Programs and Services

*Vision statement: Library services will meet people where they are with engaging opportunities to be digitally ready for lifelong learning and full participation in society.*

Participants discussed creating programs that focus on engagement and that further leverage the library’s role as a place that removes barriers and helps everyone learn, explore and create. They described a future in which:

- Schools and public libraries work together seamlessly to support education and learning
- Digital inclusion efforts actively include people with disabilities
- Digital inclusion investments actively support collaboration across diverse community players
- Libraries leverage gigabit (or greater) connections to collaborate virtually in real-time
- Libraries teach deeper technology and critical thinking skills

Among the strengths librarians bring to this work are a strong set of existing programs, physical and virtual workspaces, a plethora of digital information and tools, and the ability to learn from each other and to engage others in the community. However, many libraries are constrained by space and budget and many feel that technology and professional development budgets are not keeping up with dynamic community demands.

Participants felt that librarians could strengthen their community of practice around providing digital programs by leveraging national and regional digital platforms to decrease program costs, share best practices, and speed program innovation. In order to create more space for technology-based programs, participants suggested introducing more self-service functions and carefully trimming investments in less popular programs. There also was strong agreement of the need for cross-sector learning and partnerships beyond libraries.

In addition to the work done in libraries, librarians are poised to be community conveners in building digitally inclusive communities—work that is well supported by the IMLS framework.

Additional resources relevant to designing programs and services in the digital age include:

- Mozilla Foundation [Web Literacy Map](https://webliteracy.org/)
- IMLS [Learning Labs in Libraries and Museums](https://www.imls.gov/programs/labs/)
- Institute for the Future (IFTF) [Future Work Skills 2020](https://www.futureworkskills2020.org/)

One contemporary and community-sourced view of digital literacy is the Mozilla Foundation’s [framework for Web Literacy](https://webliteracy.org/). The Mozilla community defines web literacy as “the skills and competencies needed for reading, writing, and participating on the web.” Similar to the way we have discussed digital literacy as the ability to create, curate and collaborate, the Mozilla framework defines a set of competencies to:

- Explore – reading the web (curate)
- Build – writing the web (create)
• Connect – participating on the web\(^5\) (collaborate)

Libraries increasingly are blending the physical with the digital to create innovative learning spaces. Learning labs are one expression of how libraries and museums are preparing youth to meet the challenges of a global economy while allowing them to follow their passions and inspire each other. The October 2014 “Learning Labs in Libraries and Museums” report from IMLS outlines common features and shares key learnings and models from 24 projects nationwide built on the design principles of Connected Learning (Mizuko Ito, et al., *Connected Learning: An Agenda for Research and Design*).

Library programs also will continue to be shaped by the skills needed for work in life. A report titled *Future Work Skills 2020*, produced by the Institute for the Future, analyzes “the key drivers that will reshape the landscape of work and identifies key work skills needed in the next ten years.”\(^6\) Although the report focuses on the work environment, the trends and skills described will likely impact all areas of our lives, including health, entertainment, socialization, and civic engagement. These changes will continue to be reflected in library programs and services.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Six Drivers of Change</th>
<th>Ten New Skills Needed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Extreme longevity</td>
<td>1. Sense-making</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Rise of smart machines and systems</td>
<td>2. Novel and adaptive thinking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Computational world</td>
<td>3. Social intelligence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. New media ecology</td>
<td>4. Trans-disciplinarity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Super structured organizations</td>
<td>5. New media literacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Globally connected world</td>
<td>6. Computational thinking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>7. Cognitive load management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8. Design mindset</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>9. Cross-cultural competency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>10. Virtual collaboration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

More notes from the discussion on library programs and services are included in Appendix C1.

**Staff Training & Capacity Building**

*Vision statement: Library staff will exemplify the practice of lifelong learning. All staff will have core technology and digital literacy competencies and the ability to leverage their personal and virtual networks to bring additional expertise to their communities and clients. Up-to-date library spaces facilitate learning and community collaboration.*

Trained staff and up-to-date library spaces facilitate learning and community collaboration. Participants described an environment where library staff exemplify the practice of lifelong learning. All staff have core technology and digital literacy competencies and the ability to leverage their personal and virtual networks to bring additional expertise to their communities and clients. Building improvements create more flexible spaces for learning and collaboration.

Participants suggested that librarians use just-in-time learning to quickly develop new skills to meet client needs and that staff be “knowledge navigators”—helping people find information in the library network, in the community and beyond. In addition to needing to fortify their information
technology skills, participants emphasized the need for library leaders to take more risks and "fail forward" like inventors. While funding discussions were the topic of another group, this group made clear that more money is needed for professional development, digital upgrades and building renovations. Library buildings need to be expanded and upgraded to provide collaboration spaces, and library professional development budgets need to be increased.

In this area, library strengths also can be weakness. Library buildings and the sense of place in community is a huge asset, but also create physical systems to maintain and upgrade. Libraries are a national force for good, but fragmented, local structures make it difficult to broadly institute consistent services nationwide. While library staff are well-respected and trusted, some staff are slow to adapt to digital content access and creation. Using volunteers adds capacity but also demands staff time to screen, train and manage.

Possible approaches to strengthen staff training and build library capacity include creating (or expanding) statewide training programs, and building a national community of practice around digital and information literacy. Participants also encouraged the use self-paced or online training and the use of widely adopted and recognized online badges to track new competencies. There also was agreement that librarians need to continue to strengthen leadership within the field, work to reward digital leaders and retrain or reposition digital laggards.

Additional resources related to staff training and capacity building include:

- WebJunction Competency Index for the Library Field 2014
- OCLC At a Tipping Point: Education, Learning and Libraries

In 2014, when WebJunction updated its 2009 "Competency Index for the Library Field," one of the striking changes was to define a core set of technology skills as "essential library competencies," indicating that those skills are needed for all library staff, regardless of their role or position in the library. The index editors wrote, "One of the critical new directions emphasized in the updated Competency Index is the need to foster 21st century skills in our communities. In order to do this, library staff must be equipped with the right skill sets themselves. Technology is ubiquitous. Self-directed learning and innovation are highlighted throughout."

Libraries have always been learning places but the nature of how we learn is changing—a change that will impact library services and staff training. In a 2014 report to its membership, "At a Tipping Point: Education, Learning and Libraries," OCLC explored the information consumer's behaviors, beliefs and expectations for online learning. The report suggests, "tipping points that have already occurred in how most of us consume and evaluate information, how we shop and buy, how we date and break up, and how we manage our careers and our retirement portfolios. Web and mobile services have forever changed how we manage our days, our jobs, and very soon, how we learn and manage our education.” The study helps librarians understand the “trends and triggers that are reshaping education—and the opportunities and challenges this shift brings to libraries.”

More notes from the discussion on staff training and capacity building are included in Appendix C2.
Policy and Funding

Vision statement: National and local funding and policy decisions provide the means for libraries to offer all people the unbiased and relevant information and essential services that drive opportunity and progress.

Participants felt the keys to sustainable library funding and supportive policy decisions were many: revitalizing the view of the library from a nostalgic nicety to a contemporary essential institution; creating greater community alignment; winning over more library champions; laying out clear plans and asking for more money; and demonstrating impact. The group’s vision included:

- Policymakers “get” the importance of digital readiness and invest in building it
- Libraries are recognized as eligible entities for funding in legislative/regulatory language (e.g., workforce development or afterschool initiatives)
- Librarians are more engaged in coalitions, outside commissions and community planning activities

When it comes to policy and funding, libraries start with some excellent assets: knowledgeable staff in ALA’s Washington Office who advocate for libraries at the national level; increased policy attention from other library organizations; and positive support on both sides of the political aisle and at all levels of government. However, success in these areas requires savvy leadership, clear messaging, compelling plans, bold funding requests and persistence. Too many decision makers have nostalgic views of libraries and library services that need to be updated for the digital age.

To help achieve ongoing, sustainable library funding participants recommended a long-term holistic policy planning approach, streamlined library messaging and launching campaigns to increase public awareness of the essential work of libraries. They also suggested: doing a national study to better understand the relative efficiencies of various library organizational structures and funding models; coalition building; advocacy training; and continued support for data collection and impact assessments.

Additional resources related to policy and funding include:

- Policy Revolution! Initiative
- Broadband Opportunity Council Report and Recommendations

ALA Policy Revolution!
Focus Areas

- Funding
- Copyright & Licensing
- Digital Content Systems
- Privacy
- Broadband Access, Adoption & Use
- Library-related Functions in the Federal Government
- Information Professionals

E’s of Libraries®

- Education
- Employment
- Entrepreneurship
- Empowerment
- Engagement

for Everyone, Everywhere
Building on a strong history of policy work, the ALA Office for Information Technology Policy launched the ALA Policy Revolution! initiative to strengthen and focus ALA's policy work. Based on broad input from the national library community, the National Public Policy Agenda for Libraries was released in June 2015. The agenda provides a framework for the U.S. library community with the goal of more consistent policy advocacy and communications, focusing on building library capacity to advance national priorities and on furthering library values and the public interest. “Library allies must unite around shared long-term policy goals—specifically ones that pragmatically align to political and economic realities—and work together to educate and influence decision makers.” The agenda weaves digital policy requirements into every action from funding to copyright, and privacy to staff training.10

Representing the kind of cross-sector review and input called for in several of the small-group discussions, the August 2015 Broadband Opportunity Council report, developed pursuant to a presidential memorandum on broadband, looks across federal agencies to identify what opportunities for and barriers to broadband deployment, competition and adoption exist. It considers what how the government can address these barriers/opportunities “through executive actions within the scope of existing Agency programs, missions and budgets.” It contains guiding principles for federal action—including promoting the adoption and meaningful use of broadband technology—as well as 35 specific action items to support broadband deployment and adoption. Because the report outlines who will do what and when, it provides a road map to engage a range of governmental, non-profit and commercial entities—including libraries and other digital inclusion advocates. Relevant to the next section, the report also calls for a national research agenda to improve data collection, analysis and research on broadband, as well as to make broadband data publicly available via open data initiatives.

More notes from the discussion on policy and funding are included in Appendix C3.

Research and Evaluation

Vision statement: Robust data collection, including an increased focus on digital measures, will support meaningful research that helps libraries better understand and meet community needs and amplifies library stories and community impact.

Data collection, research and evaluation provide a foundation for understanding changing community needs, exploring metrics on library operations and funding, and advancing outcomes and impact. Participants said that we need to redesign systems so that data is collected “once” and shared via a common platform so that a core dataset can be used locally and at each level of interest without redundant and/or inconsistent data acquisition efforts. They discussed making data collection more frequent and automated, surrounded and supported by tools/apps that enable stakeholders to analyze “big data” and rapidly put it to use.

Participants suggested research across a range of topics including:

- Community needs and trends
- Library and information practices and efficiencies
- Outcomes and impact
The field has a strong basis on which to build additional data collection, research and evaluation. The UMD, University of Washington, Pew Research Center, OCLC and others have implemented significant multi-year studies. The Public Library Survey (PLS), conducted jointly by IMLS and state data coordinators, provides a consistent census of data across public libraries in all 50 states and the District of Columbia. Among the challenges noted, however, is that some of the data is not granular enough, or is uneven, and that there is a lack of coordination among various research efforts. Participants also expressed a need for more research on library and community impacts, and for consistent metrics to better measure online and digital library services.

Participants proposed developing a strategy to centralize and coordinate data collection and make data more accessible and interactive. They suggested additional research to better understand:

- Civic engagement, education, economic opportunity, government service delivery
- Unique institutional assets in libraries depending on needs of community
- What is the library’s contribution to community change
- Community trends that could impact library information services
- Return on investment in libraries

A number of publications and activities are well-aligned with these research and evaluation goals:

- University of Washington U.S. Impact Study
- Public Library Association Project Outcome
- Digital Inclusion Survey Interactive Mapping Tool
- New Media Consortium Horizon Report: 2015 Library Edition

The University of Washington’s U.S. Impact Study and the Public Library Association’s (PLA) Project Outcome provide tools for library leaders to capture and quantify the impact of their services. The U.S. Impact Study is focused on patron use of the library’s digital services. The newly released tools from PLA cover seven core services: civic/community engagement, digital inclusion, early childhood literacy, economic development, education and life-long learning, job skills, and summer reading.

The Digital Inclusion Survey’s interactive mapping tool integrates library location, community, and digital inclusion services/resources data. In doing so, the mapping tool harnesses a range of community data (demographics, health & wellness, economic, education); digital services resources, and programming data; and public library data, thus demonstrating the ways in which the use of big data, data from various sources, and new tools can be localized and show the role of libraries in building digitally inclusive communities.

The NMC Horizon Report > 2015 Library Edition considers “what is on the five-year horizon for academic and research libraries?” While some of the identified trends may affect research institutions sooner, most trends apply equally to public and school libraries. The report is a strong example of the type of research needed to inform strategic investments. The report highlights trends that accelerate and impact technology adoption and suggests short-, mid- and long-term impacts of those trends. Horizon also discusses the impact of maker spaces and online learning in the near-term and machine learning and location intelligence in the longer-term.

More notes from the discussions on research and evaluation are included in Appendix C4.
Conclusion

As we look to the future of digital readiness and opportunity there is reason to be optimistic. There is both a solid foundation of service and equity-building and a significant commitment to “raising the bar” to meet changing expectations and needs through new and deepened partnerships at the local, state and national levels.

Virtually all of our nation’s nearly 16,700 public library buildings provide no-fee public access to wired and wireless broadband, desktops and increasingly mobile devices, trained and knowledgeable staff, and increasing robust digital content and services. Libraries today represent a national critical infrastructure that delivers services and engages communities—with a long history of accomplishment connecting people with each other and with diverse resources.

While there is optimism, there also is urgency to diffusing best practices more widely and quickly once they are identified. In an increasingly networked world, libraries and their community partners often are still quite fragmented from their colleagues across the nation and globe. This theme of overcoming siloes and barriers could be heard across each of the working groups: a desire to seamlessly support students beyond the school day and school year; a need for communities of practice enabled through digital platforms; demand for more robust coalitions and funding that encourages collaboration (rather than competition) among complementary partners; and greater coordination among overlapping research efforts.

Collaboration is needed at all levels. Local librarians and partners propose, develop and implement services towards greater digital inclusion with respect to community demographics and needs. But state, regional and national partners are vital for communicating the opportunities available through libraries and the gaps that demand capacity building—and to help share and scale promising practices broadly.

Finally, it was clear at the end of the day that far more work lies ahead to achieve our vision of ensuring no one is left behind in the digital age. Sustainably supporting libraries as community learning centers that meet people wherever they are in the spectrum of digital empowerment and engagement is part of the solution. Continuing and building on conversations like this one that bring together library and community leaders will be key to success.
Appendix A
Summit Agenda
After Access: Libraries & Digital Empowerment
June 25, 2015 Speakers and Participants

Welcome and greetings
- Kathy Rosa, Director, ALA Office for Research and Statistics
- Mary Alice Ball, Senior Library Program Officer, Institute of Museum and Library Services
- Patricia Martel, Incoming President, International City/County Management Association
- Larra Clark, ALA Office for Information Technology Policy

Panel One:
Connecting the Dots on Library Capacity, Community Needs and Future Opportunities at National Level
- John Carlo Bertot, Co-Director and Professor, Information Policy & Access Center, University of Maryland
- John Horrigan, Senior Researcher, Pew Research Center
- Susan Hildreth, Fellow, Aspen Institute Dialogue on Public Libraries

Panel Two:
Digital Inclusion and Innovation on the Front Lines
- Sylvia Aguiñaga, Curriculum Director, DIY Girls
- Joanna Fabicon, Children’s Librarian, Los Angeles Public Library
- Cheptoo Kositany-Buckner, Deputy Director, Kansas City (MO) Public Library
- Ann Joslin, State Librarian, Idaho Commission for Libraries

Moderator and Facilitators
- Larra Clark, Deputy Director, ALA Office for Information Technology Policy
- Karen Archer Perry, Principal, Clarion Collaborative
- Aaron Dobbs, Policy & Funding Group Lead, scholarly communications & eResources librarian and associate professor at Shippensburg University
- Linda Hofschire, Research Group Lead, research analyst with the Library Research Service in the Colorado Department of Education
- Marc Gartler, Programs and Services Group Lead, branch manager, Madison (WI) Public Library
- Michael Golrick, Staff Training and Capacity Group Lead, head of reference and library consultant (state data coordinator) for the State Library of Louisiana
Appendix B

Summit Participants

Lourdes Aceves, Edge Senior Program Manager, Urban Libraries Council
Sylvia Aguiñaga, DIY Girls
Chela Anderson, Director, Daly City (CA) Public Library
Mary Alice Ball, Senior Library Program Officer, IMLS
Pat Ball, OITP Advisory Committee member, Branch Manager Cobb County (GA) Public Library
Andrea Berstler, Director, Wicomico (MD) Public Library
John Bertot, Co-director, University of Maryland Information Policy & Access Center
Carson Block, Technology Consultant
Cathleen Bourdon, Associate Executive Director, ALA
Larra Clark, Deputy Director, ALA Office for Information Technology Policy (OITP)
Aaron Dobbs, Scholarly Communications and eResources Librarian, Shippensburg University
Joanna Fabicon, Children’s Librarian, Los Angeles Public Library
Amy Garmer, Director, Aspen Institute Dialogue on Public Libraries
Marc Gartler, Branch Manager, Madison (WI) Public Library
Ariel Gilbert-Knight, Senior Manager, TechSoup
Roger Goldblatt, Associate Bureau Chief, Consumer & Government Affairs Bureau, FCC
Michael Golrick, Head of Reference and Library Consultant (State Data Coordinator), State Library of Louisiana
Kami Griffiths, Director, Community Technology Network
Steph Harmon, Program Design & Development Manager, OCLC
Susan Hildreth, Aspen Institute Fellow
Linda Hofschire, Research Analyst, Library Research Service, Colorado Department of Education
John Horrigan, Senior Researcher, Pew Research Center
Alan Inouye, Director, ALA OITP
Ann Joslin, State Librarian, Idaho State Library
Jarrid Keller, IT Director, Sacramento Public Library
David Lee King, IT Director, Topeka-Shawnee Public Library
Cheptoo Kositany-Buckner, Deputy Director, Kansas City (MO) Public Library
Tom Koutsky, Chief Policy Counsel, Connected Nation
Aaron Low, Program Manager, SF Connected
Pat Martel, City Manager, Daly City (CA)
Gina Millsap, Director, Topeka-Shawnee Public Library
Jason Mulack, Digital Content Developer, ALA Office for Research & Statistics (ORS)
Bobbi Newman, Blogger, Librarian by Day
Karen Archer Perry, Principal Consultant, Clarion Collaborative
Charlie Parker, Director, Tampa Bay Library Consortium
McCrae Parker, Program Director, ZeroDivide
Drew Pizzolato, Digital Literacy Project Coordinator, Portland State University
Deb Robertson, Director, ALA Public Programs Office
Kathy Rosa, Director, ALA ORS
Norman Rose, Program Officer, ALA ORS
Robin Seaman, director of Content Acquisition, Benetech
Matthew Timberlake, IT Director, Multnomah County (OR) Public Library
David Veneziano, Chief Financial Officer, ZeroDivide
Gwenn Weaver, Program Officer, National Telecommunications and Information Administration
Appendix C1
Conversation Notes: Library Programs and Services

For many people and communities, libraries are the digital onramp to opportunity and personal expression. Participants described an environment where library services meet people where they are with engaging opportunities to be ‘digitally ready’ for lifelong learning and active engagement. ‘Digital readiness’ combines trust and skills to support personal content creation, curation and collaboration.

**What does it look like?**

- “Engagement” is “After Access”
- Librarians are creators
- Everyone is “digitally ready”
- We raise the bar—teaching and supporting people as they develop deeper information management skills like coding and critical thinking
- Library services run the gamut from early learning and basic literacy to digital literacy and content creation
- “Digital” should never be a hindrance or barrier to information or opportunities. Libraries take measurable action to remove digital barriers and equalize the playing field for information access and use.
- Libraries are a place for families to come together to create
- Digital inclusion initiatives explicitly support people with disabilities
- We share digital inclusion resources like we share books
- Schools and libraries work together to provide seamless support for kids and education
- We leverage our gigabit connections to collaborate virtually in real-time
- We don’t forget about basic literacy when turning attention to digital literacy
- Digital inclusion funding actively supports collaboration—not competition

**What are some of the strengths and challenges for libraries and their staff?**

**Strengths**

- Digital inclusion is what we do
- We have a lot of good examples of successful projects
- Track record of getting it done
- Libraries are true community anchors with thousands of library outlets across all communities in America
- Someone in the system has tech skills
- Wi-fi is nearly ubiquitous
- Foot traffic is holding steady
- Libraries provide range of tech resources—e-readers, laptops, tablets, gaming, and more

**Challenges**

- Frontline tech support takes time and training
- Each new medium requires training
- We have skills gaps among staff
- We can be too internally focused
- Trying to do everything
- Not enough space for programs
- Too many libraries have insufficient bandwidth – wired and wireless
- Mobile – we need to better respond to mobile culture
- Online library experiences could be stronger
Possible Approaches

- Build on the maker movement to increase programming for digital authorship and collaboration
- Better understand client’s objectives, moving away from transactions to introduce service suites that provide greater benefit and improved user experience
- Introduce more self-service to free up staff for more engagement with patrons
- Create ongoing showcases of cutting edge “stuff”
- Partner more often and more effectively; explore models from other fields; strengthen our networks and collaborations
- Leverage national and regional platforms to improve services, decrease costs and speed time-to-market; develop platforms that allow us to increase collaboration and share best practices
- Create demonstration projects to address specific issues. Share experience and package for replication.
- Be a convener and a partner, inviting the public into the library and also partnering with other groups on their “home turf.”
- Strengthen professional development so that all staff develop strong digital information competencies and have the freedom to create new programs and services
Appendix C2

Conversation Notes: Staff Training and Capacity

Trained staff and up-to-date library spaces facilitate learning and community collaboration. Participants described an environment where library staff exemplify the practice of lifelong learning. All staff have core technology and digital literacy competencies and the ability to leverage their personal and virtual networks to bring additional expertise to their communities and clients. Building improvements create more flexible spaces for learning and collaboration.

*What does it look like?*

- Library staff model practices of lifelong and continuous learning; the library learning commons become common place.
- Strong interpersonal skills and technology skills are baseline for all staff.
- The library community develops increased digital competencies within the profession and taps expertise from others through our broader networks.
- Library staff move seamlessly across content types, tapping all library resources to serve clients.
- Staff and boards act strategically to maximize community impact.
- Libraries are collaborative—with each other, with community partners and with patrons.
- Libraries use just-in-time learning to quickly develop new skills to meet client needs.
- Library buildings provide the space needed to meet community needs and library staff offer programs both inside their buildings and at community locations.
- More investment in high tech collaboration spaces in libraries.
- Librarians are risk-takers - library staff fail like inventors; they fail forward.
- Librarians code.
- Libraries bring their community to the world with adept skills to amplify community voices.
- Library staff are “knowledge navigators” helping people find information in the library network and in the community and beyond.

*What are some of our strengths and challenges?*

**Strengths**
- Librarians are information professionals
- Engaged staff
- Agility – change in public perception
- Creativity – in maker movement
- Technology
- Volunteers
- Libraries are a stable community institutions
- Trusted community partner
- Libraries are poised for increased relevance at the intersection of information, community and tech

**Challenges**
- Uneven staff technology expertise
- Profession does not always attract outgoing tech savvy people
- Tools for lifelong learning are not agile
- Inflexibility – labor rules
- Volunteer management takes time, skill and screening
- Technology - more investment is needed
- Funding - we may need to find new resources and/or shift priorities
- Willingness to stop doing everything
Approaches

- Create a national badging system – one that creates incentive for recognition and identification of skills
- Build capacity; strengthen digital skills in staff through professional development and on-the-job experience
- Teach digital literacy skills to librarians - help librarians deliver more service
- Strengthen advocacy and communication skills and support
- Increase training budgets and increase the training focus on digital content creation
- Self-paced tutorials are available for staff and patrons
- Statewide infrastructure to empower staff at every library to know all library and community resources and how to access
- Strengthen national, local and regional communities of practice around digital and information literacy
- Strengthen leadership
- Identify those who are passionate about digital and empower them
Appendix C3

Conversation Notes: Policy and Funding

Participants described an environment where national and local funding and policy decisions provide the means for libraries to offer all people the unbiased and relevant information and essential services that drive opportunity and progress.

What does it look like?

- Libraries are perceived as essential decision makers and library champions
- Communities and schools invest more money and resources in libraries
- State level policy makers “get” the importance of digital readiness - and invest
- Engage voters in supporting library funding initiatives
- Create a fund that demands and rewards collaborative investments (a la Kansas City digital inclusion plan described during the program) rather than siloed efforts
- Private sector sees the value in public libraries and invests in increased support
- We build collective impact
- Get libraries into legislative language that defines eligible entities
- Libraries engage on commissions, coalitions and community conversations
- Libraries build the case for more local funding – to upgrade facilities, train staff and expand digital programs
- At every level of government, when agencies invest in e-government, they link that investment and possible savings to investing in public access technology (devices and broadband) and in training and partnership for librarians and community technology partners to provide a cohesive support network
- When the FCC negotiates settlements with broadband providers that include financial penalties those funds are directed to increase broadband capacity for community anchors and for underserved households

What are some of our strengths and challenges?

Strengths

- Libraries are well respected
- Libraries are locally funded and community based
- Federal and State funding can pilot and scale innovation
- ALA Washington Office dedicated staff for policy and advocacy
- Increased policy focus by other library organizations
- Users, patrons, community members
- Good body of research and reports on library services, value, especially around digital access and services
- The Edge initiative

Challenges

- Nostalgic views of libraries and library services
- Library organizations and boards are sometimes change averse
- We ask for too little
- We are still trying to do everything
- Uneven staff technology expertise
- Library leaders need to sharpen their advocacy, engagement and planning skills to build case for more funding
- Library funding is uneven; many are underfunded

Approaches

- Long-term comprehensive policy planning
- Streamline library messaging and focus energy in key priority areas
• Push for state broadband policies that connect and support libraries
• Support board training and rotation. Ensure that boards reflect library constituents
• Build collaborative structures across libraries and/or other community anchors and solicit funding to support larger more efficient programs
• Expand lifeline support to include library hotspot lending programs
• Participate in shaping local policies that require access for all
• Develop strong library advocates and champions
• Don’t sacrifice patron privacy
• Repeal – re-invent CIPA
• Support coalition-building – strengthen our voice through alignment with like-minded other organizations and groups
• Launch a national study on the state of library funding models (e.g., municipal or county funding, library district, etc.)
• Advocacy and champion development
• Write libraries into infrastructure build-outs plan – requesting high speed broadband and technology and offering community outreach and training
• Continue to gather the data needed to support advocacy
Appendix C4
Research and Evaluation

Data collection, research and evaluation provides a foundation for understanding changing community needs, metrics on library operations and funding, and data on outcomes and impact. Participants described an environment where robust data collection, including an increased focus on digital measures, support meaningful research that helps us better understand and meet community needs and amplify impact.

What does it look like?

- Libraries and their partners collect a robust suite of metrics that inform operations, investment, strategy and advocacy for all services including those that support digital inclusion and digital readiness.
- Data will be collected “once” and virtualized so that a core dataset can be used locally and at each level of interest – without redundant and/or inconsistent data acquisition efforts.
- Library data collection will be more frequent and consistent, surrounded and supported by tools/apps that enable stakeholders to analyze “big data” and rapidly put it to use.
- Tools and apps help users contextualize library data within the frameworks of community, geography, and applications.
- Harness technology to tell the story of how libraries change lives.

What are some of our strengths and challenges?

Assets/Strengths

- Excellent studies by University of Maryland, University of Washington, IMLS, Pew Research Center, OCLC and others
- Strong national data collection structure through the state data coordinators
- Good historical data
- 45% response rate in last DI survey!
- Strong research on consumer perceptions and e-books

Gaps/Challenges

- Consortial efforts are under reported
- Level of granularity (unit of measure) is uneven
- We tend to be reactive
- Lack of coordination
- Data collection at system – not outlet level lacks community context
- Some data sets include more historical measures of library services and lack consistent measure of libraries online and digital services
- Limited research on impact
- Limited research on libraries and vulnerable populations

Approaches

- Develop a strategy to centralize and coordinate data collection
- Gain buy-in from local leaders on the value of data collection
- Connect the dots among communications and advocacy tools for library community
- Build sustained effort
- Bring in knowledge from outside the library profession
- Make data accessible and interactive
- Consider research to better understand:
  - Civic engagement, education, economic opportunity, government service delivery
  - Unique institutional assets in libraries depending on needs of community
- What is the library's contribution to community change
- What is the role of the library in community
- Library as partners – amplifies what is happening in community
- Return on investment in libraries
Appendix D
Additional Readings and Resources

- Digital Inclusion Survey initiative web page and executive summary of 2013-14 report
- IMLS Building Digital Communities web page
- IMLS Museums, Libraries and 21st Century Skills web page
- Digital Readiness report by John B. Horrigan
- Aspen Institute’s Rising to the Challenge: Re-Envisioning Public Libraries report
- Conclusions & Recommendations for Digital Literacy Programs and Libraries report
- Digital Inclusion KC summit report
- National Telecommunications and Information Administration Broadband Adoption Toolkit
- Department of Education’s Making Skills Everyone’s Business report
- Mozilla Foundation’s framework for Web Literacy
- University of Maryland Re-Envisioning the MLS initiative
- Benton Foundation Digital Divide web page
- Public Library Association’s DigitalLearn.org learning tools
- Digitalliteracy.gov portal of resources
- Edge Benchmarks initiative
- Health Happens in Libraries resources
- KPCC, New LA libraries program turns ‘story time’ into hands-on ‘coder time’
- Huffington Post, Digitizing the World Through the Internet of Things Could Be Worth $11 Trillion By 2025
- Huffington Post, No Tech Solutions for Poverty, Says Former Microsoft Researcher
- Capitol Hill Maker Faire
To learn more about The E’s of Libraries®, please visit http://www.ala.org/advocacy/pp/e.


Id.

Bertot, John Carlo, University of Maryland, Presentation at Digital Inclusion Summit, June 25, 2015, City library outlets have an average of 34.6 public access computers. Suburban outlets have 22.6 computers. Town outlets have 17.3 computers. Rural libraries have only 8.6 computers. The average across all outlets is 17.9.


About the Authors

Larra Clark is deputy director of the ALA Office for Information Technology Policy. She shares responsibilities for overall management of OITP, along with overseeing its telecommunications portfolio and day-to-day administration of the Program on America’s Libraries for the 21st Century, and supporting a range of grant-funded collaborations. She is the co-principal investigator for the Policy Revolution! initiative, a three-year effort funded by the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation to develop and advance national policy priorities for libraries. Larra also is the OITP staff lead supporting the Digital Inclusion Survey managed by the ALA Office for Research & Statistics and serves as a board member for the Schools, Health & Libraries Broadband (SHLB) Coalition. She received her M.S. from the Graduate School of Library and Information Science at the University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign.

Karen Archer Perry is the principal consultant for Clarion Collaborative. She is a recognized expert in the digital information space and a leading innovator for programs that expand information access to diverse and underserved populations. With over ten years of experience in programmatic and policy work aimed at bridging the digital divide, Karen has worked with schools, libraries, government agencies and technology vendors to ensure that internet-enabled services are available to all. As a Senior Program Officer at the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation’s Global Libraries Program, Karen managed broadband, research, and policy grants that have impacted thousands of libraries across the county. Many continue to support library leaders and inform the evolution of public libraries.

Acknowledgements

Larra Clark would like to thank the Institute of Museum and Library Services for its support of the Digital Inclusion Survey, including the After Access convening and this report. She would like to acknowledge and thank all of the participants at the convening who shared their experiences, their vision and their strategies for moving the country forward in relationship to robust digital inclusion for all through libraries and our partners and allies. She would like to recognize Dr. John Carlo Bertot for his longstanding leadership in mapping the landscape of public library technology infrastructure and services through the Public Libraries and the Internet research. Finally, she would like to recognize her colleagues at the ALA who provided meaningful feedback on early drafts of this report; and Karen Archer Perry for her thoughtful collaboration on this project.

Both Larra and Karen also would like to recognize and thank all of our facilitators and participants that shared notes and feedback on earlier drafts. In particular, Ariel Gilbert-Knight’s notes were invaluable and reconstructing highlights from the convening.

© 2015 American Library Association. This work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution License, available at http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/.