



Seeing the Same: A Follow-Up Study on the Portrayals of Disability in Graphic Novels Read by Young Adults

[Robin Moeller](#), Assistant Professor of Library Science, Appalachian State University College of Education, Boone, NC

[Marilyn Irwin](#), Associate Professor, Indiana University School of Library and Information Science, Indianapolis, IN

Abstract

A 2010 study of the portrayal of disabilities in graphic novels selected by librarians as the “Best” revealed that disabilities were present in less than half of the sample, and the majority of those depictions were of negative stereotypes (Irwin and Moeller 2010). This follow-up study looked at a best seller list of graphic novels to answer the following research questions: Do the graphic novels include individuals with disabilities? If disabilities are present, what disabilities were most often featured? What is the gender of the individual(s) with disabilities? Is there a positive portrayal of the person with a disability? Are there differences between the portrayal of disability in a graphic novel from a best seller list and one approved by librarians? Disabilities were present in an overwhelming majority of the twenty-nine graphic novel titles examined in this study; however, the individuals were again primarily portrayed using negative stereotypes. The conclusions are that authors, illustrators, and publishers of graphic novels, whether the works are recommended by librarians or are best sellers, do not provide realistic representations of people with disabilities.

Work Cited in Abstract

Irwin, M., and R. Moeller. 2010. “Seeing Different: Portrayals of Disability in Young Adult Graphic Novels.” *School Library Media Research* 13.
<www.ala.org/aasl/pubsandjournals/slmrb/slmrcontents/volume13/irwin_moeller> (accessed April 12, 2012).

Introduction

Although it has been used widely, the phrase “I know it when I see it” was made famous in 1964 by United States Supreme Court Justice Potter Stewart when he described how he understood that given material was to be considered “pornographic.” Justice Stewart’s self-described test of the nature of provocative material may have been an illustrative example of how subjective

concepts are judged, but his comment also demonstrated the extent to which the visual acts as an affirmation or a challenge to one's individual beliefs.

The power of the visual can be found in library collections in the form of comics and graphic novels. By combining visuals with text to communicate a story or to inform on a nonfiction subject, this popular format for literature holds appeal for children and adults of varying ages and reading abilities. Due to the combination of the visual and textual elements, nonfiction graphic books as well as those of a fictional genre are readily accessible to a large population of readers.

A sizeable portion of this vast population of readers consists of young adults who use the graphic novel collection located within their school library. To help teens choose graphic novels that would likely appeal to them, the Young Adult Library Services Association annually publishes the *Great Graphic Novels for Teens* book list for librarians to consult and, in turn, use to guide teens to potential book choices. However, one issue that youth librarians continue to face is their inability to guide teens to resources if teens are unwilling to engage with librarians about their reading interests. In light of this circumstance, we assume that there is a population of teens who read graphic novels but seek other sources of information for book recommendations. One popular source of recommendations is *The New York Times Graphic Books Best Seller List*. Like other best seller lists published by the *Times*, this book list records which graphic novels and manga have the highest-grossing figures during each week. *The New York Times Graphic Books Best Seller List* differentiates between graphic novels and manga but makes no distinction with regard to the intended age of the readership of these books.

Working from the assumption that some teens are likely to use sources such as *The New York Times Graphic Books Best Seller List* to guide their book choices, we sought to answer the question: How do popular graphic novels consumed by youth reflect disability?

This study is a follow-up to our first look at representations of disability in graphic novels recommended specifically for teens (Irwin and Moeller 2010). In that study the textual and visual elements of thirty graphic novels on the 2008 *Great Graphic Novels for Teens* book list, published by the Young Adult Library Services Association, were analyzed, and disability was found to be represented in less than half of the sample of graphic novels. Of these depictions, the majority were indicative of stereotypical images of individuals with disabilities.

The need for realistic representations of individuals with disabilities in graphic novels is reflected, in part, by the population of students with disabilities in public schools. In the most recent *Annual Report to Congress on the Implementation of the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act*, the U.S. Department of Education reported that in 2003 in the fifty states approximately six million students aged six through twenty-one were served under the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act. Those served were 9.1 percent of the overall population of six- to twenty-one-year-old students in the United States (U.S. Dept. of Education 2007, 28).

Students with disabilities deserve to see realistic depictions of people like themselves reflected in society. Those students without disabilities who can find and read realistic representations of disability are likely to learn more about issues that those with disabilities face in society, and all readers can discover similarities they may not have known they shared with others (Ayala 1999).

Literature Review

In our first study we provided a detailed review of literature related to the empirically studied use of graphic novels in schools and other relevant topics (Irwin and Moeller 2010).

Preferences of Young Readers and Educators' Attitudes

The literature review included Ujiie and Krashen's finding that seventh-grade boys they interviewed, who were eligible for free or reduced-priced lunches and who enjoyed reading comics, tended to enjoy reading in general and read other books in addition to comics (1996).

Worthy, Moorman, and Turner also asked sixth-grade students about their reading preferences and found comics to be one of the most preferred formats for literature. The researchers also discovered that students were likely to get their preferred reading material from sources outside of school due to lack of availability at school (1999).

Norton interviewed elementary-aged students about their interest in *Archie* comics and found the students enjoyed the comic because they felt a sense of ownership toward that particular comic and a desire to discuss it further. The author also discovered, however, that the students' teachers and parents did not consider reading *Archie* to be legitimate literacy practice (2003).

Cary (2004) and McTaggart (2008) ascribe the benefits of using graphic novels in the curriculum to the format's unique method of communicating a story or content in a way that enables, motivates, and challenges readers of all proficiency levels.

In their survey of one hundred sixth-graders and one hundred ninth-graders, Nippold, Duthie, and Larsen found that the most popular reading material with both groups included comics and graphic novels (2005).

Depictions of Disability in Media

Another area of literature that we described in our previous study (Irwin and Moeller 2010) focused on the depictions of disability in media. One pioneering study cited in our previous work identified ten major stereotypes that are commonly used in media to portray people with disabilities. In their report of that study, Biklen and Bogdan described the following stereotypes of individuals with disabilities.

1. "Pitiable and pathetic": Tiny Tim in *A Christmas Carol*
2. "Object of violence": Audrey Hepburn's character who is terrorized as an individual who is blind in the movie "Wait Until Dark"
3. "Sinister and/or evil": Captain Ahab who has one prosthetic leg in *Moby Dick*.
4. "Atmosphere": Individuals who are background characters, such as "blind musicians".
5. "Super Crip": The private detective who used a wheelchair in the television show, "Ironsides".
6. "Laughable": Mr. Magoo, who had a visual impairment.
7. "His/her own worst—and only—enemy": characters who are portrayed as whiners who could succeed if they tried harder.
8. "Burden": Those characters who appear to others as being "helpless" and being in need of care.
9. "Nonsexual": Those who appear "as totally incapable of sexual activity".

10. “Incapable of fully participating in everyday life”: Those who are presented as unable to be included in activities as employees, brothers or sisters, students, etc. (1977, 5–9)

With a specific focus on comics, Weinberg and Santana studied the emotional characteristics of characters with disabilities and found that these characters were either morally good or evil, but never neutral, suggesting that authors and illustrators conveyed “that physical inferiority extends to moral inferiority with the physically deviant being portrayed as morally deviant” (1978, 330).

Byrd and Elliott studied 1,051 feature films to determine whether people with disabilities were included, and, if so, how they were presented. Those researchers found that only 11 percent of the sample included individuals with disabilities and of these characters, the majority portrayed negative stereotypes (1985).

Mellon pointed out that depictions of disability in books for youth can be problematic because authors often focus on the disability rather than the character and emphasize the differences between children rather than the similarities (1989).

Heim suggested specific criteria on which books about characters with cognitive disabilities should be evaluated for quality. Heim then illustrated how these criteria were reflected in a sample of young adult books in which the characters with cognitive disabilities were portrayed as exhibiting a sense of agency, were not ignored by peers and family, and were characterized as unique individuals with their own personalities (1994).

With a focus on the cultural and linguistic characteristics associated with disability, Ayala analyzed fifty-nine picture books and books for intermediate readers; in all these books the main character was identified as having a disability. Ayala found that few books featured non-white characters, few were written in a language other than English, and most failed to focus on the beliefs and practices of the characters’ cultures (1999).

Mills suggested that an author’s ethical norms are reflected in his or her writing. Mills illustrated this belief by examining a sample of children’s books that feature individuals with cognitive impairments; her goal was to assess which truths the authors of these books held. Mills gave examples of how stories have communicated the notion that low intelligence and corrupt moral character go hand-in-hand. She also described the ways in which characters with disabilities are portrayed as inherently good only to suffer later because of their disability. Mills also described how, instead of tackling the implication that human value is suggestive of one’s ability to succeed intellectually, authors often attempt to communicate a sense of equality by portraying a character with a cognitive disability as having more compassion or more talent with tactile objects than does the character’s peers without disabilities. The one positive theme that Mills found in novels for youth was that the young protagonists of stories involving disruption in their home situations often chose to live with a guardian who had a cognitive disability. Mills claimed that this demonstrated the authors’ belief that those individuals with cognitive disabilities are as valuable, if not more, than individuals without disabilities. Mills noted that it is important to understand how disability is portrayed in media for youth because “books for children about mental disability inescapably convey values about how we should respond to difference in intelligence” (2002, 542).

Dyches and Prater conducted a content analysis on thirty-four children's fiction books published between 1999 and 2003; their goal was to determine how characters with developmental disabilities were represented. These authors discovered a positive trend in children's publishing: The depictions of the characters were realistic in that a disability was only one of many character traits described. Of their sample of dynamic characters, Dyches and Prater also noted that the majority were male and many held ethnically diverse backgrounds (2005).

Conversely, Riley suggested that media depictions of individuals with disabilities have changed little since the 1920s and that the negative representation of disability carries with it political and economic costs for those with disabilities living in our society (2005).

Statement of Problem

Based on the initial review of the literature and the results of our previous study, a number of questions emerged about best-selling graphic novels (including manga).

1. Do the graphic novels include individuals with disabilities?
2. If disabilities are present, what disabilities were most often featured?
3. What is the gender of the individual(s) with disabilities?
4. Is there a positive portrayal of the person with a disability?
5. Are there differences between the portrayal of disability in a graphic novel from a best seller list and one approved by librarians?

Methodology

The sample for the study was the thirty books listed on *The New York Times Graphic Books Best Seller List* during the week of the list's first publication, March 5, 2009. The books that comprised the list were designated by the *Times* as hardcover, paperback, or manga. One title appeared twice on the list; *Watchmen* was a bestseller that week in both hardcover and paperback formats. (See **Appendix A** for the list of books in the sample.)

We independently read each of the books three times. During the first reading only the text was considered; during the second reading the focus was on only visual presentations, and finally, text and visuals together were considered. Each of us recorded descriptive notes during the analysis, and only after both had read a book did we compare notes to determine the characters' disabilities (if any) represented in the book and how those characters with disabilities were depicted.

We acknowledge that the mere undertaking of this specific study implies a certain set of ethics inherent in the work. As we were, in part, examining this sample of authors' ethical approaches to presenting disability in graphic novels, we deemed it appropriate to describe our own ethical approach to this study. As Mills noted, we have no more reason to exempt the writer from ordinary moral evaluation in carrying out her professional role than the doctor, the lawyer, the politician, the journalist. The author, like any human being, can be held accountable if she makes the world a worse rather than a better place. And the moral values expressed by a work cannot be separated from its aesthetic quality as a whole; *what* a work says is at least as important in judging its overall aesthetic quality as *how* the work says it. (2002, 532)

As this sample represents the graphic novels that are purchased and read most often in the United States, we expected to find realistic representations of the 54 million Americans who have a disability (U.S. Census Bureau 2010).

To classify a character as having a disability, we relied on the graphic novels to have identified individuals as such. In the interest of trustworthiness, we were unable and unwilling to “diagnose” individual characters without the characters’ being illustrated, described, or referred to by other characters in the story as having a disability. Instances occurred in which we initially disagreed about a character’s disability status; however, these disagreements were discussed until an agreement was reached about the appropriate way to identify the character. Characters considered for analysis were only those who had been shown to have interactions with the main characters or were given a name by the author. Certain books in this sample feature scenes of war and destruction in which several individuals with disabilities are shown, but only in one panel and are given no further attention throughout the books. These incidental characters were not analyzed.

The definitions provided in the Individuals with Disabilities Education Improvement Act of 2004 (IDEA) were used to identify disabilities. The IDEA described the following disabilities: autism, emotional disturbance, hearing impairment including deafness, mental retardation, multiple disabilities, orthopedic impairment, other health impairment (including chronic health problems that adversely effect the student’s learning environment), specific learning disability, speech or language impairment, traumatic brain injury, and visual impairment including blindness (USA 2004).

Although *The New York Times Graphic Books Best Seller List* created a separate category for manga, we considered manga to be a type of graphic novel. Manga differ from other graphic novels in that manga are presented in the traditional Japanese book format of having to be read back to front and from right to left. For the purposes of this study, a work was considered to be a graphic novel if it was a standalone book containing one story or a collection of stories presented in comic format.

Results

Overview

Of the twenty-nine different books in the sample, we agreed that eighteen books include at least one character with a disability. Using the IDEA terms, the disabilities represented are:

- Twenty characters with orthopedic impairments
- Nine characters with other health impairments
- Five characters with emotional disturbance
- Three characters with traumatic brain injury
- Three characters with visual impairments
- Two characters with multiple disabilities
- One character with hearing impairment
- One character with speech impairment

One of the books in the sample included a character that had two of the disabilities found in the list above. Of the forty-four characters, thirty-two were male, eleven were female, and one was of indeterminate gender. The gender, disability representation, and genre (if manga or superhero) for the specific books are presented in **Appendix B**.

Prevalent Stereotypes

Using those stereotypes described by Biklen and Bogdan, we found that the most frequent depiction of disability was that of “atmosphere.” Among those eleven characters representing “atmosphere,” a diverse range of disabilities was exhibited within this mostly male population. Three instances highlighted the characters’ incapacity: in *Tales of the Green Lantern Corps*, a male character who was catatonic; two male characters with their arms in slings, one featured in *The Complete Terry and the Pirates*, and the other in *Naruto, Vol. 41*; and in *Eden: It’s an Endless World!*, one man who was depicted as missing an arm and experiencing a great deal of weakness. The remaining male characters depicted as “atmosphere” included a male character with a hearing aid in *Starman Omnibus*, a group of men who had incurred various injuries in *The Complete Terry and the Pirates*, and one male character in *The Courtyard* who experienced amphetamine psychosis.

Although the majority of those characters who served as “atmosphere” were male, four female characters were also labeled as such. These included two female characters with amnesia, one in *The Complete Terry and the Pirates* and the other in *Superman Family*; in *Batman: The Killing Joke* one female character, who had been shot, lost the use of her legs; in *MPD—Psycho* one woman was depicted as being in a vegetative state.

Of the eight characters in this sample identified as “evil,” only one was female. She was depicted in *The Death of Captain America* as having a broken arm and devising a plan to injure another character. The remaining seven instances in which a character was described by the researchers as “evil” included two portrayals of the character The Joker in the novels *Batman: The Killing Joke* and *Batman RIP*. In both books The Joker is seen as having a behavior disability. *Eerie Archives* featured two “evil” male characters: one, a medical doctor with malevolent intentions, experienced severe arthritis, and the other, a Frankenstein monster who killed others, had brain damage. The other three examples of males depicted as evil were: in *The Death of Captain America*, a character with a robotic body who plots the death of Captain America; in *The Walking Dead*, a sexual predator who has lost an eye; and in *The Courtyard*, a character with a lisp who is involved in unsavory activities.

Watchmen produced three characters that we identified as “pitiable;” two of the characters, one male and one female, suffered from cancer, and another male character, who had psychological issues, was depicted as being physically abused. Two other examples of “pitiable” characters emerged from the sample: in *Eden: It’s an Endless World*, a male character missing an arm wanted to return to work, but could not; and in *The Walking Dead*, a man who was sick was depicted as feeling inadequate because of his illness.

Superman Family portrayed two characters as being “helpless”: one, a female who could not breathe out of water, and the other, a man who developed multiple arms and was unable to participate fully in everyday life as he knew it. A male character in *Beanworld: Wahoo!azuma!* was shown to be incapacitated by a leg injury.

Three characters in this sample were identified as having been “objects of violence.” These included: in *X-Men: Legacy*, a male character who did not have full use of his legs and was physically pushed around by another character; in *Batman: R.I.P.*, a male character who experienced a split personality and was beaten by his enemies; and, in *The Courtyard*, a female character with schizophrenia who was murdered.

Two books depicted characters as “burdens” because of their disabilities: in *The Complete Terry and the Pirates*, a male character with a broken leg had to be carried around by another character; a male character in *Incredible Hercules* became a danger to others when he became blind.

Another of Biklen and Bogdan’s (1977) stereotypes, “laughable,” was observed in two books: *The Complete Terry and the Pirates*, in which a male character lying in a hospital bed became bashful at the idea that he was not as tough as his female colleagues, and *Superman Family*, in which a man developed multiple arms, labeled by his friends as a disability, and acted comically while attempting to use his new appendages to participate in everyday life.

The Complete Terry and the Pirates depicted one female character as a “super cripp” when the character became ill but continued to travel to her destination, despite her illness. A “super cripp” was also found in *The Death of Captain America*; a male character had a metal prosthetic arm that was extremely strong and powerful.

Only one character in this sample was identified as being her “own worst enemy”; this character appeared in *The Complete Terry and the Pirates* as a female who had overdosed on K-rations and was health-impaired.

Five characters were depicted as having disabilities but were found to be featured as inclusive members of their communities. These characters included a physically incapacitated male in *Naruto, Vol. 35*; a man with a broken arm in *Naruto, Vol. 38*; a male character without a hand in *The Walking Dead*; and a blind man and a woman with exposure, both featured in *The Complete Terry and the Pirates*.

Comparison of Manga and Superhero Categories

An analysis of the manga books within the sample showed that five of the ten manga books depicted characters with disabilities: *Eden: It’s an Endless World!*; *Naruto, Vols. 35, 38, and 41*; and *MPD-Psych*. The stereotype of “atmosphere” represented the characters with disabilities in three of the manga books, while one character was depicted as “pitiable.” The two manga books that did not feature characters with disabilities as being stereotypical were *Naruto, Vols. 35 and 38*.

In a similar examination of the fourteen superhero books among those analyzed for this study, eight included characters with disabilities. The portrayals of these characters included five “evil” characters, four that represented “atmosphere,” two characters that became “objects of violence,” and one instance each of characters depicted as “burden,” “helpless,” “laughable,” and “super cripp.”

Conclusions

An analysis of twenty-nine graphic novels found on the first *The New York Times Graphic Books Best Seller List* revealed that individuals with disabilities were present in the overwhelming majority of books in this sample. This finding differs from that of our initial study of graphic novels recommended to teens in that less than half of that sample depicted individuals with disabilities (Irwin and Moeller 2010). The results of both studies are similar, however, with regard to the nature of the portrayals most frequently found, which were negative. The finding of few instances in which characters with disabilities were considered to exemplify no stereotype agrees with those of Weinberg and Santanta, who described characters with physical disabilities as being portrayed in media as being either morally good or evil, but rarely neutral (1978). Interestingly, the majority of the characters in this study were not defined by their disability; rather, the characters' disability was only one aspect of their individual traits. This finding contrasts with that discovered in our initial study, which revealed that characters were defined largely by their disabilities.

As with our initial study, we found both male and female characters with disabilities in this sample of graphic novels. However, the majority of the characters were male, and the female characters with disabilities tended to be portrayed in more passive stereotypes such as “pitiable,” “atmosphere,” “helpless,” and “object of violence.”

Of the four books with positive representations of people with disabilities, two were manga.

Although the number of individuals with disabilities depicted in this sample of graphic novels was larger than that found in our initial study, it is important to note that the stories in this sample of best sellers often dealt with physical combat. Stories of war and combat may be expected to produce several depictions of individuals with disabilities; however, those individuals may be featured only very briefly in the story and be considered casualties of war. Despite our desire to see a larger number, and more diverse and positive representations of disability in graphic novels, readers may dismiss battle-related disabilities as anomalies rather than representations of millions of individuals in society.

Similar to our initial study, the findings of this research suggest that authors, illustrators, and publishers of commercially popular graphic novels have not taken the opportunity to represent people with disabilities in a realistic manner, as commercially popular graphic novels mostly reflected the stereotypical portrayals defined by Biklen and Bogdan (1977).

In this sample of books a significant increase in the number of individuals and type of disabilities portrayed was discovered when compared to those specifically recommended to teens. While this finding is encouraging, the situational contexts and development of the characters fail to reflect the reality of teens with disabilities who read these graphic novels, nor do these books represent the majority of experiences of individuals with disabilities living in our society. This research also extends the discussion of the gendered depictions of disability in popular media.

We could not proffer diagnoses that were not readily evident; thus, we were limited to studying how physical disabilities were portrayed in graphic novels unless the textual narrative specifically stated an individual's cognitive disability. We were also limited in our interpretations of the text and visuals as messages conveyed to young adults, as neither of us is a

young adult. Therefore, further research must be conducted to incorporate the voice of young adults to determine their views about representation of people with disabilities in graphic novels.

Considering the significant population of American public school students who have disabilities, it is perhaps unsurprising that a number of studies have demonstrated the importance of realistic presentations of people with disabilities in materials for youth (Ayala 1999; Dyches and Prater 2005; Heim 1994; Mellon 1989; Mills 2002; Riley 2005). Although the materials analyzed for this study may or may not specifically be marketed toward teens, they are marketed to an audience of adults that includes an even larger population of individuals with disabilities. Aside from the number of individuals and the types of disabilities represented in this sample of books, young adults see in best sellers the same stereotypical representations of disability seen in graphic novels specifically recommended for them. Those young readers who have disabilities, as well as those who do not, need to see themselves and others as valuable, unique, contributing members of society.

Works Cited

- American Library Association. 2008. "Great Graphic Novels for Teens 2008." <www.ala.org/yalsa/booklistsawards> (accessed April 12, 2012).
- Ayala, E. 1999. "'Poor Little Things' and 'Brave Little Souls': The Portrayal of Individuals with Disabilities in Children's Literature." *Reading Research and Instruction* 39 (1), 103–17.
- Biklen, D., and R. Bogdan. 1977. "Media Portrayals of Disabled People: A Study in Stereotypes." *Interracial Books for Children Bulletin* 8 (6–7), 4–9.
- Byrd, E., and T. Elliott. 1985. "Feature Films and Disability: A Descriptive Study." *Rehabilitation Psychology* 30 (1), 47–51.
- Cary, S. 2004. *Going Graphic: Comics at Work in the Multilingual Classroom*. Portsmouth, NH: Heinemann.
- Dyches, T., and M. Prater. 2005. "Characterization of Developmental Disability in Children's Fiction." *Education and Training in Developmental Disabilities* 40 (3), 202–216.
- Heim, A. 1994. "Beyond the Stereotypes: Characters with Mental Disabilities in Children's Books." *School Library Journal* 40 (9), 139–42.
- Irwin, M., and R. Moeller. 2010. "Seeing Different: Portrayals of Disability in Young Adult Graphic Novels." *School Library Media Research* 13. <www.ala.org/aasl/aaslpubsandjournals> (accessed April 12, 2012).
- McTaggart, J. 2008. "Graphic Novels: The Good, the Bad, and the Ugly." In *Teaching Visual Literacy: Using Comic Books, Graphic Novels, Anime, Cartoons, and More to Develop Comprehension and Thinking Skills*, edited by N. Frey and D. Fisher, 27–46. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press.

- Mellon, C. A. 1989. "Exceptionality in Children's Books: Combining Apples and Oranges." *School Library Journal* 35 (14), 46–47.
- Mills, C. 2002. "The Portrayal of Mental Disability in Children's Literature: An Ethical Appraisal." *Horn Book Magazine* 78 (5), 531–42.
- New York Times. 2009. "ArtsBeat: Introducing The New York Times Graphic Books Best Seller Lists." <<http://artsbeat.blogs.nytimes.com>> (accessed March 5, 2009).
- Nippold, M., J. Duthie, and J. Larsen. 2005. "Literacy as a Leisure Activity: Free-Time Preferences of Older Children and Young Adolescents." *Language, Speech, and Hearing Services in Schools* 36 (2), 93–102.
- Norton, B. 2003. "The Motivating Power of Comic Books: Insights from Archie Comic Readers." *Reading Teacher* 57 (2), 140–47.
- Riley, C., III. 2005. *Disability and the Media: Prescriptions for Change*. Lebanon, NH: University Press of New England.
- Ujiiie, J., and S. Krashen. 1996. "Comic Book Reading, Reading Enjoyment, and Pleasure Reading among Middle Class and Chapter I Middle School Students." *Reading Improvement* 33 (1), 51–54.
- U.S. Census Bureau. 2010. "Profile America: Facts for Features: 20th Anniversary of Americans with Disabilities Act: July 26." <www.census.gov/newsroom> (accessed April 12, 2012).
- U.S. Department of Education. 2007. *27th Annual Report to Congress on the Implementation of the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act, 2005, Vol. 1*. <www.ed.gov> (accessed April 12, 2012).
- United States of America. 2004. Individuals with Disabilities Education Improvement Act. 20 U.S.C. §1400 et seq.
- Weinberg, N., and R. Santana. 1978. "Comic Books: Champions of the Disabled Stereotype." *Rehabilitation Literature* 39 (11/12), 327–31.
- Worthy, J., M. Moorman, and M. Turner. 1999. "What Johnny Likes to Read Is Hard to Find in School." *Reading Research Quarterly* 34 (1), 12–27.

Cite This Article

Irwin, Marilyn and Moeller, Robin. 2012. "Seeing the Same: A Follow-Up Study on the Portrayals of Disability in Graphic Novels Read by Young Adults", *School Library Research*. American Library Association. <www.ala.org/aasl/slr/volume15/moeller-irwin>.

Appendix A: Books in Sample Studied

Book	Disability(ies)Presented
Aaron, Jason. 2009. <i>Black Panther: Secret Invasion</i> . New York: Marvel.	none
Barr, Mike, et al. 2009. <i>Tales of the Green Lantern Corps</i> . New York: DC Comics.	multiple disabilities
Bendis, Brian Michael. 2009. <i>The Mighty Avengers Assemble</i> . New York: Marvel.	none
Brubaker, Ed. 2010. <i>The Death of Captain America: The Man Who Bought America, Vol. 3</i> . New York: Marvel.	orthopedic impairment (2); other health impairment
Busiek, Kurt. 2008. <i>Superman: Camelot Falls, Vol. 2: The Weight of the World</i> . New York: DC Comics.	none
Caniff, Milton. 2009. <i>The Complete Terry and the Pirates, Vol. 6: 1945–1946</i> . San Diego: IDW Publishing.	traumatic brain injury; orthopedic impairment (6); other health impairment (3)
Carey, Mike. 2009. <i>X-Men: Legacy—Sins of the Father</i> . New York: Marvel.	orthopedic impairment
Claremont, Chris. 2004. <i>Uncanny X-Men: The New Age, Vol. 1: The End of History</i> . New York: Marvel.	none
Endo, Hiroki. 2009. <i>Eden: It's an Endless World!, Vol. 11</i> . Milwaukie, OR: Dark Horse Manga.	orthopedic impairment (2)
Kirkman, Robert. 2009. <i>The Walking Dead, Book Four: A Continuing Story of Survival Horror</i> . Berkeley, CA: Image Comics.	orthopedic impairment (2); visual impairment
Kishimoto, Masashi. 2009. <i>Naruto, Vol. 34: The Reunion</i> . San Francisco: VIZ Media.	none
Kishimoto, Masashi. 2009. <i>Naruto, Vol 35: The New Two</i> . San Francisco: VIZ Media.	other health impairment
Kishimoto, Masashi. 2009. <i>Naruto, Vol. 36: Cell Number 10</i> . San Francisco: VIZ Media.	none
Kishimoto, Masashi. 2009. <i>Naruto, Vol. 37: Shikamaru's Battle</i> . San Francisco: VIZ Media.	none
Kishimoto, Masashi. 2009. <i>Naruto, Vol. 38: Practice Makes Perfect</i> . San Francisco: VIZ Media.	orthopedic impairment
Kishimoto, Masashi. 2009. <i>Naruto, Vol. 39: On</i>	none

<i>the Move</i> . San Francisco: VIZ Media.	
Kishimoto, Masashi. 2009. <i>Naruto, Vol. 40: The Ultimate Art</i> . San Francisco: VIZ Media.	none
Kishimoto, Masashi. 2009. <i>Naruto, Vol. 41: Jiraiya's Decision</i> . San Francisco: VIZ Media.	orthopedic impairment
Marder, Larry. 2009. <i>Beanworld: Wahoo!azuma!</i> Milwaukie, OR: Dark Horse Books.	orthopedic impairment
Moore, Alan. 1987. <i>Watchmen</i> . New York: DC Comics.	other health impairment (2); emotional disturbance (2)
Moore, Alan. 2009. <i>The Courtyard</i> . Rantoul, IL: Avatar.	emotional disturbance; other health impairment; speech impairment
Moore, Alan, and Brian Bolland. 2008. <i>Batman: The Killing Joke</i> , deluxe ed. New York: DC Comics.	emotional disturbance; orthopedic impairment
Morrison, Grant, and Tony S. Daniel. 2009. <i>Batman R.I.P.</i> , deluxe ed. New York: DC Comics.	emotional disturbance (3)
Otsuka Eiji. 2009. <i>MPD—Psycho, Vol. 8</i> . Milwaukie, OR: Dark Horse Manga.	other health impairment
Pak, Greg, and Fred Van Lente. 2009. <i>The Incredible Hercules: Love and War</i> . New York: Marvel.	visual impairment
Robinson, James. 2009. <i>The Starman Omnibus, Vol. 2</i> . New York: DC Comics.	hearing impairment
Various. 2009. <i>Eerie Archives, Vol. 1</i> . Milwaukie, OR: Dark Horse Comics.	emotional disturbance; traumatic brain injury
Various. 2009. <i>Showcase Presents: Superman Family, Vol. 3</i> . New York: DC Comics.	visual impairment; orthopedic impairment; traumatic brain injury; multiple disabilities
Yost, Christopher. 2009. <i>Secret Invasion: Runaways: Young Avengers</i> . New York: Marvel.	none

Appendix B: Books with Characters with Disabilities, Gender of Characters, Disability Representation, and Genre

Books with Character with Disability	Gender of Person/People with Disability	Representation	Manga/Superhero
Barr, Mike, et al. 2009. <i>Tales of the Green Lantern Corps</i> . New York: DC Comics.	male	atmosphere	superhero
Brubaker, Ed. 2010. <i>The Death of Captain America: The Man Who Bought America, Vol. 3</i> . New York: Marvel.	male female male	super crip evil evil	superhero
Caniff, Milton. 2009. <i>The Complete Terry and the Pirates, Vol. 6, 1945–1946</i> . San Diego: IDW Publishing.	female male female female male male group, gender undetermined male female male	atmosphere burden super crip no stereotype no stereotype atmosphere atmosphere laughable own worst enemy atmosphere	
Carey, Mike. 2009. <i>X-Men: Legacy—Sins of the Father</i> . New York: Marvel.	male	object of violence	superhero
Endo, Hiroki. 2009. <i>Eden: It's an Endless World!, Vol. 11</i> . Milwaukie, OR: Dark Horse Manga.	male male	pitiable atmosphere	manga
Kirkman, Robert. 2009. <i>The Walking Dead, Book Four: A Continuing Story of Survival Horror</i> . Berkeley, CA: Image Comics.	male male male	no stereotype pitiable evil	
Kishimoto, Masashi. 2009. <i>Naruto, Vol. 35: The New Two</i> . San Francisco: VIZ Media.	male	no stereotype	manga
Kishimoto, Masashi. 2009. <i>Naruto, Vol. 38: Practice Makes Perfect</i> . San Francisco: VIZ Media.	male	no stereotype	manga

Kishimoto, Masashi. 2009. <i>Naruto, Vol. 41: Jiraiya's Decision</i> . San Francisco: VIZ Media.	male	atmosphere	manga
Marder, Larry. 2009. <i>Beanworld: Wahoolazuma!</i> Milwaukie, OR: Dark Horse Books.	male	helpless	
Moore, Alan. 1987. <i>Watchmen</i> . New York: DC Comics.	male male female male	pitiabile pitiabile pitiabile nonsexual	
Moore, Alan. 2009. <i>The Courtyard</i> . Rantoul, IL: Avatar.	female male male	object of violence atmosphere evil	
Moore, Alan, and Brian Bolland. 2008. <i>Batman: The Killing Joke</i> , deluxe ed. New York: DC Comics.	male female	evil atmosphere	superhero
Morrison, Grant, and Tony S. Daniel. 2009. <i>Batman R.I.P.</i> , deluxe ed. New York: DC Comics.	male (2) male	evil object of violence	superhero
Otsuka Eiji. 2009. <i>MPD—Psycho, Vol. 8</i> . Milwaukie, OR: Dark Horse Manga.	female	atmosphere	manga
Pak, Greg, and Fred Van Lente. 2009. <i>The Incredible Hercules</i> . New York: Marvel.	male	burden	superhero
Robinson, James 2009. <i>The Starman Omnibus, Vol. 2</i> . New York: DC Comics.	male	atmosphere	superhero
Various. 2009. <i>Eerie Archives, Vol. 1</i> . Milwaukie, OR: Dark Horse Comics.	male male	evil evil	
Various. 2009. <i>Showcase Presents: Superman Family, Vol. 3</i> . New York: DC Comics.	male male female female	laughable helpless atmosphere helpless	superhero



School Library Research (ISSN: 2165-1019) is an official journal of the American Association of School Librarians. It is the successor to *School Library Media Quarterly Online* and *School Library Media Research*. The purpose of *School Library Research* is to promote and publish high quality original research concerning the management, implementation, and evaluation of school library media programs. The journal will also emphasize research on instructional theory, teaching methods, and critical issues relevant to school library media. Visit the [SLR website](#) for more information.



The mission of the American Association of School Librarians is to advocate excellence, facilitate change, and develop leaders in the school library field. Visit the [AASL website](#) for more information.