Seeing Different: Portrayals of Disability in Young Adult Graphic Novels

Marilyn Irwin, Associate Professor, Indiana University School of Library and Information Science, Indianapolis.
Robin Moeller, Visiting Assistant Professor, Indiana University School of Library and Information Science, Indianapolis.

Abstract
As more students with disabilities are included in standard American education classrooms, the need to provide all students with literature that depicts people with disabilities has never been greater. With graphic novels growing in popularity with youth and becoming more apparent in school curriculum, the authors chose to analyze this format to answer the following research questions: Do graphic novels include individuals with disabilities? If disabilities are present, what disabilities were most often featured? What is the gender and ethnicity of the individuals with disabilities? Is there a positive portrayal of the person with a disability? After examining thirty graphic novels recommended for teens, the authors found that less than half of the sample depicted an individual with a disability. Of these, the majority of the portrayals were of negative stereotypical images of disability. The authors concluded that the authors, illustrators, and publishers of graphic novels recommended for teens have not provided a realistic representation of people with disabilities.

Introduction
The 27th Annual Report to Congress on the Implementation of the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act, 2005 (U.S. Department of Education 2007, 28) reported that approximately six million U.S. students aged six to twenty-one were served under the Individuals with Disabilities Education Act in 2003—9.1 percent of all U.S. students in that age range. These numbers have increased in both real numbers and proportion of the total U.S. school-age population almost every year since 1993. Following the current trend of inclusion, most of the students are educated in regular schools along with their peers without disabilities. With that in mind, teaching students without disabilities about the various disabling disorders they might encounter has become necessary.

Much has been written about the role of literature for youth that includes people with disabilities. Ayala (1999) provides four cogent reasons for making the materials available for students:

1. Because of the issues raised, the materials can help children “understand and cope with difficult decisions they must face in an increasingly complex society.”
2. The “relevant, authentic publications” can be used to draw students to reading.
3. The books can portray people with disabilities “who are increasingly reflected in our society.”
4. People with disabilities can be provided with an entertaining reflection of self.
5. One popular reading format for youth today is the graphic novel. Students of varying ability enjoy the dual text and pictorial presentation of stories, and this appears to be particularly true of males. Because of the interest by youth in this format, this study will look at the representation of disabilities found in current graphic novels.

Review of Literature

The recent significant writings about graphic novels have roots in the second-language-education domain but can be applied to general education as well. Ujiie and Krashen (1996) surveyed seventh grade students in one Chapter 1 and one middle-class school, both located in California, to determine if students enjoyed reading comics. Of the 571 students surveyed, 57 percent were eligible for free or reduce-priced lunches. The rest were identified as middle-class. A total of 28 percent of the students surveyed from the Chapter 1 school were identified as Limited English Proficient (LEP) students. The researchers determined that the boys in this population read comics much more often than girls, thus the girls’ responses were eliminated from the study. Ujiie and Krashen found that the boys from both schools who read comics tended to enjoy reading and read other books in addition to comics.

Worthy, Moorman, and Turner (1999) studied the reading preferences of sixth grade students from three Texas middle schools with populations varied by race and socioeconomic levels. The researchers surveyed 419 sixth grade students concerning their reading interests, and additionally interviewed twelve sixth grade teachers and three school librarians working in these schools to determine how the schools fulfilled the students’ reading preferences. Responses from students indicated that they most preferred to read scary stories, comics, magazines that focused on popular culture, sports magazines and books, humorous stories, series books, books about animals, and books and magazines that focused on cars and trucks. The majority of the students indicated that they obtained their preferred reading materials from sources outside of school due to their lack of availability at school. The researchers’ interviews with teachers and librarians confirmed the students’ view that more enjoyable materials are not found in schools, which the researchers suggested may be because of the negative attitude of teachers and librarians toward the educational value of popular materials.

Norton (2003) recognized that the comic Archie proved popular with several children and sought to understand how children’s interest in comics could be applied to the literacy practices of educators. Norton provided questionnaires and interviewed thirty-four elementary school students in Vancouver who had identified themselves as readers of the Archie comic to understand how the comic appealed to students, how these students related to each other in and out of school, and how the students’ comic reading was different from those reading practices recognized as legitimate by school officials. The researcher found that the students’ enjoyment in reading Archie stemmed from their sense of ownership in that comic and their desire to discuss the plot and characters with each other. Norton also found that teachers and parents do not consider comic book reading to be a legitimate literacy practice.
Cary (2004) described how the theoretical disciplines of second language acquisition, brain-based teaching, and progressive literacy each lend themselves to the use of graphic novels in the curriculum. Specifically, Cary illustrated how graphic novels act as authentic materials from which students can understand how language looks and sounds in the real world. Furthermore, the author explained how graphic novels act as visual support for curriculum subjects, engaging material with which students desire to interact, and create opportunities for representational learning opportunities that are more in demand as concrete opportunities are lost with budget cuts.

McTaggert (2008) argued that graphic novels are useful in the curriculum because they “enable the struggling reader, motivate the reluctant one, and challenge the high-level reader” (12). The author explained that graphic novels help struggling readers by providing them with the images they need to decode messages that are communicated via text. McTaggert maintained that by engaging reluctant readers in material in which they are interested, the students will be more likely to choose and enjoy reading. Finally, McTaggert described how graphic novels can be used with higher-level thinking, writing, and reading skills to challenge more advanced students.

**Depictions of Disability in Media**

In response to the growth of disability activism in the 1970s, Biklen and Bogdan (1977) surveyed “a range of classic literature as well as popular contemporary media” (5) to determine how individuals with disabilities are portrayed. They identified ten major stereotypes with examples that are commonly used in the media to portray people with disabilities:

- Pitiable and pathetic: Tiny Tim in *A Christmas Carol*.
- Object of violence: Audrey Hepburn’s character, who is terrorized as an individual who is blind in the movie *Wait Until Dark*.
- Sinister or evil: Captain Ahab, who has one prosthetic leg in *Moby Dick*.
- “Atmosphere”: Individuals who are background characters, such as “blind musicians.”
- “Super Crip”: The private detective who used a wheelchair in the television show *Ironsides*.
- Laughable: Mr. Magoo, who had a visual impairment.
- His or her own worst—and only—enemy: Those who are portrayed as whiners who could succeed if they tried harder.
- Burden: Those who appear to others as “helpless” and being in need of care.
- Nonsexual: Those who appear “as totally incapable of sexual activity.”
- Incapable of fully participating in everyday life: Those who are presented as unable to be included in activities as employees, brothers or sisters, students, etc.

Biklen and Bogdan suggested that this identification of stereotypes in books would bring awareness of disparaging depictions of individuals with disabilities to readers.

Noting how stories presented in the comic format can use visual images to convey personality characteristics, Weinberg and Santana (1978) studied how the emotional characteristics of comic book characters with physical disabilities were depicted. The authors examined forty superhero comic books to determine the characters’ physical conditions, moral stature, and group membership. The researchers identified sixty-three “physically deformed” (328) characters, each of which was found to be morally good or evil, not neutral. With reference to comic books, Weinberg and Santana suggested “that physical inferiority extends to moral inferiority with the
physically deviant being portrayed as morally deviant” (330). Conversely, they suggested that those characters with physical disabilities that possessed special abilities were portrayed in such a way as to explain how a person needed to be exceptional to overcome the perceived barriers of physical disability.

Byrd and Elliott (1985) conducted a study of feature films to determine whether people with disabilities were included and, if so, how that was presented. The authors asked the following research questions:

- What percentage of features films depicted disability?
- Did one disability receive more attention than another?
- Were women or men depicted as having a disability?
- Did film critics evaluate films depicting disability positively or negatively? (48)
- 

Of the 1,051 films they studied, 120 (slightly more than 11 percent) included people with disabilities, with psychiatric disorders being represented most frequently. The authors also found a much larger number of films with negative portrayals of people with disabilities (98) than positive portrayals (22).

In an article advising school librarians on collection development issues of juvenile materials about individuals with disabilities, Mellon (1989) identified problematic depictions of disability in books for youth. The author identified that these depictions stem from the author’s focus on the disability rather than the character. Mellon described how some stories rely on the differences between children with and without disabilities rather than similarities, thereby defining each character by his or her level of ability rather than other characteristics. Mellon also uses the characterizations of “poor little thing” and “brave little soul” (47) to describe those characters who are portrayed as having a disability that is an obstacle they can and do overcome at the end of the story. Here again, Mellon noted, the characters are defined by their disability and how hard they work to defeat it. Mellon advises that:

*The best approach to disability in juvenile books is one in which aspects of the disability are revealed, not as the main focus of the book, but through the unfolding of the story. In this way, characters can be developed as people who happen to be disabled, just as they happen to have red hair, or happen to hate spinach, or happen to be quick-tempered.* (47)

Mellon concluded by stressing the need for authors to portray the similarities as well as the differences in children of various ability levels.

In response to her observations of the depictions of cognitive disabilities in literature for youth, Heim (1994) suggested five criteria on which books should be evaluated for quality:

1. Accuracy of information
2. Lack of stereotypes
3. Literary quality
4. Confronting the disability
5. Not “using” characters with disabilities

Heim further illustrates how these criteria indicated quality youth fiction by describing how a sample of young adult novels depict characters with cognitive disabilities who exhibit a sense of
agency, are not ignored by peers and family, and who are portrayed as unique individuals with their own personalities.

With a focus on the cultural and linguistic characteristics associated with disability, Ayala (1999) analyzed fifty-nine picture books and books for intermediate readers published between 1974 and 1996 that featured a primary character who was identified as possessing a disability. Ayala’s examination of cultural and linguistic characterizations included the language of the book’s text, the ethnicity of the characters with disabilities, and any cultural emphasis communicated in the story. Ayala found that only a small number of the sampled books depicted nonwhite characters and were written in a language other than English, and most “placed little or no emphasis on specific cultural practices” (103). The author argued that if books written for youth are to accurately portray children’s lives, they must portray ethnically diverse children with disabilities.

Mills (2002) claimed that authors’ ethical norms are often communicated in their writing, thus Mills examined those truths held by the authors of a sample of children’s books that feature characters with disabilities. The author gave examples of how stories have communicated the notion that low intelligence and corrupt moral character go hand-in-hand. Mills also described the ways in which characters with disabilities are portrayed as inherently good only to suffer later because of their disability. The author also described how, instead of tackling the implication that human value is suggestive of one’s ability to succeed intellectually, authors often attempt to communicate a sense of equality by portraying a character with a cognitive disability as having more compassion or more talent with tactile objects that the character’s peers without disabilities. The one positive theme that Mills found in novels for youth was that the young protagonists of stories involving disruption in their home situations often chose to live with their guardian who had a cognitive disability. Mills claimed that this demonstrated the authors’ opinion that those individuals with cognitive disabilities are as valuable, if not more, than individuals without disabilities. Mills noted that it is important to understand how disability is portrayed in media for youth because “books for children about mental disability inescapably convey values about how we should respond to difference in intelligence” (542).

Based on the guidelines developed in their 2000 study, Dyches and Prater (2005) conducted a content analysis on thirty-four children’s fiction books published between 1999 and 2003 to determine how characters with developmental disabilities were portrayed and if any related issues were described within the plot. The sample population depicted characters with developmental disabilities as having either autism spectrum disorder or mental retardation; however, the characters’ disability was only one of many character traits. The majority of the characters in this sample were male, and many held ethnically diverse backgrounds. The authors noted that many of the characters were shown as dynamic individuals who acted with agencies, whose primary relationships were with peers, and who were shown to be educated in an inclusive setting. The researchers acknowledged that this study’s results indicated a positive trend concerning the depiction of characters with developmental disabilities compared to a similar study they conducted in 2001. As such, they further encouraged authors to portray characters as complex individuals whose actions have significant consequences for themselves and others, whose role is that of caretaker or protector, and who interact with others within the context of recreational activities.

People with disabilities have often been present in the media; however, Riley (2005) posited that little has changed in the depictions since the 1920s. He found continued presentations of people
with disabilities as “the supercrip, the medical miracle, the object of pity” in newspapers, movies, and other forms of media” (x). He also stated that the negative portrayal:

...translates into economic and political deprivation for people with disabilities, whose status is irreparably harmed by the images projected to the non-disabled world through print and electronic media . . . [illustrated by] horrific unemployment figures for people with disabilities (hovering at a steady 80 percent even before the last recession) together with the dwindling ranks of disability-specific publications and programs. . . . In other words, even as the situation of other minorities continues to improve, the material signs of acceptance of people with disabilities in the workplace and the mainstream are declining. (10)

Statement of Problem
Based on the literature, a number of questions emerged:

1. Do the graphic novels include individuals with disabilities?
2. If disabilities are present, what disabilities were most often featured?
3. What is the gender and ethnicity of the individual(s) with disabilities?
4. Is there a positive portrayal of the person with a disability?

Method
We drew the sample for the study from the sixty graphic novels listed on the Young Adult Library Services Association’s Great Graphic Novels for Teens 2008: “The books, recommended for those ages 12–18, meet the criteria of both good quality literature and appealing reading for teens.”

Thirty graphic novels were used in the study. To select the sample, each of the sixty titles from the list was printed out on an individual strip of paper, randomly drawn, and assigned a number from one to sixty. Since some of the graphic novels are part of a series, only the first chosen from a series was included in the sample. If another graphic novel from a series was drawn, the next in the numerical list was added to reach the total sample of thirty graphic novels (see Appendix A for the list of graphic novels in the sample.)

Both of us read each of the graphic novels independently three times: text only, visual presentations only, and text and visuals together. We took descriptive notes on each graphic novel, and only after one read did we compare notes to determine its representation of disability.

The mere undertaking of this specific study implies a certain set of ethics inherent in our work. As we are, in part, examining this sample of authors’ ethical approaches to presenting disability in graphic novels for youth, we deemed it appropriate to describe our own ethical approach to this study. As Mills (2002) noted:

We have no more reason to exempt the writer from ordinary moral evaluation in carrying out her professional role than the doctor, the lawyer, the politician, the journalist. The author, like any human being, can be held accountable if she makes the world a worse rather than better place. And the moral values expressed by a work cannot be separated
In literature for youth, we would expect to see character representation that reflects the significant population of school-aged children who have disabilities. Not only should the number of characters be representative of the actual population, but the treatment of those characters should reflect the variety of physical characteristics, emotional traits, personalities, family structures, and interests that true children with disabilities embody.

In the interest of trustworthiness, we acknowledged at the beginning of the research process that we were not medical or cognitive diagnosticians and thus could not identify any disability in this graphic novel sample that had not been clearly illustrated, described, or referred to by the stories’ characters. Instances occurred in which we disagreed about a character’s disability status; however, these disagreements were discussed until an agreement was reached as to the appropriate way to identify the character. One example of this type of disagreement was the challenge of deciding how to identify Lex Luthor in *All Star Superman* and the Joker in *Batman: Secrets*. We felt that the two characters appeared to exhibit the same behavior, thus one felt that both characters should be identified as having the same disability. The other argued that there were no graphic or descriptive indicators of disability attached to Lex Luthor’s character, whereas the Joker was depicted as being taken to Arkham Asylum, a fictional psychiatric facility, which implied that he was in need of psychiatric assistance. After discussing this issue, we determined that the Joker could be identified as having a behavior disability, but Lex Luthor could not.

To determine disability, the definitions provided in the Individuals with Disabilities Education Improvement Act (IDEA) of 2004 were used. The disabilities included are autism, emotional disturbance, hearing impairment including “deafness,” “mental retardation,” “multiple disabilities,” “orthopedic impairment,” “other health impairment,” “specific learning disability,” “speech or language impairment,” “traumatic brain injury,” and “visual impairment including blindness.” For the purposes of this study, the researchers considered graphic novels to be a standalone book that contains one story or a collection of stories presented in comic format. Although the researchers included manga in their sample, manga differ from other graphic novels in that they are presented in the traditional Japanese book format of having to be read back to front and from right to left.

**Results**

Of the thirty graphic novels in the sample, we agreed that twelve included at least one character with a disability. Using the IDEA terms, the disabilities represented are:

- Other health impairments (seven characters)
- Visual impairments (three characters)
- Orthopedic impairments (three characters)
- Emotional disturbance (two characters)
- Specific learning disability (one character)

Four of the graphic novels in the sample included two characters with disabilities. Of the sixteen total characters, seven were male, nine were female, and one was of indeterminate gender. The question of each character’s ethnicity could not be answered, mostly because of the varied situational combinations of geographic location, written language, and physical appearances. The
gender, disability representation, and genre as manga or superhero for the specific graphic novels are presented in Appendix B.

Based on the Biklen and Bogdan (1977) stereotypes, the most frequent representation was “pitiable.” The five individuals portrayed in this way included two women with visual impairments in Blue Beetle and To Terra, and a female with emotional disturbance in Emma. The only male represented as pitiable was a child with other health impairment in Death, Jr., and the sex of one character with orthopedic impairments could not be determined.

Three characters were presented as being their own worst enemy: two females in Translucent and one male in Stuck in the Middle. The females had other health impairments and the male had a learning disability. Crossing Midnight and Batman both portrayed males with disabilities as evil, the former with a visual impairment and the other with emotional disturbance. Two graphic novels, The Plain Janes and Blue Beetle, had characters with disabilities; however, they were only depicted as atmosphere. The former was a male in a coma and the latter was a female in a wheelchair. Death, Jr. gave a picture of a male child with a health impairment who was the object of violence.

Three characters were portrayed as inclusive members of their communities. A female with a broken leg in Re-Gifters and a male and female with chronic illness due to exposure to radiation in Town of Evening Calm, Country of Cherry Blossoms were presented as part of everyday life with family and friends.

Of the eleven manga books in the sample, four included characters with disabilities: Town of Evening Calm, Emma, Translucent, and To Terra. In two of the books the representation was of pitiable characters, and one depicted characters who were their own worst enemy. Town of Evening Calm featured the only representation that was not stereotypical. Two superhero books included characters with disabilities; neither portrayal was positive.

Conclusions

Based on the results of this study, it appears that people with disabilities are represented in graphic novels; however, those portrayals most frequently fit a negative stereotypical image. The findings are similar to those in the Weinberg and Santana (1978) study that described “physically deformed” characters as either being morally good or evil, but never neutral. Furthermore, as Mellon (1989) and Dyches and Prater (2005) discussed, the majority of creators of this sample of graphic novels largely defined the characters who had a disability by their disability rather than considering the disability as being only one aspect of their individual traits.

Males and females with disabilities were both present; however, more females were depicted as pitiable and only males were shown as evil. Of the two graphic novels with positive representations of people with disabilities, one was manga.

While the number of graphic novels that include characters with disabilities was larger than anticipated, there were many missed opportunities to incorporate people with disabilities into the stories. For example, many of the graphic novels included images of groups of students in school settings; however, students with physical disabilities were not present—no wheelchairs, crutches, or arms in slings. All were portrayed in the normative image of being fully able bodied. Since many disabilities are hidden (e.g., hearing impairments, learning disabilities), the authors
recognize the difficulty of graphically representing some disabilities in these novels; however, people with disabilities and the range of disabilities included in the sample were not representative of the total population.

The results of this study appear to indicate that graphic novel authors, illustrators, and publishers have not provided a realistic representation of people with disabilities in even the “best” of their work. People with disabilities are most often presented in the stereotypical modes that Biklen and Bogdan described in 1977. Cary (2004) described graphic novels in part as acting as visual supports for curriculum subjects and as sources of representational learning opportunities. Concerning the educational role that graphic novels can play, the importance of accurate and fair representations of individuals with disabilities in this format cannot be stressed enough. Children need to see themselves and others in society represented in learning materials.

Several studies have been conducted on the portrayal of disability in literature for youth; however, absent from this body of research is an analysis of the gendered depictions of disability in youth literature. As was determined in this study, the characterizations of female and male characters differed, which may be the case in other formats of literature for youth.

There are limitations to this study. While the research focused on graphic novels for young adults, we are not members of that age group. The sample of graphic novels used (supposedly the best graphics novels of 2008) was selected by librarians who were also not from the young adult age group, which may have biased the sample. We only analyzed those graphic novels included in the study, excluding others within a series or within the corpus of work related to individual characters. The latter exclusion, for example, meant that we could not include information in the study about the background of Blue Beetle’s Oracle, who is only briefly presented as a female in a wheelchair. In other graphic stories, the character of Oracle has her own prolific storyline, including a rich history involving her alternate personae, Barbara Gordon and Batgirl. Despite the researchers’ knowledge of Oracle’s role as a superhero who provides assistance to others in various graphic stories, there was not enough material about her in Blue Beetle to ascertain the strength of this character. Therefore, further research needs to be conducted to determine the views of young adults about representation of people with disabilities in graphic novels and to broaden the sample beyond the “best” graphic novels.

Studies have demonstrated the importance of realistic presentations of people with disabilities in materials for youth (Ayala 1999; Dyches and Prater 2005; Heim 1994; Mellon 1989; Mills 2002; and Riley 2005). When more than 9 percent of the American student population qualifies for services under the IDEA (U.S. Department of Education, 2007), materials that share honest portrayals of people with disabilities are important to the development of acceptance and understanding of the disability experience by those who have disabilities and those who do not.

Works Cited


*Individuals with Disabilities Education Improvement Act of 2004.* U.S. Code 20, §§1400 et seq.


American Library Association,

Cite This Article


Appendix A. Graphic Novels Included in the Sample

   Disability(ies) Presented: None
   Disability(ies) Presented: None
   Disability(ies) Presented: None
   Disability(ies) Presented: Orthopedic impairment: Broken leg
   Disability(ies) Presented: Visual impairment
   Disability(ies) Presented: Other health impairment: Coma
   Disability(ies) Presented: None
   Disability(ies) Presented: None
   Disability(ies) Presented: Orthopedic impairment: Uses a wheelchair; Visual impairment
   Disability(ies) Presented: None
   Disability(ies) Presented: None
   Disability(ies) Presented: None
   Disability(ies) Presented: None
   Disability(ies) Presented: Emotional disturbance
   Disability(ies) Presented: Other health impairment: Chronic illness due to exposure to radiation
   Disability(ies) Presented: None
  Disability(ies) Presented: None

Mori, K. *Emma, vol. 5*. 2007. CMX.
  Disability(ies) Presented: Emotional disturbance

  Disability(ies) Presented: None

  Disability(ies) Presented: None

  Disability(ies) Presented: Other health impairment: Disappears

  Disability(ies) Presented: None

  Disability(ies) Presented: None

  Disability(ies) Presented: Specific learning disability: Attention deficit hyperactivity disorder

  Disability(ies) Presented: Visual impairment

  Disability(ies) Presented: None

  Disability(ies) Presented: Orthopedic impairment: Paralysis

  Disability(ies) Presented: None

  Disability(ies) Presented: Other health impaired: Connected to tubes; Other health impaired: Twins attached at the head

  Disability(ies) Presented: None

**Appendix B. Representations of People with Disabilities in Sample Graphic Novels**

  Gender: Female
  Representation: Inclusive presentation with natural friendship.

  Gender: Male
  Representation: Evil, maniacal

  Gender: Male
  Representation: Atmosphere

  Gender: Two females
  Representation: Atmosphere; pitiable
  Comic type: Superhero
   Gender: Male
   Representation: Evil, maniacal
   Comic type: Superhero

   Gender: One male and one female
   Representation: Presented as part of everyday life
   Comic type: Manga

Mori, K. *Emma, vol. 5*. 2007. CMX.
   Gender: Female
   Representation: Pitable
   Comic type: Manga

   Gender: Two females
   Representation: Own worst enemy
   Comic type: Manga

   Gender: Male
   Representation: Own worst enemy

   Gender: Female
   Representation: Pitable
   Comic type: Manga

   Gender: Not specific
   Representation: Pitable

   Gender: Two males
   Representation: Pitable; Object of violence

**School Library Research** (ISSN: 2165-1019) is an official journal of the American Association of School Librarians. It is the successor to *School Library Media Quarterly Online* and *School Library Media Research*. The purpose of School Library Research is to promote and publish high quality original research concerning the management, implementation, and evaluation of school library media programs. The journal will also emphasize research on instructional theory, teaching methods, and critical issues relevant to school library media. Visit the [SLR website](http://www.ala.org/aasl/slr) for more information.

The mission of the American Association of School Librarians is to advocate excellence, facilitate change, and develop leaders in the school library field. Visit the [AASL website](http://www.ala.org/aasl) for more information.